PROTEST MUSIC, SOCIETY AND SOCIAL CHANGE

Tania Josephine Martin
DIDACTICA GENERAL Y DIDACTICAS ESPECIFICAS

FACULTAD DE EDUCACIÓN

PROTEST MUSIC, SOCIETY AND SOCIAL CHANGE

TANIA JOSEPHINE MARTIN

Tesis presentada para aspirar al grado de
DOCTORA POR LA UNIVERSIDAD DE ALICANTE

DOCTORADO EN INVESTIGACIÓN EDUCATIVA

Dirigida por

PROFESOR DR. JOSÉ-MARÍA ESTEVE-FAUBEL
Tabla de contenido

Acknowledgements ....................................................................................................................... 9

Capítulo 1. Introducción .............................................................................................................. 11
   Hipótesis ................................................................................................................................. 23

Capítulo 2. Método ..................................................................................................................... 27
   Metodología ........................................................................................................................... 27
   El método ............................................................................................................................... 30
   Diseño del estudio: Como definir la pregunta de investigación. ........................................... 37
   Tabla 1. Cuatro Fases. Siete estudios realizados ................................................................. 38
   Diseño del estudio: Estudio en el entorno de la población. La muestra. .............................. 38
   La metodología adoptada en cada estudio realizado ............................................................ 43
   Primera Fase. Estudios 1.1 y 1.2 (tabla 1) ........................................................................... 43
   Segunda Fase ....................................................................................................................... 44
   Tercer fase ........................................................................................................................... 45
   Cuarta Fase (estudios 4.1 y 4.2· Tabla 1) ............................................................................ 45

Capítulo 3. A preliminary study into what the press said about anti-war protest songs during the
initial stages of the Iraq war ........................................................................................................ 47
   Introduction ........................................................................................................................... 47
   Hypothesis and Objectives ................................................................................................. 48
   Method. Design and Information Sources ............................................................................. 48
   Results .................................................................................................................................... 51
   Graph 1. Number of articles mentioning decline variable .................................................. 51
   Graph 2. Nature of anti Iraq War songs .............................................................................. 52
   Graph 3. Number of articles by newspaper that mention economic factors ...................... 53
   Graph 4. Breakdown of reported indicators which limited anti-war protest music .......... 55
   Graph 5. Total reported indicators which limited anti-war protest music by number of
articles and newspaper. .......................................................................................................... 56
   Graph 6. Reactions to reported indicators which limited anti-war protest music .......... 57
   Discussion and Conclusions ................................................................................................. 57

Capítulo 4. Investigating press coverage of protest songs during the 2003 Iraq War between
2003-2014. .................................................................................................................................. 63
   Introduction ........................................................................................................................... 63
   Theoretical Context and Literature Review ......................................................................... 63
Hypothesis and Objectives ................................................................. 65
Method .............................................................................................. 66
Design ............................................................................................... 66
Information sources .......................................................................... 66
Fieldwork Development .................................................................... 66
Analysis Strategies: .......................................................................... 67
Results ............................................................................................. 68
Thematic framework of the press coverage ..................................... 68
Table 1. The Thematic Framework: Four emergent categories ....... 69
Table 2. Sample of Newspaper headlines related to anti-war protest music during the Iraq War 2003 ................................................................. 70
Visualization of the most frequent words used in the sample newspaper headlines in Table 2 ............................................................................................................. 71
Patterns of Press Coverage ............................................................... 71
The nature and depth of the press coverage ..................................... 72
Graph 1. Breakdown of reported indicators which constrained anti-war protest music ................................................................. 73
Graph 2. Reactions to reported indicators which limited anti-war protest music .............. 74
Discussion ......................................................................................... 75
The perceived decline of protest music .......................................... 75
Table 2. List of protest songs released during the 2003 Iraq War and their rankings in the charts ......................................................................................... 76
Anti-war sentiment is reported to be on the wane ......................... 79
Patterns of press coverage. News and Opinion ............................... 80
Exploring the nature of press coverage .......................................... 82
Conclusions ...................................................................................... 86
Capítulo 5. Protest songs about the Iraq War. An effective trigger for critical reflection? ...... 89
Introduction ....................................................................................... 89
The anti-war song during the 2003 Iraq War: A review of the bibliography ................................................................. 89
Research problem and literature .......................................................... 90
Method ............................................................................................... 91
Results ............................................................................................. 96
Discussion ...................................................................................... 103
Anti-war songs in the 21st Century .................................................. 104
The contested rationale for the Iraq War ............................................ 104
Empathy and compassion for the troops ........................................... 106
The Economic motive for war ............................................................ 107
Inertia. A critical reaction ................................................................. 108
The power of musicians to bring about change: a cynical reaction ........................................... 109
Conclusions .................................................................................. 110

Capítulo 6. Cross-curricular Teaching Going Forward: A View From “Strange Fruit” .......... 111

Introduction .................................................................................. 111
Historical Context ......................................................................... 116
Hypothesis and Objectives ................................................................ 120
Method .......................................................................................... 121
Design and Information Sources .................................................... 121
Fieldwork Development .................................................................. 123
Analysis Strategies ......................................................................... 124
Results .......................................................................................... 124
Discussion ..................................................................................... 130
Strengths and limitations of the study ............................................ 139
Conclusions .................................................................................. 140
Annex ............................................................................................ 141

Capítulo 7. Exploring “Strange Fruit’s” impact from a cross-curricular perspective among a cohort of predominantly Spanish university students. ........................................... 145

Results ....... .................................................................................. 146
Table 1. A sample of quotes from the student responses to the questionnaire ............. 146
Discussion and conclusions ........................................................... 147

Visualization of UA student ideas on the historical context of “Strange Fruit” (word size proportional to word frequency) ................................................................. 148
Visualization of UConn student ideas on the historical context of “Strange Fruit” (word size proportional to word frequency) ................................................................. 148
Visualization of UA student perception of the message of “Strange Fruit” (word size proportional to word frequency) ................................................................. 149
Visualization of UConn student perception of the message of “Strange Fruit” (word size proportional to the word frequency) ................................................................. 149
Visualization of emotions triggered among UA students after listening to “Strange Fruit” and reading the song’s lyrics. (word size proportional to the word frequency) .......... 150
Visualization of emotions triggered among UConn students after listening to “Strange Fruit” and reading the song’s lyrics. (word size proportional to the word frequency) .......... 151
Visualization of thoughts prompted among UA students by listening to “Strange Fruit” and reading the lyrics (word size proportional to word frequency) ........................ 152
Visualization of thoughts prompted among UConn students by listening to “Strange Fruit” and reading the lyrics (word size proportional to word frequency) ........................ 153
Visualization of UA student opinions on the relevance of “Strange Fruit” today (word size proportional to word frequency) ................................................................. 154
Visualization of UConn student opinions on the relevance of “Strange Fruit” today (word size proportional to word frequency) ................................................................. 154

Capítulo 8. Shylock’s “Hath not a Jew eyes?” An effective discussion-trigger for developing civic competence ................................................................. 155

Introduction ........................................................................................................................................ 155
Theoretical context of the study. A review of the literature ........................................................................ 157
Hypothesis and research objectives ........................................................................................................ 160
Method............................................................................................................................................... 161
Design and Information Sources ............................................................................................................ 161
The participants.................................................................................................................................. 162
Analysis Strategies............................................................................................................................... 163
Results .............................................................................................................................................. 163

Visualization of reaction to the use of Shylock’s speech “Hath not a Jew eyes?” ........................................ 166

Discussion ....................................................................................................................................... 167

Emergent themes: ................................................................................................................................ 167
Affect and civic competence .................................................................................................................. 169
Future implementation ............................................................................................................................ 170
Conclusions ....................................................................................................................................... 172

Appendix. ......................................................................................................................................... 173

Capítulo 9. La formación de competencias cívicas utilizando un texto con fuerte contenido de protesta usando el inglés como lengua vehicular del debate .............................. 175

Introducción ..................................................................................................................................... 175
Método............................................................................................................................................. 178
Descripción del contexto y de los participantes .................................................................................... 178
Instrumentos.................................................................................................................................... 178
Procedimiento.................................................................................................................................. 180
Resultados ....................................................................................................................................... 180
Discusión y conclusiones ..................................................................................................................... 181

Visualization of student reactions to the “think-pair-share” method for debating the newspaper articles chosen in the oral sessions .............................................................................. 187

Capítulo 10. Conclusiones generales .................................................................................................... 191

Conclusiones de la fase I – Press coverage of protest songs during the Iraq War (2003) ... 191
Conclusiones de la fase II. Protest songs about the Iraq War. An effective trigger for critical reflection? ................................................................. 194

Conclusiones de la fase III. “Cross-Curricular teaching going forward. A view from “Strange Fruit” ................................................................. 195

Conclusiones de Fase IV .............................................................................................................................................. 195

Reflexiones y conclusiones globales .................................................................................................................. 196

Bibliografía ............................................................................................................................................. 199
Acknowledgements

I have many people to thank in Spain and abroad for their contribution to the work I present in this thesis.

Special mention goes to my thesis director, Dr. José María Esteve-Faubel, for his incredibly astute intellectual guidance and constant moral support and motivation during my PhD pursuit. Through him, I have learned to put into practice the art of critical thinking. To him, I shall always be deeply grateful for his dedication and for what I have been able to achieve.

I would like to extend thanks to many people within the University of Alicante community. First, the director of La Escuela Politécnica, Dr. Andrés Montoyo Guijarro for his support and encouragement during the last couple of years.

In the department of Filología Inglesa, where I lecture part-time, I am grateful to Dr. Miguel Angel Campos, the director of the department, who has always been accommodating and helpful whenever I needed advice. I would also like to thank Dr. José Antonio Álvarez, former department director, and Marian Aleson, former department secretary and current Vicedecana Facultad de Filosofía y Letras Responsabilidad Social y Lingüística e Igualdad, for their support and guidance, especially when I first joined the Department of English Philology at the University of Alicante in 2011.

The computer services department at the University of Alicante has also provided excellent support. I am especially grateful to Juan Francisco Pérez Ortiz from the Soporte y Asistencia a Usuarios unit, who was instrumental in setting up the “Strange Fruit” online questionnaire with the University of Alicante’s online survey software, which greatly simplified the process of conducting the study among students from the University of Connecticut, USA. Thanks to his technical expertise, I was able to have the questionnaire ready before an important deadline.
I would also like to thank Dr. Mary Ellen Junda, Professor of Music, at the University of Connecticut (USA) who was supportive from the outset of my idea to conduct research relating to “Strange Fruit” among her students.

Edward Schumacher-Matos, director of the Edward Murrow Centre at the Fletcher School of Law and Diplomacy, Tufts University, Massachusetts (USA) also deserves a special mention. My friendship with Edward spans more than two decades, and I am very grateful to him for having read and provided some excellent feedback on the chapters relating to the press coverage of Iraq War protest music. As a prize-winning journalist at some the USA’s most prestigious news outlets and an academic at leading universities, his input was greatly valued.

I would also like to thank Dr. Rosa-Pilar Esteve-Faubel for her valuable feedback. I am deeply grateful to my dear friend Marisa Ruiz Salinas, who always listened and provided balance over the years.

Finally, I would like to thank my family for teaching me the importance of life-long learning (before it was a fashionable term!), open mindedness and commitment. I am especially grateful to my loving daughter Lara, who has encouraged me every step of the way in my pursuit of this important achievement.

Este enfoque global y colaborativo de la educación es conocido como Global Citizenship Education (GCED), y en él se abordan contenidos como la paz y los derechos humanos, la interculturalidad, la educación ciudadana, el respeto por la diversidad y la tolerancia, y la inclusividad.

Partiendo de estos principios, la pregunta de investigación planteada es ver si la canción protesta tiene elementos que pueden servir como materia transversal en el ámbito educativo especialmente en la formación de la GCED en alumnos universitarios.

El antecedente del uso de la canción protesta, por ejemplo, para despertar sentimientos hacia movimientos sociales que estaban o están en contra de la guerra y en consecuencia buscar la mejora de los derechos civiles, no es algo novedoso. Los episodios que protagonizó la sociedad americana (USA) contra la guerra de Vietnam se pueden considerar como un hito histórico en la reivindicación de estos –The Civil Rights Movement-, pero en la actualidad, dada la globalidad y la individualización del mundo, como ya se ha señalado, parece ser que la canción tipo protesta, a pesar de su producción y conocimiento por parte de la sociedad, no tiene el mismo vigor ni magnitud que en épocas anteriores.

Esta aparente carencia de vigencia cuando el mensaje que subyace es el mismo
a largo del tiempo, pone de manifiesto una serie de inputs que deben de ser analizados con el fin de comprender y profundizar en los procesos y las complejas interacciones entre este tipo de músicas y la construcción de significados que respondan a los principios de la GCED.

Por este motivo el estudio tiene cuatro fases. La primera ha consistido en hacer un vaciado que relacionara prensa y canción protesta, pues se ha considerado que la prensa en el año 2003 –Guerra de Irak–, todavía actuaba como formadora de opiniones.

En segundo lugar, se abordaron aquellas canciones que respondieran al concepto de canciones antiguerra de Irak y ver si tenían en la población algún efecto de tipo transversal que respondiera a los principios de la GCED.

En tercer lugar, comprobar si una canción mayoritariamente desconocida por los alumnos universitarios Stange Fruit (Meeropol, 1939) que pone de manifiesto y clama contra la violencia racial (Lynching) podría todavía tener vigencia transversalmente en la actualidad en el ámbito educativo universitario, como en la sociedad en general.

En cuarto lugar, se decidió estudiar el impacto de un texto con un alto contenido contra el racismo y la venganza con la finalidad de explorar si la carencia de acompañamiento musical produjera los mismos resultados que los estudios anteriores. El texto fue un extracto conocido como “Hath not a Jew eyes? ”de la obra de Shakesepare, “The Merchant of Venice”.

Global Citizenship Education (GCED), la promoción de educación para una ciudadanía global, representa un compromiso a nivel internacional para abordar temas actuales y globales como pueden ser: medio ambiente y desarrollo sostenible, justicia social, derechos humanos, pobreza y la paz, entre otros.

El concepto de la ciudadanía tiene sus raíces en el mundo griego y romano, aunque a partir del al segunda mitad del siglo 20, el concepto, está mucho más conectado con los derechos individuales y universales contra el poder del estado, cuando el ciudadano percibe comportamientos no democráticos por parte de él.
Un breve recorrido histórico, lleva situar la noción del origen de este GCED en el concepto aristotélico de participación ciudadana cuyo fin natural es la organización social humana. Sin embargo, se considera a Diógenes, siglo IV a. C. quien respondió al concepto de ciudadanía de una manera muy precisa cuando se le preguntó de dónde venía: “Soy ciudadano del mundo [kosmopolitês]” (Laertius, 1853)

Ya en el humanismo, Erasmo de Rotterdam, 1466-1536, se inspiró explícitamente en el Diógenes para abogar por el ideal de una paz mundial, al enfatizar la unidad de la humanidad sobre su división en diferentes estados y pueblos, argumentando que los seres humanos están destinados por la naturaleza a ser sociables y vivir en armonía, es decir, en tolerancia nacional y religiosa y consideró a sus semejantes como sus compatriotas.

Emmanuel Kant, 1724-1804, abogó por una forma de orden jurídico internacional, es decir, una “liga de naciones”. En “Toward Perpetual Peace” (1795) Kant argumenta que la paz verdadera y mundial solo es posible cuando los estados se organizan internamente según los principios “republicanos”, cuando se organizan externamente en una liga voluntaria para mantener la paz, y cuando respetan los derechos humanos no solo de sus ciudadanos sino también de los extranjeros. Sostiene que la liga de estados no debería tener poderes militares coercitivos porque eso violaría la soberanía interna de los estados. A demás Kant, introdujo el concepto de “ley cosmolípita”, sugiriendo una tercera esfera de derecho público, además de la ley constitucional y el derecho internacional, en la que tanto los estados como los individuos tienen derechos, y donde los individuos tienen estos derechos como “ciudadanos de la tierra” en lugar de como ciudadanos de estados particulares.

Si bien, por un lado, la “ley cosmopolita” de Kant protege la soberanía de un estado frente a otros estados, por otro, es una innovación que permite a la comunidad internacional monitorear los asuntos internos de sus miembros. El concepto puede verse como un precursor de la Declaración Universal de Derechos Humanos, compartiendo con ella la idea de que algunos derechos tienen un valor universal incluso si no están protegidos por ninguna institución secular (Archibugi, 1995).
En la actualidad, el 25 de septiembre del 2015, la Asamblea General de las Naciones Unidas adoptó formalmente la Agenda 2030 para el Desarrollo Sostenible. Entre los 17 Objetivos de Desarrollo Sostenible –SDG: Sustainable Development Goals– para erradicar la pobreza y el hambre, proteger el planeta y garantizar la prosperidad para todos, el objetivo del SDG4 es garantizar la educación inclusiva y de calidad para todos y promover el aprendizaje permanente. En el punto SDG 4.7 especifica una educación para la ciudadanía global. Para 2030, se plantea garantizar que todos los futuros ciudadanos, en este caso los alumnos, adquieran los conocimientos y habilidades necesarios para promover el desarrollo sostenible, incluyendo, entre otros, educación para el desarrollo sostenible y estilos de vida sostenibles, derechos humanos, igualdad de género, promoción de una cultura de paz y no violencia, ciudadanía global y apreciación de la diversidad cultural y de la contribución de la cultura al desarrollo sostenible (United Nations, 2018).

En este sentido, en los últimos 5 años, han surgido tres documentos clave para enmarcar las conversaciones entre los Estados miembros de la ONU y los partes interesados en la educación: (1) una sección de la iniciativa 2012 del Secretario General de las Naciones Unidas: “Global Education First Initiative (GEFI): An initiative of the United Nations Secretary-General” –“Priority area three: Foster Global Citizenship”; (2) el documento 2014 de la UNESCO “Global Citizenship Education: Preparing learners for the challenges of the 21st century/Educación para la ciudadanía global: preparar a los alumnos para los desafíos del siglo XXI” y (3) el documento 2015 de la UNESCO “Global Citizenship Education: Topics and Learning Objectives” /Educación para la ciudadanía global: temas y objetivos de aprendizaje. Según VanderDussen Toukan (2017), estos tres documentos juegan un papel importante al señalar un campo emergente, la definición de educación cívica global de manera estratégica y discursiva.

Entre los objetivos del five-year Global Education First Initiative (GEFI), Iniciativa Global de Educación de cinco años (GEFI), enunciada en septiembre del 2012, estaba la educación de calidad, relevante y transformadora en el corazón de las agendas sociales, políticas y de desarrollo. Esta tarea incluyó la educación que fomentó la ciudadanía global. GEFI describió una visión para una educación que aborde varios desafíos y forje sociedades mejores:
“El mundo enfrenta desafíos globales, que requieren soluciones globales. Estos desafíos globales interconectados requieren cambios de gran alcance en la forma en que se piensa y se actúa para la dignidad de los demás seres humanos. La educación debe ser transformadora y traer valores compartidos a la vida. Debe cultivar un cuidado activo para el mundo y para aquellos con quienes lo compartimos... Las soluciones tecnológicas, la regulación política o los instrumentos financieros por sí solos no pueden lograr el desarrollo sostenible. Requiere transformar la forma en que las personas piensan y actúan. La educación debe asumir plenamente su papel central en ayudar a las personas a forjar sociedades más justas, pacíficas, tolerantes e inclusivas. Debe brindar a las personas la comprensión, las habilidades y los valores que necesitan para cooperar en la resolución de los desafíos interconectados del siglo XXI.” (UNESCO, 2016)

En este sentido, Andreotti argumenta que el objetivo de la GCED crítica, al contrario con lo que él mismo denomina como la GCED “suave”, es: “Empower individuals to reflect critically on the legacies and processes of their cultures, to imagine different futures and to take responsibility for decisions and actions” (Andreotti, 2014, p. 29).

La criticidad, en este contexto, no se refiere a la noción de que algo es correcto o incorrecto, parcial o imparcial, verdadero o falso. Debe ser entendida como un intento de comprender los orígenes de las suposiciones y las implicaciones y por este motivo, la alfabetización crítica, no consiste en desvelar la verdad para los alumnos, sino que debe ser un medio que les proporcione el espacio para que reflexionen sobre su contexto y sobre sus suposiciones epistemológicas y ontológicas propias y ajenas: cómo se llega a pensar, a ser, a sentir, a actuar de la manera en que lo que se hace y las implicaciones en los sistemas de creencias en términos locales, globales en relación con el poder, las relaciones sociales y la distribución del trabajo y los recursos. Es decir, la alfabetización crítica se basa en el supuesto estratégico de que todo el conocimiento es parcial e incompleto, construido en los contextos, en las culturas y en las experiencias. Por lo tanto, sólo falta el conocimiento construido en otros contextos, culturas y experiencias. Entonces, se deben comprometer con las propias perspectivas y con otras para aprender
y transformar los puntos de vista, identidades y relaciones personales. Este enfoque alienta a los estudiantes a desafiar los supuestos existentes relacionados con la desigualdad y la injusticia social y está vinculado al aprendizaje transformador.

La literatura científica plantea varios procesos de aprendizaje que tienen como finalidad que la educación sea transformadora siguiendo los principios del GEFI. De hecho, el concepto de aprendizaje transformador fue introducido hace 20 años por Mezirow (1997) como un proceso de cambio que transforma los marcos de referencia. Su teoría define los marcos de referencia “frame of reference” como las estructuras de suposiciones a través de las cuales entendemos nuestras experiencias, que moldean y delimitan selectivamente las expectativas, las percepciones, la cognición y los sentimientos.

“A frame of reference is a “meaning perspective” the structure of assumptions and expectations through which we filter sense impressions. It involves cognitive, affective, and conative dimensions. It selectively shapes and delimits perception, cognition, feelings, and disposition by predisposing our intentions, expectations, and purposes. It provides the context for making meaning within which we choose what and how a sensory experience is to be construed and/or appropriated.”

(Mezirow, 2000, p. 16)

Mezirow argumenta que, dado que la condición humana se puede entender como un esfuerzo continuo de negociar significados disputados ya que es importante que

“adult learning emphasize contextual understanding, critical reflection assumptions, and validating meaning by assessing reasons. The justification for much of what we know and believe, our values and our feelings, depends on the context —biographical, historical, cultural—in which they are embedded. We make meaning with different dimensions of awareness and understanding; in adulthood we may more clearly understand our experience when we know under what conditions an expressed idea is true or justified. In the absence of fixed truths and confronted with often rapid change in circumstances, we cannot fully trust
what we know or believe. Interpretations and opinions that may have worked for us as children often do not as adults.” (Mezirow, 2000, pp. 3-4)

De acuerdo con este punto de vista, las acciones y los comportamientos se cambiarán en función de la perspectiva cambiada (Cranton, 1994, p.730). Varios elementos clave del proceso de aprendizaje transformacional están citados con frecuencia en la literatura. Inicialmente, un dilema de carácter desorientador, o una activación incluso que generalmente expone la discrepancia entre lo que una persona siempre ha asumido que es verdad y lo que acaba de experimentar, escuchar o leer (Cranton, 2002, p. 66) y puede contribuir a una disposición para el cambio (Taylor, 2000, 2017). Cranton (2002, p. 66) describe esto como un “catalizador para la transformación” a “ catalyst for transformation”. Podría ser un evento único o una serie de eventos que ocurren durante un período mucho más largo en un proceso de acumulación de transformación en puntos de vista (Mezirow, 1997, p. 7). Por ejemplo, participar en la resolución de problemas puede desafiar y exponer las discrepancias (Mezirow, 1997; Taylor, 2000, 2017).

Todas estas aportaciones señalan la importancia central de cultivar un proceso de reflexión crítica con ciertos elementos clave (Mezirow, 1991; Sokol & Cranton, 1998).

“Perspective transformation is the process of becoming critically aware of how and why our assumptions have come to constrain the way we perceive, understand, and feel about our world; changing these structures of habitual expectation to make possible a more inclusive, discriminating, and integrating perspective; and, finally, making choices or otherwise acting upon these new understandings” (Mezirow, 1991, p. 167).

La reflexión crítica es “the means by which we work through beliefs and assumptions, assessing their validity in the light of new experiences or knowledge, considering their sources, and examining underlying premises” (Cranton, 2002, p. 65).

Cranton (1994) explica que la teoría del aprendizaje transformador nos lleva a
ver el aprendizaje como un proceso de toma de conciencia de los supuestos propios y la revisión de estos supuestos (página 730), y además si las suposiciones básicas no son desafiadas, el cambio no tendrá lugar (página 739).

Sokol y Cranton (1998, p. 14), además indican que, como aprendices transformadores, cuestionan sus perspectivas, abren nuevas formas de ver su práctica, revisan sus puntos de vista y actúan en base a nuevas perspectivas. Mezirow (1997), en este sentido indica que “...los estudiantes necesitan práctica para reconocer los marcos de referencia y usar su imaginación para redefinir los problemas desde una perspectiva diferente” (p. 10), implicando la necesidad de dedicar el tiempo necesario para la reflexión crítica (Pohland y Bova, 2000), que debe desafiar los supuestos, pues el aprendizaje transformador exige un contexto social de confianza para el diálogo denominado discurso reflexivo (Mezirow, 2000) o discurso crítico (Grabove, 1997). Taylor (2000, 2017) señala que la clave más común en el proceso de aprendizaje transformacional era el contexto de las relaciones. Imel (1998) coincide con la importancia de establecer una comunidad entre los alumnos. Mezirow (1997) sugiere que el educador sirva como facilitador o provocador, con el fin de fomentar la autodirección y el control necesario para el aprendizaje transformador.

Dentro del género de la música de corte político, la música de protesta o la música de la resistencia es una categoría distinta, que abarca “the use of music in politics and as politics” es decir el uso de la música en la política y como política (Damodaran, 2016, p. 2). Cada período de agitación social da origen a canciones que disienten o de descontento. Algunas canciones son creadas específicamente para reuniones o mítines concretos, con el fin de obtener apoyo para una causa o para transmitir una queja, mientras que otros expresan o describen las condiciones en la sociedad que dan lugar al descontento. Las expresiones pueden basarse en el individuo, formar parte de colectivos o comunidades musicales, o formar parte de movimientos políticos organizados (Damodaran, 2016). Según Mondak (1988),

“While scholars have devoted considerable attention to the study of many forms of political expression, understanding of the dynamics of the protest song remains limited. Protest music should be viewed as a form of political
persuasion since one function of many protest songs is the attempt to generate outside support for the critical views they express” (p. 25).

Según Lynskey “protest song describes a song which addresses a political issue in a way which aligns itself with the underdog” (Lynskey, 2010, p. XII).

Desde el periodo medieval ya hay muestras semejantes al concepto de la canción protesta. Por ejemplo, en Inglaterra durante la rebelión de los campesinos de 1381 –The Peasants Revolt- la copla rimada “When Adam delved and Eve span/ Who was then, the gentleman?” - La copla proviene del discurso de un sacerdote radical, John Ball, y se convirtió rápidamente en el grito aglutinante de los campesinos feudales durante esta rebelión que iba contra el poder feudal.

No obstante, la categoría de música protesta, como un verdadero género surgió según Damodaran (2016, p. 2), por una combinación de circunstancias políticas que caracterizaron la primera parte del siglo XX. Algunos ejemplos de movimientos políticos masivos que crearon este tipo de repertorios a lo largo del siglo XX son los siguientes: Las luchas anticoloniales; los movimientos por los derechos civiles; las revoluciones socialistas; los movimientos campesinos y sindicales que se aceleraron a partir de la segunda década del siglo XX; los movimientos nacionalistas en América Latina, Asia y África; el Movimiento por los Derechos Civiles en USA, el movimiento en contra a la guerra de Vietnam, el Movimiento Anti Apartheid en Sud África, el Movimiento Nueva Canción en América Latina:

“The category of protest music, as a consciously conceived musical as well as a political genre, may have come into existence with the combination of political circumstances that characterized the early part of the 20th century. Anti-colonial struggles, movements for civil rights, socialist revolutions, peasant and trade union movements accelerated from the second decade of the 20th century. Nationalist movements in Latin America, Asia, and Africa, the pre- and post-revolution political movements in China and Russia, the Greek Resistance, May 1968, the Civil Rights Movement, Popular Frontism, the Anti-Apartheid Movement, the Nueva Canción
Movement in Latin America are some examples of massive political upheavals and movements that created repertoires of protest music over the course of the 20th century. In most of these cases, protest song movements saw the creation of organizations that would undertake the task of creating the repertoires and organizing musical activity.” (Damodaran, 2016, p. 5)

A fines del Siglo XIX la canción protesta ya empieza a tener cierta importancia sobre todo en USA a raíz de las conocidas canciones sindicalistas, pero se considera que la moderna canción protesta nació con Woodrow Wilson Guthrie –Okemah, Oklahoma, 14 de julio de 1912-Nueva York, 3 de octubre de 1967-, conocido como Woody Guthrie. A finales de los años treinta, este músico folk estadounidense, identificó su producción musical con todo el sufrimiento de todas las gentes a causa de la Gran Depresión – desempleo, pobreza y protestas populares– que golpeó a Estados Unidos tras el colapso del mercado de valores de Wall Street. Su legado trascendió en el tiempo y artísticas como Bob Dylan, Bruce Springsteen o John Mellencamp, entre muchos otros han seguido su estela adaptándose, eso sí, a sus espacios temporales. Woodie Guthrie es conocido como el “…icono de la izquierda estadounidense” (Lynskey, 2010, p. 21).

Las guerras y los conflictos del siglo XX tuvieron su antítesis, en mayor o menor medida, en movimientos sociales que a menudo se unían o se galvanizaban con canciones protesta; la guerra de Vietnam es un ejemplo, pues fue en este periodo de la historia donde este tipo de composiciones adquirieron mayor impacto internacional.

Un resumen histórico ellas, indica que los años de las décadas del 1960 y del 1970 fueron los periodos más prominentes para este tipo de canciones que aglutinaban los movimientos asociados con la lucha de los derechos civiles en USA. Artistas icónicos como Bob Dylan, Pete Seeger, Edwin Starr, y sus canciones; Blowing in the Wind”; Universal Soldier; y “War” fueron emblemáticos del movimiento anti-guerra de Vietnam. Estas canciones tuvieron un enorme impacto social e impregnaron el masivo movimiento social contra la Guerra de Vietnam en todo el mundo; se cantaban en marchas y se presentaban estas canciones a miles en festivales de música como Woodstock 1969.
Según los Billboard Hot 100 hits de Estados Unidos, varias canciones contra la guerra, como “War”, “Eve of destruction”, “Turn, Turn, Turn”, alcanzaron el Nº1. Las 40 mejores (The Top 40) del Reino Unido, dibujaron una imagen similar, aunque el Reino Unido oficialmente no envió tropas a Vietnam, “Eve of Destruction” y “War” alcanzaron el Nº3 del ranking.

En este momento histórico, hay que señalar que, el lograr que las citadas canciones u otras del mismo corte llegaran a los primeros 10 en las listas de singles fue gracias a la cobertura “airplay” de las distintas cadenas radiofónicas que dieron a este tipo de música.

Más recientemente, la 2003 Guerra de Irak produjo un resurgimiento de la música protesta. Por contraste durante la 2003 Guerra de Irak las canciones contra la guerra fueron lanzadas por varios artistas, pero no tuvieron la misma repercusión que durante la Guerra de Vietnam, ni aparecieron en los Billboard Hot 100 de Estados Unidos ni en las Top 40 del Reino Unido. Por ejemplo, ninguna canción contra la guerra alcanzó el número 1 durante la era de Irak en el Billboard Hot 100 de los Estados Unidos (Billboard Music, 2015), con la única excepción de The Black Eyed Peas con “Where is the love” alcanzando el número 1 en el Reino Unido Top 40 (UK Top 40, 13 December 2015). Saber la causa de la falta de arraigo social de las mismas, plantearía un estudio sociológico que se alejaría en parte de la hipótesis de esta tesis, pero cabe apuntar que, tal vez, al inicio de la guerra de Irak en 2003, los artistas todavía dependían en gran parte de la radio para la difusión de sus canciones, ya que, otras alternativas actuales como son YouTube o Spotify no vieron la luz hasta 2005 y 2008 respectivamente, y que este medio, la radio, estaba fuertemente controlado por las grandes cadenas audiovisuales, cuyos ingresos dependen de la publicidad tanto pública como privada y pudieron ejercer algún tipo de censura en este sentido (Garofalo, 2013; Scherzinger & Smith, 2007).

Documentar la proliferación de las canciones protesta, así como su eficacia en general como un vehículo para expresar el disentimiento ha sido objeto de debate desde la década del 1970 por estudiosos como Denisoff (1970), Rodnitzky (1971), Kizer (1983), Mondak (1988), Peddie (2006) y Garofalo (2013), entre otros, teniendo en cuenta que este tipo de música es un producto de un contexto sociocultural concreto, al ser:
“(1) expressions of discontent or dissent which imply or assert a need for a change; (2) may represent the attitudes of one individual or a collection of individuals, such as members of a special interest group; (3) may be adapted by and utilized as ideological statements of a social movement, whether originally written for that purpose or not, and then the original composer no longer dominates as the message source; (4) may inspire the creation of other rhetorical messages; (5) may serve to stimulate thought, reinforce, or modify attitudes” (Kizer, 1983, p. 4).

Es decir, pueden ser útiles de forma transversal en clases de historia, ética, ciencias sociales y no solo en la clase formal de música o de historia de la música. Finalmente, indicar que el binomio GCED y este tipo de canción, es esencial para comprender en su totalidad el estudio presentado
Hipótesis

La hipótesis planteada es que la canción protesta, a pesar de los indicadores que señalan en la actualidad su nula eficacia como un agente para el cambio social, tiene vigencia independientemente de la época en la que se genera y puede ser utilizada con fines educativos dentro de la concepción de GCED.

Esta forma de planteamiento implica que este tipo de música se le considera como un elemento dinámico que puede influir en una estructura simbólica dentro del espacio complejo que conlleva cualquier acción social. En sí, lo que se plantea son las relaciones de naturaleza extra artística que lleva implícita la canción protesta y que siempre ha estado insertos en los diferentes procesos culturales, por ejemplo, en el ya citado The Civil Rights Movement, y en los que es difícil establecer una frontera entre el propio movimiento y la música que los sustenta.

Para dar una respuesta a la hipótesis planteada, se han enunciado cuatro objetivos básicos, que a su vez han dado origen a los siete estudios que conforman la presente investigación.

En primer lugar, conocer el tratamiento periodístico de la canción protesta durante la 2003 Guerra de Irak para analizar la cobertura mediática en la prensa, pues siempre ha sido considerada como formadora de opinión, y cuya hipótesis secundaria es que la cobertura mediática proporcionó alguna idea inicial de lo que sucedió con las canciones protesta contra la citada guerra, y los objetivos derivados de la misma son: i) investigar el contenido y producir un marco temático para lo que constituyó la noticia sobre las canciones protesta durante el período de tiempo de trece años cubierto por el estudio; ii) identificar patrones de cobertura de prensa; y iii) describir la naturaleza y profundidad de la cobertura de la prensa.

En segundo lugar, observar las interacciones y reacciones de un grupo de alumnos universitarios sobre unas canciones protesta como contra a la 2003 Guerra de Irak, por ejemplo, Where is the Love? and Wake Me Up When September Ends. En este
caso la hipótesis secundaria es la canción protesta es un desencadenante para estimular la reflexión crítica y la discusión-debate sobre un tema específico en un aula o grupo.

Sus objetivos son: i) investigar la percepción de la importancia de las canciones contra la guerra en el siglo XXI; ii) extraer los temas emergentes de la interpretación de los participantes de las dos canciones elegidos por ellos; y iii) distinguir los temas que podrían agruparse bajo las categorías de referencia de los nuevos temas que surgieron a través de la discusión en el grupo focal.

En tercer lugar, investigar la reacción del participante al audio de *Strange Fruit* interpretado de Billie Holiday. Canción de un pasado lejano – desde hace 78 años - y que trata sobre la violencia racial. En ella la hipótesis derivada de la investigación principal es que cuando un grupo de jóvenes universitarios escucha música urbana popular, independientemente de si la canción es popular en el momento de escuchar, las letras de la canción facilitan la construcción de conocimiento y el desarrollo de competencias transversales, relacionadas con la letra de música, en un ámbito inter-curricular.

Los objetivos son: i) verificar que luego de que un grupo escucha una canción con fuerte contenido social se desencadena una reacción emocional que puede facilitar el desarrollo de competencias transversales; ii) explorar los tipos de respuestas emocionales producidas en cada uno de los participantes; y iii) saber si al usar canciones socialmente relevantes en un entorno educativo es posible despertar un mayor interés en el tema que se estudia.

Se decidió también investigar la reacción de un grupo de 24 alumnos en España del tercer año del grado en Estudios Ingleses de la Universidad de Alicante sobre el audio de “Strange Fruit” interpretado de Billie Holiday. Su finalidad fue conocer la reacción de este alumnado no inserto en la sociedad estadounidense y observar y comparar el resultado con lo obtenido con el alumnado en los EE UU.
Esta forma de abordaje pretende crear un contexto lo más amplio posible temporalmente con la finalidad de analizar las dinámicas internas puedan inserir en el proceso pedagógico de la Global Citizenship Education (GCED).

En cuarto lugar, se investigó el impacto de un texto extraído de la obra de Shakespeare, en este caso exento del acompañamiento musical “The Merchant of Venice”. Se trata de un texto con un fuerte contenido contra el racismo, y mayormente desconocido por el grupo del estudio. El objetivo de este estudio fue investigar si, la carencia de acompañamiento musical producía los mismos resultados que los estudios anteriores realizados con las canciones, “Where is the Love?” and “Wake me up when September ends”.

Asimismo, se investigó el impacto de este texto “Hath not a Jew Eyes?”, no sólo desde la perspectiva transversal en un grupo de 100 estudiantes universitarios, si no que se buscó observar si la motivación extra que supone textos relacionados con el GCED desarrollaba destrezas orales, es decir, explorar si la discusión sobre el racismo, por ejemplo, lograba una mayor predisposición a usar la lengua inglesa como vía de comunicación.

Así, si se hace una primera aproximación por ejemplo de tipo cronológico, *Strange Fruit*, que responde a un arquetipo de canción protesta que tuvo una gran trascendencia en los procesos históricos de la igualdad entre las personas, y en las que, sin duda, las relaciones entre la música, interpretación y letra, junto con el momento histórico vivido, conformaron un período de gran trascendencia que se ha proyectado incluso en la sociedad actual, tal vez con significados muy variados, pero con un fuerte poder de legitimación, como se demostró por ejemplo en la guerra de Vietnam, pues fue el elemento configurado de las conciencias colectivas bien por distinción o bien por identificación.

Teniendo en cuenta que los paradigmas estéticos y sociales deben considerarse diacrónicamente como realidades sometidas a constantes procesos de transformación, la
pregunta es ver si el contexto estético, ideológico, económico y político de una canción “antigua”, es capaz de promover y ahondar en las causas subyacentes de la canción y comprobar si este hito histórico, *Strange Fruit*, es capaz de ser útil y tener un valor educativo en la actualidad. De mismo modo, *Where is the Love?* and *Wake Me Up When September Ends*, canciones populares urbanas presentes, cuyo análisis, permite conocer la influencia e impacto que esta música tiene en el entorno social actual que nunca antes ha sido estudiado desde esta perspectiva.

Este planteamiento implica considerar la música como componente identitario y como elemento de cohesión social independientemente de la etnicidad, la creencia o el o género, al menos en una cultura de corte occidental que ha sido la población objeto de investigación, todo ello ajustado a los postulados epistemológicos y las propuestas teóricas desarrolladas en el marco teórico y en el aparto metodológico.
Capítulo 2. Método

Metodología

La Metodología se refiere al cómo se realiza la investigación, e implica cómo se descubren los procedimientos y la forma en que se obtiene el conocimiento, lo que implica esbozar los principios que guían las prácticas de la investigación y, por lo tanto, explicar por qué se usan unos métodos determinados.

La metodología implementada en esta tesis doctoral es de corte cualitativo, resultado del tema abordado. Históricamente, este tipo de investigación emergió cuando Blumer (1956) identificó la necesidad, entre otras cuestiones, de analizar la interacción humana respecto de un tema determinado teniendo en cuenta las dinámicas de la vida social interrelacionadas con un contexto concreto.

Hammersley (2003), argumenta que Blumer identificó en su día

“...identifies serious problems with statistical method: a failure to produce generic principles; neglect of the creative character of human interaction; and a mistaken treatment of complex and dynamic features of social life as if they were well-defined variables entering into fixed relationships irrespective of context. He suggests that these problems make statistical method ill-suited for much sociological research.” (p. 115)

Aunque Blumer (1956) señala que el método estadístico puede ser útil en el estudio de aquellas

“...areas of social life and formation that are not mediated by an interpretative process”, [and as a means] “of unearthing stabilized patterns which are not likely to be detected through the direct study of the experience of people” (pp. 689-690),
Claramente lo considera inapropiado para estudiar la mayor parte del comportamiento humano.

En contraste, el valor de la investigación cualitativa estriba en la

“capacidad, no sólo de generar teoría, sino también de fundamentarla en los datos. Tanto la teoría como el análisis de los datos exigen interpretación, pero al menos se trata de una interpretación basada en una indagación que se realiza de manera sistemática.” (A. L. Strauss & Corbin, 2012, p. 17)

Bien, mediante grupos focales o entrevistas semi-estructuradas, por ejemplo, para un determinado tipo de indagación.

En la actualidad es difícil encontrar una definición única de la investigación cualitativa, dado que múltiples disciplinas como la sociología, la psicología, salud pública y la educación, entre otras, la consideran como propia. Sin embargo, posee algunas características comunes en el sentido de que su objetivo es entender y describir, y explicar, unos fenómenos sociales con el fin de comprender como las personas construyen el mundo de su entorno.

Siguiendo a Flick and Blanco (2014, pp. 12-13) y dentro de esta complejidad, hay tres formas básicas de llevar a cabo una investigación cualitativa: i) analizando las experiencias de los individuos o de los grupos; ii) analizando las interacciones e comunicaciones mientras se producen; y iii) analizando documentos (textos, imágenes, películas o música, por ejemplo).

Denzin and Lincoln (2000), ofrecen la siguiente definición genérica de la investigación cualitativa:

“Qualitative research is a situated activity that locates the observer in the world. It consists of a set of interpretative, material practices that make the world visible. These practices transform the world. They turn the world into a series of representations, including filed notes, interviews,
conversations, photographs, recordings and memos to the self. At this level, qualitative research involves an interpretative, naturalistic approach to the world. This means that qualitative researchers study things in their natural settings, attempting to make sense of, or interpret, phenomena in terms of the meanings people bring to them.” (p. 3)

De esta lectura se extrae que el objetivo general de la investigación cualitativa es un “in-depth and interpreted understanding of the social world of research participants by learning about their social and material circumstances, their experiences, perspectives and histories” (Ritchie & Lewis, 2003, p. 3).

Las características y los componentes de la investigación siguiendo a Flick and Blanco (2014, pp. 12-14) son:

a) La adecuación de los métodos y las teorías: el objetivo de la investigación es más descubrir lo nuevo y desarrollar teorías fundamentadas empíricamente que verificar teorías ya conocidas.

b) La perspectiva de los participantes y su diversidad: la investigación cualitativa analiza el conocimiento de los actores sociales y sus prácticas y tiene en cuenta que, en el terreno, los puntos de vista y las prácticas son distintos debido a las diferentes perspectivas subjetivas y a los disímiles conocimientos sociales vinculados con ellas.

c) La reflexividad del investigador y de la investigación: a diferencia de la investigación cuantitativa, la investigación cualitativa toma a la comunicación del investigador con el campo y con sus miembros como una parte explícita de la producción de conocimiento.

d) La variedad de enfoques y métodos en la investigación cualitativa: la investigación cualitativa no está basada en un concepto teórico y metodológico unificado. Varias perspectivas teóricas y sus respectivos métodos caracterizan las discusiones y la práctica de investigación. Esta variedad de distintas aproximaciones es el resultado de diversas líneas de desarrollo, tanto secuencial como paralelo, en la historia de la investigación cualitativa.
Es decir, hay tres componentes básicos que la caracterizan:

a) Los datos, que pueden provenir de fuentes diferentes, tales como entrevistas, observaciones, documentos, registros y películas.

b) Los procedimientos, que los investigadores pueden usar para interpretar y organizar los datos. Entre estos se encuentran: conceptualizar y reducir los datos, elaborar categorías en términos de sus propiedades y dimensiones, y relacionarlos, por medio de una serie de oraciones proposicionales. Al hecho de conceptualizar, reducir, elaborar y relacionar los datos se lo suele denominar codificar, escribir memorandos y diagramar son parte del proceso analítico.

c) Los informes escritos y verbales pueden presentarse como artículos en revistas científicas, en charlas (por ejemplo, en congresos), o como libros. (A. L. Strauss & Corbin, 2012, p. 21)

**El método**

El termino método incluye el conjunto de procedimientos para realizar la investigación, es decir las herramientas, estrategias o técnicas que se utilizan para recolectar los datos y analizarlos. Estas herramientas, por ejemplo y entre otros, pueden ser cuestionarios, encuestas, entrevistas, grupos focales o la observación del participante. Según (Silverman, 2000, pp. 8, 89, 283), los métodos empleados en las investigaciones cualitativas ejemplifican la creencia común de que pueden proveer una más profunda comprensión del fenómeno social que la que podría ser lograda por medio de datos cuantitativos. Esto es uno de los más importantes beneficios de la investigación cualitativa. Este supuesto surge de la afirmación de haber entrado y explorado territorios como los de la experiencia interna, el lenguaje, los significados culturales o las formas de interacción social. La fuerza particular de la investigación cualitativa es su habilidad para centrarse en la práctica real in situ, observando cómo las interacciones son realizadas.

Para Ritchie and Lewis (2003, p. 27), señalan que una de las principales características de este tipo de método es su facilidad para describir y mostrar los fenómenos experimentados para el estudio de la población y destacan que son básicos en el estudio social ya que son capaces de generar ideas y soluciones para el desarrollo y la
revisión práctica, si bien están en constante evolución lo que demuestra su vitalidad a la vez que un hándicap en su aplicación (Rist, 1994; Weiss, 1988).

No obstante, y partiendo de la base que el uso de un método cualitativo concreto usado en esta tesis está fuertemente influenciado por la hipótesis y los objetivos generales y específicos que necesitan ser contestados, los enfoques para la recopilación de datos cualitativos pueden dividirse en dos grupos muy amplios: i) los que se centran en los datos que ocurren de forma natural y, ii) los que generan datos a través de las intervenciones de la investigación, partiendo de la base que estos dos procedimientos no son mutualmente exclusivos.

Estas formas de abordaje, en el primer caso, aquellos que se centran en los datos que ocurren de forma natural, permiten la investigación de fenómenos en su entorno natural y analizan los comportamientos y las interacciones, ya sea actuando, hablando o escribiendo, y necesitan ser entendidos en contextos del mundo real. Esto sería relevante, por ejemplo, en estudios relacionados con la comprensión de una cultura o comunidad particular y con los principios y reglas implícitos, así como explícitos, que la rigen.

Para ello se puede adoptar la fórmula de Observación participante en la que el investigador se une a la población constituyente del estudio o su entorno comunitario para registrar acciones, interacciones o eventos que ocurren. Esto no sólo permite estudiar los fenómenos a medida que surgen, sino que también ofrece al investigador la oportunidad de obtener información adicional a través de experimentar los fenómenos por sí mismo.

Otra forma es la mera Observación que ofrece al investigador la oportunidad de registrar y analizar el comportamiento y las interacciones a medida que ocurren, aunque no como un miembro de la población estudiada. Esto permite que los acontecimientos, las acciones y las experiencias y así sucesivamente, sean vistos a través de los ojos del investigador, a menudo sin ninguna construcción por parte de los implicados. Es un enfoque particularmente útil cuando un estudio se ocupa de investigar un proceso en el que participan varios actores, donde es probable que la comprensión de las comunicaciones no verbales sea importante o donde las consecuencias de los
comportamientos constituyan un punto focal de estudio.

El análisis de documentos, que sería otra manera de investigar permite el estudio de documentos existentes, con el objetivo de entender su contenido sustantivo, o para extraer significados más profundos que pueden ser revelados por su estilo de redacción y cobertura. El análisis documental es útil cuando la historia de los acontecimientos o de las experiencias tiene relevancia, por ejemplo, en los estudios en los que las comunicaciones escritas pueden ser centrales para la investigación.

También en este apartado cabe destacar el análisis del discurso que examina la construcción de textos y de relatos verbales, así como las formas en que se producen (Potter, 1997, p. 196). El análisis puede basarse en una variedad de fuentes diferentes que contienen el discurso incluyendo documentos escritos, discursos, reportes de medios, entrevistas y conversación.

Por último y no por ello menos importante, el análisis de la conversación implica un examen detallado de “hablar en interacción” para determinar cómo se construye y se promulga la conversación. El objetivo es investigar las relaciones sociales, tal como ocurre en los entornos naturales. Se basa en la suposición de que la conversación es un sistema social básico a través del cual se logra y se muestra el orden social y, por lo tanto, su estudio ofrece ideas sobre cómo se gana, sostiene o anula el orden. En parte por esta razón, el análisis de la conversación se ocupa de la organización estructural y secuencial de la conversación, así como de su contenido sustantivo.

En cuanto a los que generan datos a través de las intervenciones de la investigación, es decir que son creados por la propia investigación, cabe señalar en primer lugar que todos ellos requieren un nuevo procesamiento y re-narración de actitudes, creencias, comportamiento u otros fenómenos, y los datos generados dan una idea de las perspectivas e interpretación de los propios participantes sobre sus creencias y sus comportamientos y, lo más importante, la comprensión del significado que ellos les dan. Estos enfoques son necesarios en una variedad de entornos de investigación, en parte porque proporcionan el único medio para comprender ciertos fenómenos psicológicos, tales como motivaciones, creencias, procesos de decisión, y permiten a los participantes
reflexionar sobre los fenómenos sociales y comprenderlos.

Este tipo de intervención necesita como indican Ritchie and Lewis (2003, pp. 66, 67, 68) de unas consideraciones éticas, un consentimiento informado y una garantía de anonimidad y confidencialidad que implica por parte del investigador el proporcionarles información sobre el propósito del estudio, el financiador, quién es el equipo de investigación, cómo va ser utilizado, y qué participación requerirá de ellos, entre muchas otras cuestiones. De entre estos métodos destacan los biográficos que utilizan historias de vida, narraciones y biografías recontadas para comprender los fenómenos estudiados. En ciertos aspectos, éstos son los más naturalistas de los métodos generados, ya que permiten a los participantes un alto grado de libertad para dar forma y ordenar las reconstrucciones a su manera. El término abarca el estudio de una variedad de diferentes tipos de material, tanto escrito como hablado. Los métodos biográficos son eficaces para determinar cómo se puede entender la experiencia de vida y la comprensión de los principales cambios sociales dentro de los contextos culturales contemporáneos.

Entrevistas en profundidad proporcionan una investigación detallada de la perspectiva personal de cada persona, para una comprensión profunda del contexto personal dentro del cual se localiza el fenómeno de investigación y para una cobertura de temas muy detallada. Son la única manera de recolectar datos donde es importante establecer las perspectivas oídas dentro del contexto de la historia personal o la experiencia; y donde los temas delicados o complejos necesitan ser explorados a un nivel detallado, o donde es importante relacionar diferentes asuntos con las circunstancias personales individuales

Otra técnica son las entrevistas individuales cuyo rasgo clave es su capacidad para proporcionar un enfoque sobre el individuo. Proporcionan una oportunidad para una investigación detallada de las perspectivas personales. Debido a la profundidad de enfoque y la oportunidad que ofrecen para la clarificación y la comprensión detallada, son particularmente adecuados para la investigación que requiere una comprensión de fenómenos firmemente arraigados o delicados o respuestas a sistemas complejos, procesos o experiencias.

Las entrevistas emparejadas o tríadas, es otra de las formas de proceder dentro
de este tipo de abordaje. Se trata de entrevistas en profundidad, pero realizadas con dos o tres personas al mismo tiempo. Proporcionan una oportunidad para la profundidad individual de enfoque, pero también permiten a los participantes reflexionar sobre el tema propuesto y hacer comparaciones con lo que escuchan de los demás. Esto puede ser de particular valor cuando se investigan temas en los que el diálogo con otros puede desempeñar un papel importante, o cuando dos o tres personas forman una unidad natural, por ejemplo, compañeros, colegas, amigos, etc.

Grupos focales son utilizados cuando se estima que se puede iluminar la cuestión de la investigación a través de la interacción entre los participantes facilitado por el proceso grupal en sí mismo. La discusión, y la audición de los demás, dan a los participantes más oportunidad de reflexionar y reforzar lo que dicen. Esto puede ser particularmente útil en la investigación actitudinal: explicar o justificar las actitudes puede ser más fácil para las personas cuando escuchan diferentes actitudes, o matices por sí mismos, descritas por otras personas. A partir de esto pueden mejor entender, describir y explicar su propia perspectiva. La interacción entre los participantes también es útil cuando lo que se requiere es pensamiento creativo, o soluciones y estrategias. Los grupos focales también proporcionan un contexto social dentro del cual se experimenta el fenómeno, muestran cómo el contexto puede formar las opiniones de las personas, y finalmente, muestran cómo se generan los datos a través de la conversación con los demás. A través de la conversación que surge en los grupos focales también se puede identificar las diferencias entre los participantes, y esto crea una oportunidad para que las diferencias sean discutidas de forma directa y explícita.

Los grupos de enfoque/grupos focales o las discusiones en grupo, que normalmente están formadas entre cuatro y diez participantes que son encuestados y reunidos en un grupo para discutir el tema de la investigación. Este método proporciona un contexto social para la investigación y, por lo tanto, una oportunidad para explorar, a través de la conversación con otros, cómo las personas piensan y hablan de un tema, cómo sus ideas son moldeadas, generadas o moderadas. Debido a que las discusiones en grupo permiten a los participantes oír a los demás, y proporcionan una oportunidad para la reflexión y el refinamiento que puede profundizar las percepciones de los encuestados sobre sus propias circunstancias, actitudes o comportamiento. También facilitan una
oportunidad para la discusión directa y explícita de las diferentes opiniones en función de lo que emerge a lo largo de la discusión.

Para Ritchie and Lewis (2003)

“… [Focus Groups] give participants more opportunity to refine what they have to say. This can be particularly useful in attitudinal research: explaining or accounting for attitudes is sometimes easier for people when they hear different attitudes, or nuances on their own, described by other people and can better understand, describe and explain their own perspective against this backdrop. The interaction between participants is also useful where what is required is creative thinking, or solutions and strategies. Focus groups also provide a social context within which the phenomenon is experienced, and they display the way in which context can shape people’s views, showing how data are generated through conversation with others. This context also means that they vividly display differences between participants, and create an opportunity for differences to be directly and explicitly discussed.” (p. 58)

Finalmente, la encuesta cualitativa, término acuñado de Jansen (2010) y donde se realizan unas encuestas de tipo cuantitativo, que no miden exactamente las interacciones sociales o las comunicaciones entre personas o instituciones en una población dada, sino solamente tiene como objetivo principal describir las distribuciones numéricas de las variables, es decir, las tasas de prevalencia en la población del tema investigado:

- Este tipo de encuesta cualitativa busca determinar la diversidad de algún tema de interés dentro de una población determinada.

- Este tipo de encuesta no cuenta el número de personas con la misma característica, valor de la variable, sino que establece la variación significativa, dimensiones y valores relevantes, dentro de esa población. Por lo tanto, su estudio responde a conocer la diversidad, no la distribución en
una población. Lo que destaca Jansen (2010) es que el término encuesta cualitativa y/o la encuesta de diversidad alternativa, es casi inexistente tanto en los libros de texto sobre la metodología de investigación social general y en los libros de textos sobre los métodos de la investigación cualitativa. Jansen (2010, pp. 2, art. 11) propone una definición más formal de la encuesta cualitativa que incluye “...all studies of diversity in a population without restrictions as to the number of empirical cycles or the way of generating codes: data-driven, prior-research-driven or theory-driven.”

Consecuentemente, la elección del método a utilizar está siempre condicionado por la pregunta de la investigación y los objetivos del estudio que responden a esa pregunta. También hay que tener en cuenta los factores limitantes como el tiempo y los recursos económicos disponibles. Por ejemplo, si los recursos tanto de tiempo y económicos permiten, los grupos focales podrían ser utilizados como una etapa inicial para plantear y comenzar a explorar temas relevantes que luego serán llevados adelante a través de entrevistas en profundidad.

Al contrario, se puede utilizar grupos focales después de entrevistas en profundidad para discutir los temas que han surgido a un nivel más estratégico y enfocado. En todas las decisiones sobre que método adoptar, hay que considerar los objetivos del estudio y el tipo de dato necesario para satisfacerlos. También, según Ritchie and Lewis (2003) en el método influye la orientación epistemológica del investigador y sus propios puntos de vista sobre la integridad de los diferentes métodos de investigación con los fenómenos principales que son el objeto de estudio, es decir, el tipo de datos buscados, el área temática, y la naturaleza del grupo de estudio.
Diseño del estudio: Como definir la pregunta de investigación.

Diseñar eficazmente un estudio de investigación cualitativa implica tener un objetivo claramente definido, en el cual hay una coherencia entre las preguntas de investigación y los métodos propuestos, y que genera datos que son válidos y confiables. Según Maxwell (2005), el diseño del estudio tiene que ser flexible porque podría ser necesario realizar algunas modificaciones a la hora de interactuar en el contexto de la investigación. La investigación cualitativa siempre implicará un elemento de lo desconocido porque no se trata de duplicar lo que está ya establecido (Pole & Lampard, 2002). Además, unas de las fortalezas clave de la investigación cualitativa es que puede explorar cuestiones imprevistas a medida que surgen durante la investigación. El diseño en la investigación cualitativa no es una etapa definida que se concluye a principios de un estudio, al contrario, es un proceso continuo que requiere una revisión constante de las decisiones y enfoques.

Partiendo de una idea o tema inicial y a medida que el proceso avanza, esta idea primaria comienza a ser enmarcada con preguntas más específicas (Marshall & Rossman, 1999). Es decir, no se puede emplear a priori el modelo deductivo de una hipótesis (Layder, 1993) que debe ser certificada a través de la recopilación de datos. Pero una comprensión de cómo el estudio puede ser construido en función del conocimiento existente puede facilitar el diseño del estudio, sin que ello implique una posición teórica fija (Hammersley & Atkinson, 2007), teniendo en cuenta que la lógica subyacente es inductiva y no deductiva (Gibbs, 2012, p. 23), ya que la pregunta de investigación en un estudio cualitativo identifica los fenómenos que se va a estudiar y “favorece un enfoque en el que las teorías y los conceptos se desarrollan conjuntamente en la recogida de los datos para producir y justificar nuevas generalizaciones, y crear así nuevos conocimientos y formas de comprensión.” (Gibbs, 2012, p. 24)

Por este motivo, en la presente tesis, se han realizado siete estudios de tipo cualitativo desde distintas perspectivas, pero que abordan el tema común de la música protesta, y un texto cultural sin acompañamiento musical para investigar si, la carencia de la música producía los mismos resultados que los estudios anteriores. Esta forma de abordaje pretende crear un contexto lo más amplio posible temporalmente con la finalidad
de analizar las dinámicas internas puedan inserir en el proceso pedagógico de la Global Citizenship Education (GCED).

### Tabla 1. Cuatro Fases. Siete estudios realizados

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Título del estudio cualitativo</th>
<th>Pregunta inicial de investigación</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1 A preliminary study into what the press said about anti-war protest songs during the initial stages of the Iraq War</td>
<td>¿Qué fue el tratamiento periodístico de la canción de protesta anti-guerra durante los inicios de la Guerra de Irak?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2. Investigating press coverage of protest songs during the Iraq War between 2003-2014</td>
<td>¿Qué fue el tratamiento periodístico de la canción de protesta anti-guerra durante los inicios de la Guerra de Irak?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Protest songs about the Iraq War. An effective trigger for critical reflection?</td>
<td>¿Qué es la importancia y el valor que una cohorte de estudiantes universitarios atribuye a las canciones de protesta que abordan la Guerra de 2003-2014?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1. Cross-curricular Teaching Going Forward: A View From “Strange Fruit”</td>
<td>¿Qué es el impacto sonico de una canción con contenido social fuerte como “Strange Fruit” en un grupo de estudiantes universitarios de una universidad pública de investigación?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2. Exploring “Strange Fruit’s” sonic impact from a cross curricular perspective among a cohort of predominantly Spanish university students</td>
<td>¿Qué es el impacto sonico de una canción con contenido social fuerte como “Strange Fruit” en un grupo de estudiantes universitarios de una universidad pública de investigación?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1. Shylock’s “Hath not a Jew eyes?” An effective discussion-trigger for developing civic competence</td>
<td>¿Do non-sonic texts with strong protest content help to engage students and enhance their Global Citizenship Education (GCED) by developing debate-discussion skills, albeit it in a foreign language context?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2. La formación de competencias cívicas utilizando un texto de fuerte protesta y el inglés como lengua vehicular</td>
<td>Comprobar, si al fomentar las competencias transversales en debates, éstos logran involucrar a los estudiantes de inglés como lengua extranjera (EFL) en el desarrollo de sus habilidades lingüísticas y discusión en el contexto de temas actuales que al mismo tiempo desarrollen la competencia cívica</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Diseño del estudio: Estudio en el entorno de la población. La muestra.**

Una vez establecida la pregunta de la investigación y el contexto de la investigación, se elige tanto el entorno y la población que sea lo más relevante y que
puede proporcionar la más comprensiva respuesta a las preguntas de la investigación, teniendo en cuenta, el papel de las comparaciones en la investigación, y el estudio de casos que permiten el desarrollo de un conocimiento profundo y detallado sobre el tema elegido: la música protesta.

Bechhofer and Paterson (2000) consideran que la comparación y el control son requisitos para un buen diseño de la investigación, ya sea cualitativa o cuantitativa, pero mientras las comparaciones en investigaciones cuantitativas miden diferencias, en la investigación cualitativa la naturaleza de la comparación es entender y conocer más el tema del estudio:

“Designing a piece of empirical research requires the researcher to decide on the best ways of collecting data in research locales which will permit meaningful and insightful comparisons. At the same time, the research design must achieve the control which gives some degree of certainty that the explanations offered are indeed superior to competing explanations ... The need to achieve control applies as much to the most natural and participatory fieldwork situations as to experimental ones” (p. 2).

Se pueden hacer comparaciones entre los grupos en torno a los que se estructuró el diseño de la muestra, o pueden estar entre los grupos que emergen inductivamente del proceso analítico, y Ritchie and Lewis (2003, pp. 50-51) viene a señalar que puede contribuir a identificar la ausencia o presencia de fenómenos particulares en los relatos de los diferentes grupos; a explorar cómo las manifestaciones de los fenómenos varían entre los grupos; a averiguar cómo las razones o las explicaciones de los fenómenos o sus diferentes impactos y consecuencias varían entre los grupos; a indagar la interacción entre los fenómenos en diferentes contextos; y, a buscar más ampliamente las diferencias en los contextos en los que surgen los fenómenos, o diferencias en la experiencia de la investigación.

Por todo lo señalado, se deduce que se está frente una muestra no probabilística, donde las unidades se seleccionan deliberadamente para reflejar características particulares o grupos dentro de la población muestreada. La muestra no pretende ser
Las unidades del estudio se eligen "deliberadamente" por sus capacidades de proporcionar una comprensión detallada del tema objeto de estudio. Estas muestras de propósito o intencionales están diseñadas para ser lo más diversas posibles, incluyendo todos los grupos y grupos clave, y las unidades se seleccionan sobre la base de la "representación simbólica" porque poseen una característica que se sabe o se espera que sea relevante para el estudio de investigación. El muestreo teórico es un tipo particular de muestreo intencional en el que las unidades se seleccionan sobre la base de su contribución potencial al desarrollo de la teoría.

El desarrollo de una muestra intencional implica la definición y priorización de criterios de selección deliberados, el diseño de una matriz de muestra en la que se mapea los criterios y el número de participantes buscados y el establecimiento de cuotas para la selección. El muestreo para los grupos focales implica además especificar la composición de cada grupo, teniendo en cuenta que la muestra no necesita ser grande para respaldar la prevalencia o la incidencia, pero hay que tener en cuenta que su pequeña escala sólo funciona si se ha realizado un buen muestreo intencional o teórico.

Sea lo que sea el método utilizado en la investigación cualitativa al final siempre hay que analizar los datos en los textos, donde la codificación es el proceso analítico para identificar los conceptos y descubrir en los datos sus propiedades y dimensiones.

Esta codificación, siguiendo a A. L. Strauss and Corbin (2012) está formada por Fenómenos: que responden a ideas centrales en los datos; Conceptos: que son la base de la teoría; Categorías que representan fenómenos; Propiedades: características de una categoría, cuya delineación la define y le da significado; Dimensiones: escala en la cual varían las propiedades generales de una categoría, y que le da especificaciones a la categoría y variaciones a la teoría. Subcategorías: conceptos que pertenecen a una categoría, que le dan claridad adicional y especificidad.
Sin embargo, Ritchie and Lewis (2003, p. 177), prefiere en este proceso utilizar el término indexación en lugar de codificación, porque cuando se aplica un índice, según su argumentación, simplemente muestra a qué tema o concepto se refiere en una sección particular de los datos, y según Gibbs (2012, p. 75), la codificación implica identificar y registrar uno o más bloques de texto u otros datos que ejemplifiquen las misma idea teórica o descriptiva. Se identifican lo pasajes y se los vincula con un nombre para la idea que representan, que es el código.

Este proceso es importante porque se puede establecer un marco de ideas temáticas sobre el texto a través las categorías que han emergido. Es decir, llevar de forma correcta este proceso es importante porque “una teoría fundamentada en los datos debe ser reconocible para los participantes, y aunque no encaje con cada detalle de sus casos, los conceptos más amplios sí deben poderse aplicar.” A. L. Strauss, Corbin, and Zimmerman (1996, p. 177)

Todo este proceso de codificación que ha sido llevado a cabo en los tres tópicos de la presente tesis doctoral, tiene como base y siguiendo a Gibbs (2012, p. 75) el lograr la recuperación ordenada de secciones de texto relacionados temáticamente, pues con ello se facilita la gestión y la organización conceptual o temática de los datos al poderse recuperar el texto codificado con una misma etiqueta permitiendo combinar pasajes que sean un ejemplo del mismo fenómeno, idea, explicación etc., pudiéndose reunir todo el texto codificado de la misma manera y revisarlo para ver que hay un núcleo de código.

También se puede examinar cómo cambia una idea temática codificada en un caso o cómo le afectan otros factores y explicar por qué las ideas temáticas representadas por los códigos varían de un caso a otro, de un entorno a otro. Esto obliga a evitar el uso de códigos exclusivamente descriptivos y a desarrollar códigos que facilitan la indexación o la categorización del texto para establecer un marco de ideas o conceptos temáticos.

Para llegar a este tipo de sistematización hay que realizar una lectura profunda del texto, entenderlo, y en función de ello decidir que códigos representan desde un punto de vista teórico y analítico. Esta parte de la investigación cualitativa es quizás lo más difícil y es aconsejable, según Patton (1990, p. 371) utilizar la técnica de triangulación de
investigadores para llegar a un consenso en los códigos, como se ha desarrollado en la presente tesis, con el fin de evitar el sesgo que hay si los datos son codificados por un solo investigador, y además también hay que tener en cuenta que los códigos iniciales con lo que se construye la investigación inicial, variarán en el transcurrir del proceso analítico de codificación de datos (Gibbs, 2012, pp. 71-72).

Se puede partir para la primera codificación de una lista previa de conceptos temáticos basada en las propias visiones del investigador. Esta elaboración anterior a la propia codificación del texto, funciona como un marco o “plantilla”, y a posteriori, la propia codificación, que ya implica la identificación de los conceptos predeterminados en los textos que se analiza. Es evidente que la lista inicial va ser modificada durante el análisis de texto en función de que surjan nuevas ideas o conceptos que no están reflejados en los códigos incluidos en la lista previa.

No obstante, la técnica de codificación por datos o codificación abierta, se inicia sin ningún tipo de lista previa de conceptos temáticos y una vez extraídos y triangulados se elabora una teoría fundamentada (Glaser & Strauss, 1974; A. L. Strauss et al., 1996).

Una vez realizado este proceso, en una primera instancia la investigación cualitativa pone de manifiesto aquello que pasa, es decir, da una simplemente descripción de lo que se ha encontrado en la investigación, y es en ese momento cuando se inicia la búsqueda de patrones, a establecer comparaciones, a producir explicaciones, y a construir modelos (Gibbs, 2012, p. 109), como los que se pueden observar por ejemplo en las categorías acordadas entre la presente tesis (Vid. tablas 4 y 5 en los resultados del capítulo 5. “Protest songs about the Iraq War. An effective trigger for critical reflection?” y la tabla 1 en los resultados del capítulo 4, “Investigating press coverage of protest songs during the 2003 Iraq War between 2003-2014”.

La tabla 1, anteriormente mencionado, representa las 4 categorías que han surgido de la codificación de los artículos periodísticos que han sido analizados con sus subgrupos es decir sus respectivos códigos. Se han mencionado los porcentajes de cobertura por cada código para dar una idea de la frecuencia del tema en la cobertura de la prensa analizada.
Las tablas 4 y 5 presentan los ejemplos respuesta a las preguntas abiertas que se ha planteado durante el grupo focal y se categorizan en función de las categorías analíticas de: “benchmark” (Punto de referencia); “affective” (Afectivo); “adjacent” (adyacente).

La metodología adoptada en cada estudio realizado

El estudio realizado, como ya se ha indicado gira en torno de cuatro fases que ha resultado en 7 estudios cuyo tema principal es el uso de la canción protesta y, el uso de un texto controvertido para ver si, como anterior mencionado, la carencia de acompañamiento musical producía los mismos resultados que los estudios anteriores.

Primera Fase. Estudios 1.1 y 1.2 (tabla 1)

En la primera fase (1.1 A preliminary study into what the press said about anti-war protest songs during the initial stages of the Iraq war 2003 y 2.2 Investigating press coverage of protest songs during the 2003 Iraq War between 2003-2014) se ha llevado a cabo un análisis del contenido de textos, en este caso artículos de prensa. La decisión de analizar la cobertura de prensa de canciones antiguerra, en línea con Krippendorff (1989), se basa en la consideración de que los medios de comunicación son una fuente importante de datos para el análisis de contenido y,

“Probably the most widespread use of content analysis is to infer the importance writers, producers, media or even whole cultures assign to particular subject-matter categories from the frequency or volumes with which that subject matter is mentioned. Early examples are analyses of how the attention by newspapers to particular news categories has changed overtime…” (p. 404).

La difusión de noticias en tiempo real se ha convertido en práctica estándar en el siglo XXI. La Guerra de Irak fue un hito en este sentido. No obstante, la prensa internacional como The Guardian, Telegraph, Wall Street Journal, New York Times y Chicago Tribune, siguieron aportando otro tipo de visión del conflicto que ha sido el resultado de este estudio de análisis de contenido. El objetivo de este estudio fue conocer
el tratamiento periodístico de la canción protesta durante la 2003 Guerra de Irak. Entonces esto fue un estudio de datos que ocurren de forma natural en documentos, que en este contexto fueron artículos en periódicos considerados como opinion formers del USA y del UK. Todos los detalles sobre la metodología incluyendo las fuentes de información, cómo se ha elegido los periódicos; las combinaciones de palabras claves de la búsqueda; trabajo de campo; y estrategias de análisis están desarrollados en la sección método del estudio (vid. Capítulo 3, Method, Design and Information Sources, y Capítulo 4, Method)

Segunda Fase

En el segundo estudio, Protest songs about the Iraq War. An effective trigger for critical reflection?, se planteó como un análisis de las interacciones y comunicaciones observadas de 3 grupos distintos sobre dos canciones conocidas por los participantes – Where is the Love? and Wake Me Up When September Ends- que de una forma u otra trataban de forma negativa el tema de la Guerra de Irak del año 2003. Se adoptó la técnica de entrevista semiestructurada en tres grupos focales. La investigación cualitativa a través de grupos de enfoque estructurados logró que las particularidades sobre el tema tratado emergieran y por eso, a parte de los “Benchmark Categories” es decir, las Categorías de referencia deducción del análisis de las canciones por los tres investigadores conjuntamente, los resultados incluyen también categorías adyacentes que incluían temas relevantes, aunque no estaban específicamente vinculados a la letra o al video, y categorías afectivas, que incluyeron temas que eran expresiones de sentimiento u opinión que se permitió que surgieran durante la discusión del grupo focal. Se contactaron 50 alumnos de la Universidad de Alicante de entre 19-21 años y se utilizó la técnica de “Snowball sampling” porque se buscaba discentes nativos del idioma inglés o que tenían un mínimo C1 nivel de inglés con el fin de que entendieran las letras de las canciones propuestas. Uno de los tres grupos fue utilizado como grupo de control en el sentido de que no tenía ninguna preferencia sobre las dos canciones elegidas. Por más detalles sobre la metodología, incluyendo las fuentes de información, cómo se ha elegido las canciones en la lista, el trabajo de campo, la preguntas que se realizó; y estrategias de análisis se puede consultar la sección método del estudio (vid. Capítulo 5, Method).
Tercer fase

En referencia al tercer estudio, *Cross-curricular Teaching Going Forward: A View From “Strange Fruit”*, se recurrió a cuarenta estudiantes universitarios de una universidad pública de New England, USA. Éstos, que se ofrecieron voluntariamente para responder online a un cuestionario semiestructurado, eran alumnos matriculados en un curso de música de nivel de primer año de educación general sobre La Historia de América a través del Canto. En este caso, se hizo un análisis cualitativo de los resultados que sugieren de la encuesta. En este estudio el objetivo fue investigar la reacción de cada participante al audio de “Strange Fruit” interpretado de Billie Holiday, sin cualquier interferencia del estímulo visual ni de la interacción con otros participantes. El cuestionario fue diseñado para cumplir con los objetivos de investigación. En el Capítulo 6, método del estudio se encuentra la información detallada sobre su diseño y cómo se ha analizado los datos generados.

Cuarta Fase (estudios 4.1 y 4.2- Tabla 1)

En referencia al estudio 4.1, sobre el texto extraído conocido como el discurso “Hath not a Jew eyes?”, de la obra de Shakespeare, “The Merchant of Venice”, al igual del segundo estudio, se planteó un análisis de las interacciones y comunicaciones observados de 4 grupos distintos sobre el estrato anterior mencionado. Los participantes fueron alumnos del segundo año de la carrera de Filología inglesa en la universidad de Alicante, con un nivel de inglés de B2. En ese estudio se hizo un análisis cualitativo de los resultados de los grupos focales. También se adoptó la técnica de entrevista semiestructurada en cuatro grupos focales. Por más detalles sobre la metodología, incluyendo las fuentes de información, el trabajo de. campo, la preguntas que se realizó; y estrategias de análisis. En el apartado método (vid. Capítulo 8. Method) del estudio se encuentra la información detallada sobre su diseño y cómo se ha analizado los datos generados.

En referencia al estudio 4.2 se investigó el impacto de “Hath not a Jew eyes?” con el objetivo de observar las interacciones entre los estudiantes para ver si en un contexto más aproximado al aula podría tener un resultado similar a los estudios
anteriores, además de proporcionar una mayor fluidez de la lengua vehicular, en este caso inglesa, utilizada en los debates del texto propuesto. Se hizo un análisis cualitativo de los resultados, cuyo análisis se expone en el apartado método (vid. Capítulo 9. Method) del estudio.
Capítulo 3. A preliminary study into what the press said about anti-war protest songs during the initial stages of the Iraq war

Introduction

In the last fifty years, numerous international conflicts and wars have been waged and to a greater or lesser extent each conflict gave rise to songs which protested against war or chanted for peace. The 1960s and early 1970s was the most prominent period for anti-war songs. Iconic artists, such as Bob Dylan, Pete Seeger, Buffy Sainte-Marie, Edwin Starr, and their songs; “Blowing in the wind”, “Where have all the flowers gone?”; “Universal Soldier”, and “War”, were emblematic of the massive anti-Vietnam War movements, which spread across the US and Europe as well as Australia and New Zealand. Indeed, “War”, “Eve of Destruction” and “Turn, Turn, Turn” reached Nº1 in the US Billboard Hot 100 hits and these songs were also hits in the UK’s Top 40 charts.

During the Iraq War era (2003-2011), several anti-war protest songs were released, even some major artists (Green Day, Black Eyed Peas, for example) used songs to express their opposition to invading Iraq. Yet the reality is that anti-war songs did not make it to US Billboard Hot 100 or the UK Top 40 charts to the same degree as the anti-Vietnam war songs, and therefore arguably awareness of them was limited in scope. This paper seeks to shed some light on this phenomenon by analysing what US and UK opinion-forming newspapers had to say on the subject.

Given its historical importance as a vehicle for dissent, the protest song is considered a characteristic element of any democratic society and indeed “direct state censorship of music is rare in western liberal democracies, especially ones like the USA where free expression is constitutionally protected” (Street, 2003, p. 118).

Furthermore, Street contends that music and politics are often interconnected, citing as evidence Peter Wicke’s study which argues that rock musicians in East Germany provided the impetus for the collapse of the East German regime (Street, 2003, p. 124).
Hypothesis and Objectives

The overall aim of this study is to analyse the journalistic treatment of the anti-war protest song in US and UK opinion forming newspapers from 2003-2005. Journalists, as chroniclers, are widely acknowledged to be a useful source to shed light on trends and their evolution. The publication frequency of emerging themes will be considered, as well as the focus of the articles analysed. The period chosen was between 1/01/2003, which coincided with the three-month period preceding the start of the Iraq War, and 31/12/2005.

Three further objectives were set:

1. Analyse the journalistic treatment of anti-war protest songs between the years 2003-2005, by carrying out webpage searches of opinion forming newspapers.
2. Describe the themes that emerge from the newspaper article analysis.
3. Investigate the evolution over the set time period of the journalistic treatment of anti-war protest songs to illustrate possible changing social contexts.

Method. Design and Information Sources

The research was carried out in the following stages:

1. A qualitative analysis of newspaper articles published from 2003-2005 on anti-war protest songs in five opinion forming US and UK newspapers was carried out by using key search words: protest songs; antiwar protest songs: The Guardian (UK) and the Telegraph (UK), and in the US, The Wall Street Journal (WSJ), The New York Times (NYT) and the Chicago Tribune (Trib) were selected.

2. The aforementioned newspapers were selected because they were likely to have reported the anti-war protest song from a different perspective,
given their distinctive ideological leanings. This was a means by which to overcome possible bias, within the limitations of the study: the Guardian (liberal/left leaning); the Telegraph (conservative); NYT, (liberal, committed to reporting without “fear or favor” (The New York Times, 2016); the Trib. (“traditionally conservative” according to its statement of principles (Chicago Tribune, 2016); WSJ, commentators tend to regard WSJ as a conservative or sometimes even a reactionary newspaper.

3. The total number of articles generated from the keyword searches in the selected newspaper webpages was 378. When the pages viewed ceased to produce relevant articles for the study, further browsing was abandoned.

4. Only newspaper articles were selected (n=41) whose title or content contained the following keywords: anti-war/antiwar/anti war protest songs/music. Where possible, a date filter of 1/01/2003-31/12/2005 was applied. It was agreed by the researchers that a selection of 41 articles would be sufficient in number to identify a trend for the purposes of this study.

5. In total, 12 newspaper articles were selected from The Guardian; 4 from the Telegraph; 13 from the NYT; 5 from the Trib.; and 7 articles from the WSJ, as they met the aforementioned selection criteria.

Fieldwork Development:

The following researchers were involved in the fieldwork: TJ Martin, JM Esteve-Faubel; RP Esteve-Faubel. The article selection criteria outlined below was agreed on and 41 articles were distributed equally among the researchers for analysis:

1. **Article selection criteria**: Discussion of any aspect of English language protest songs and anti-war protest songs or the anti-war protest
movement; relevant book reviews.

2. **Article exclusion Criteria**: Articles that dealt with non-English language anti-war protest songs; articles that focused exclusively on anti-war protest songs/protest songs of the 1960s, 1970s; and short news stories from which no relevant data could be obtained because they did not provide sufficient explanations for the purpose of this study.

**Classification of articles**:

The standard analysis procedure consisted of:

a) Keyword selection of articles according to relevance criteria and definition of categories according to recurrently emerging themes.

b) The categories were not defined from the outset as they emerged after all the articles in the sample were analysed.

c) After analysing their set quota of articles, each researcher proposed a possible classification of the themes that emerged. An idea sharing session took place at the first group meeting and this was the starting point for categorization as well as the basis for discussion. After four meetings a 98% consensus was reached on the categories.

Five themes emerged from the newspaper article analysis: 1) decline of anti-war protest song/protest song; 2) evidence of its decline; evidence of a brief resurgence of anti-war protest songs during the Iraq War 2003; 3) nature of the contemporary protest songs; 4) The nature of protest; 5) Status of the anti-war protest song linked to five indicators grouped as economic, sociopolitical, sociocultural, political and other indicators which limited anti-war protest music.
Results

The journalistic treatment of anti-war protest songs in 41 newspaper articles from 2003-2005, suggests that the impact of anti-war protest songs declined during the period analysed; and five indicators emerged as possible motives for this decline: economic, sociopolitical, sociocultural, political and other indicators which limited anti-war protest music.

“Decline of the protest song”, was flagged up 18 times, representing 44% of articles analysed (n=41)

Graph 1. Number of articles mentioning decline variable

The breakdown by newspaper and the notion of a general decline was mentioned in all newspapers analysed indicating agreement on both sides of the political spectrum and from both the UK and US perspective; c) “General decline” was mentioned in the NYT, Trib. and WSJ, demonstrating agreement, irrespective of their different ideological
slant, at least from the US perspective; d) The majority of press coverage was overall greater in the liberal left leaning newspapers, with The Guardian and The New York times accounting for 66.6% of the total coverage of those mentioning “decline of protest song” (n=18). The Wall Street Journal and the Telegraph accounted for 22.2% of total coverage.

Regarding the reported characteristics of anti-Iraq war songs, graph 2 indicates the highlights:

**Graph 2. Nature of anti Iraq War songs**

According to the articles analysed, the perception was that contemporary protest music did not rally the masses as 70% of the articles dealing with the theme “evidence for the decline of the anti-war protest song” mentioned that anti-Iraq protestors sang songs from the 1960s and that there was a revived interest in past protest songs.

Results relating to the “nature of protest” highlighted the following data: a) 19.5% (n=41) of articles analysed and 42.1% (n=19) of articles that commented on “nature of protest” mentioned that activism continued, but 9.7% (n=41); and 21.05% (n=19) respectively, made a reference to the fact that protest/dissent, including anti-war protest, was silent or declined; b) Protest was driven by single issues but was not part of a fervent counterculture as was the case in the 1960s (n=5), i.e., 12.2% (n=41) of articles
analysed; 26.3% (n=19) of articles mentioning “nature of protest”.

Economic Factors were mentioned by 29% of articles analysed and 58% of the coverage was in newspapers with liberal/ left wing slants (Graph 3).

Graph 3. Number of articles by newspaper that mention economic factors

---

Breaking down “economic factors” into subgroups, the following data emerges:

a) Formation of media/entertainment monopolies was mentioned by 16.6% of all articles that mentioned economic factors (n=12), though notably no mention made by WSJ and Telegraph; b) Marketization/commercialization of music to maximize profits was referred to by 33.3% of all articles (n=12), with no mention from the WSJ.

It is important to underscore that a total of 3 articles: NYT (n=2) and the
Guardian (n=1), that is, 25% of those mentioning economic factors cited a mix of variables, namely monopolies, fragmentation of the market, and record companies co-opting radicalism.

“Sociopolitical factors” were flagged up by 26.8% of the articles, with the WSJ accounting for 18% of total said mentions (n=11) and with no coverage of the issue from the Telegraph.

Breaking down the “Sociopolitical factors”, the following issues emerged: a) The death of idealism or loss of faith in ideology was referred to by 45% of articles covering sociopolitical factors (n=11); b) The corporate controlled conservative agenda which makes it hard for protest songs to become mainstream music and that rock musicians were part of the establishment were mentioned by 27.2% of said articles (n=11).

“Sociocultural factors” were mentioned by 36.6% of total articles analysed (n=41) and 73.3% (n=11) of them came from the Guardian and the NYT. Breaking down the sociocultural factors, the following themes emerged: a) Apathy and/or cynicism and a reluctance to talk about politics were referred to in 33.3% (n=5) of articles covering sociocultural factors; b) Fragmented communities/cultures and a lack of social cohesion were mentioned in 20% (n=3) of all said articles.

“Political factors” were mentioned by 24.4% of the articles analysed and 90% of the coverage came from the Guardian and NYT, the remaining 10% came from the Trib.

Breaking down “political factors”, the following data emerges: a) Elimination of the military draft was referred to by 50% of the articles which mentioned political factors (n=10); b) Collapse of socialism/Bloc was flagged up by 10% of said articles; c) Political causes are voiced in individualist terms; 20% of said articles.

Furthermore, 20% of said articles mentioned a mix of the following variables: elimination of military draft; collapse of socialism/Bloc; political causes are voiced in individualist terms.
Although the results revealed that the Iraq War (2003-2011) produced a few anti-war songs (covered by 14.6% of total articles), one article mentioned the emergence of pro-Iraq war songs as well as anti-Iraq war songs. However, the results also suggest that certain indicators limited anti-war protest music and were a key factor responsible for restricting the proliferation of anti-war protest music during the Iraq War (2003) according to 29.3% of articles (n=41).

Regarding the indicators which limited anti-war protest music, the following data emerges as indicated in Graph 4.

Graph 4. Breakdown of reported indicators which limited anti-war protest music

Graph 5 indicates the number of articles by newspaper which reported on indicators that limited anti-war protest music; WSJ and the Telegraph assign statistically
insignificant editorial space to a key factor in restricting the dissemination of anti-war protest music.

The reactions to the reported indicators which limited anti-war protest music suggest that anti-war protest continued but through other forms made available as a result of the digital revolution, as indicated in Graph 6: a) 16.6% mentioned that artists opted for internet distribution; b) 25% mentioned that dissent moved to the blogosphere and c) 25% mentioned that social media and blogs where the emerging protest outlet. Furthermore, 16.6% of articles mentioned both “artists opted for internet distribution” and “dissent moved to the blogosphere.”
Discussion and Conclusions

The results indicate a decline in anti-war protest songs during the 2003-2005 period of the Iraq War, according to journalists writing for leading UK and US newspapers representing both sides of the political spectrum.

The overall decline in protest songs was observed by newspapers from both sides of the political spectrum thereby strengthening the validity of the result, since the existence of political editorial bias is not apparent on the surface, although 66.6% of the coverage did come from liberal/left wing newspapers.

Azerrad (2011) provides an insightful review of Lynskey’s book, arguing that it attempts to explain the reason for the demise of protest songs but falls short of depth and analysis, explaining that the “loss of faith in ideology […] loss of faith in any performer to bring about change,” are possible factors for its demise but “…it would have been enlightening to explore why, but Mr. Lynskey lets that one go”.

He suggests that we need to look at the source of protest songs; originally they were attached to a group which shared similar interests and they were blatant, rousing and
easy to sing. Indeed many of the anti-war protest songs from the 1960s fell into this category and continued to be sung during anti-Iraq war demonstrations, as indicated in the results, perhaps because there were no contemporary anti-war protest songs of this ilk to rally and inspire protestors. Another factor may have been that the anti-Iraq war demonstrators were reported to have been from older generations and not part of a counterculture as was the youth movement of the 1960s. Therefore, they may have felt a greater affinity with the anti-war songs of the Vietnam era Leland (23 March 2003).

The results of this study point to a number of political, economic and social factors which may have limited the resonance of anti-war protest music.

Economic factors are identified in the results as partly responsible for the decline of anti-war protest songs. In particular, the “formation of media/entertainment monopolies” is mentioned, though notably the conservative WSJ and Telegraph were silent on this issue, a possible indication of their right wing pro-business editorial bias.

Furthermore, it is important to note that the formation of monopolies is facilitated by government deregulation, which is a hallmark of US and UK government policy from the 1980s. In particular, the articles analysed referred to the deregulation of radio industry following the Telecommunications Act of 1996 (US federal law), which allowed large corporations to take over hundreds of independent stations. This produced broadcasting monopolies such as US radio titan Clear Channel which discouraged airplay of anti-Iraq war songs, according to the results.

Some artists reacted to these restrictions by opting for self-censorship and the curtailing of overtly anti-Iraq War stances while some opted for internet distribution, as indicated in the results. When asked by rapper, Mr. Riley, to speak out against the Iraqi invasion, musicians reacted with “the radio will ban my songs” and they were not wrong, according to Mr. Riley (Lee, 18 December 2003).

Indeed, one article argues that anti-Bush songs would be unlikely to receive airplay given the conservative corporate structure controlling thousands of radio stations, concluding that, “this flight to sameness and superficiality is narrowing the range of what
Americans hear on the radio [...] killing popular music (Staples, 20 February 2003). Similarly, Cloonan (1999) argues that in music, “...deregulation has tended to bring more of the same...rather than diversity” (Cloonan, 1999, p. 205).

Furthermore, the variable “marketization and commercialization of music to maximize profits” emerged as a significant variable. A drive for standardization so as to increase profits, reduce costs and the concentration of the recording industry into four labels (Sony BMG; Universal Music Group; EMI; Warner Music) contributed to this decline in music variety. Côté (2011, p. 734) cites and concurs to some extent with Longhurst, Harker and Negus who contend that although popular musicians may attempt to express dissent in their songs, they are restricted by the demands of big business.

Côté (2011, p. 734), cites Rosselsson, who argues that although song is a hugely emotive force, “it is ultimately co-opted by the commercial sphere and can only communicate empty slogans.” Indeed, even the conservative Telegraph expressed the view that perhaps “record companies tend to co-opt radicalism” (Chilton, 08 Mar 2011), 2011).

Pedelty and Racheli (2009) conducted a study among local musicians in Minneapolis, Minnesota to discover the obstacles local musicians face when trying to reach audiences with political messages. Their study concluded that local musicians are exposed to even greater pressures to eradicate political messages from their music than big-name musicians and they may suffer greater consequences for allowing politics to influence their music.

“The pressures of an unstable and uncertain economy” were highlighted in a NYT article as having caused young people to “look inwards, focusing on creating a solid economic future for themselves, rather than dilly dally with Utopian visions.” (Graham-Felsen, 2006).

Taken together the variables that emerged under the themes of sociopolitical and sociocultural factors such as “death of idealism or loss of faith in ideology”; “apathy” and or “cynicism; a reluctance to talk about politics”; that communities have become
“fragmented with a lack of social cohesion” can be linked to the social context of the period analysed. S. Hall (2011) and P. A. Hall and Lamont (2013) deal extensively with these issues referring to the “disenchantment of people from politics itself, and the idea of collective resistance” (S. Hall, 2011, p. 723). Hall describes it as the notion of “disaffected consent”. In other words, people may not agree with the status quo, but they accept it, feeling powerless and incapable of affecting change. Where there is protest, it is “fragmented and disconnected” (S. Hall, 2011, p. 724), such as, for example, the anti-Iraq war protests, which created a media flurry but little else.

According to the Guardian, the anti-immigration laws in America brought millions of protestors to the street, making the anti-Iraq war demonstrators seem insignificant by comparison (Purcell, 2006), suggesting anti-Iraq War sentiment was relatively weaker compared to other socio-political issues, or was not considered a priority.

The politics of self-interest, arguably, appear to be replacing idealistic notions of world peace and love for one’s fellow human being: “How does the injustice feel to me? How do I react to the world’s woes?” (Keller, 14 January 2001).

In line with this individualist viewpoint, the elimination of the military draft in the US was mentioned in the results as a factor that may have lessened anti-war sentiment at a time when post 9/11 terrorism fears were also on the radar. The existence of the draft in the US made the anti-Vietnam War protest and the music that accompanied it fervent as it potentially affected the lives of every young American. It could be argued that because the Iraq war did not affect the individual lives of young Americans to the extent that the Vietnam War did, there was far less passion for protest.

Azerrad (2011) asks in a thought provoking question, “Without idealistic, singable songs that galvanize large groups of people, what will happen to solidarity forever?” To answer Azerrad in part, “Social Media/blogs” and “dissent moves to the blogosphere” were mentioned in the results of this study as new emerging platforms for anti-war activism.
To sum up, the results of the newspaper content analysis indicate a perception that the contemporary anti-Iraq war protest songs were on the wane during the period analysed; this was partly due to them lacking galvanizing power but also because of the changes in the sociopolitical landscape and other indicators which limited the spread and impact of anti-war music. This study analyses a selection of articles from newspapers of record but there may be other ways to judge the motive for the decline in anti-Iraq war songs.

Finally, anti-war protest songs have an important role in the 21st century. Singing protestors are a peaceful force for change and that change could mean a world with less conflict and violence.

Introduction

The 9/11 terrorist attacks on the USA incited the Bush Administration’s War on Terror narrative (Zalman & Clarke, 2009), and the 2003 Iraq War was positioned as the main front in the War on Terror (The White House, 2003). Concurrently, a significant number of protest songs were released from a range of musical genres that expressed dissent against the 2003 Iraq War.

Protest songs are a form of affective communication and can inspire social or political commitment since they “...are expressions of discontent or dissent which imply or assert a need for a change […] and may serve to stimulate thought, reinforce, or modify attitudes” (Kizer, 1983, p. 4). Indeed, in extreme cases, this music has even resulted in regime change (Street, 2003; Wicke, 1993). The significance of protest music as an expression of dissent and standard bearer of a cause has been dealt with extensively in the literature (Denisoff, 1970; Garofalo, 2013; Kizer, 1983; Mondak, 1988; Peddie, 2006; Rodnitzky, 1971). Hence, it is a worthwhile research proposal to study the journalistic discourse around protest music during the 2003 Iraq war but there has been no qualitative content analysis of this press coverage to date.

Theoretical Context and Literature Review

The media landscape during the 2003 Iraq War was evolving and becoming radically different to that of any previous war; more than 500 journalists were with military forces as “embeds”, and it was the first ever internet war (Hiebert, 2003), with dissenting voices and cyber-activism emerging via online alternative media (Carty & Onyett, 2006). Pickerill and Webster (2006) and Vasi (2006) have documented the merits of these new digital platforms in mobilizing dissent. Moreover, in the lead up to the 2003 Iraq War, large personal level digital communication networks may have accounted for
the scale and speed of mobilization of the transnational anti-war protests (Bennett, Breunig, & Givens, 2008).

Ample bibliography investigates mainstream media’s coverage of the 2003 Iraq War and the extent to which dissenting voices were represented in the news media. A content and framing analysis carried out by Goddard et al. confirms the predominance of news stories that focused on daily battle events, whereas coverage of “Domestic protest (4.7%) and the rationale for war (4.4%), issues that opponents of the war would wish to see covered, are almost invisible by comparison” (Goddard, Robinson, & Parry, 2008, p. 17).

Television news coverage in the US and the UK (Aday, Livingston, & Hebert, 2005; Robinson & Goddard, 2006) indicated a similar tendency. Dardis (2006a) and Cushion (2007) conducted content analyses of mainstream press coverage relating to anti-Iraq-war protestors and found evidence of a “protest paradigm”, a term coined by Chan and Chin-Chuan (1984) to describe a pattern whereby the press delegitimizes and marginalises protest and dissent. Kumar (2006) argued that pro-Iraq war arguments dominated the public arena. Hayes and Guardino (2010) found that sources from the Bush administration were the most frequently quoted whereas Democrats or anti-war groups received negligible air-time. A study conducted by Glazier and Boydstun (2012) explains that “we see the press aligning with the president’s frames during periods of national unity following a crisis but then diverging as that solidarity fades.” (p. 441)

Indeed, overreliance on official sources, and other possible ideological factors related to patriotism and fear of weakening support for the war effort, as well as fear of disrespecting troops have been cited as possible reasons for journalists’ reluctance to highlight voices of dissent during war times,

“It is now widely accepted that news media failed to question the Bush administration on the most outrageous and false assertions about the justifications for going to war in Iraq. News media should have served as a filter to sort out information and act as a reliable source where citizens could have based accurate judgments about the war, and many believe that was not the case. Many argue that the U.S. news media did not act
respondibly, and, therefore, misinformation about Iraq spread rapidly throughout the public. The watchdog had become the parrot for the administration.” (D. Harp, Loke, & Bachmann, 2010, p. 477)

Bennett’s (1990) indexing theory is based on the idea that mainstream journalists generally reflect the variety of viewpoints of those in power because their sources are consistently public statements of officials. This results in a narrow perspective on events because dissenting voices tend to be excluded from the mainstream media discourse (D. Harp et al., 2010). However, not all scholars concur with indexing theory (Althaus, 2003; Althaus, Edy, Entman, & Phalen, 1996; Entman, 2004; Livingston & Eachus, 1996).

Indeed, a content analysis of articles published in Time magazine during the 2003 Iraq War found that journalists and their editors

“...allowed voices of dissent into stories from the start. Official voices typically dominated the discourse, but voices from civilians, particularly Iraqis during the first year of the conflict, were allowed to shape the story. These results call for a more nuanced and qualified approach to indexing theory.” (D. Harp et al., 2010, p. 477)

Hypothesis and Objectives.

The hypothesis of this study is that press coverage in newspapers of record provided an insight into what was happening to anti-war protest songs during the 2003 Iraq war. Thus, the overall aim of this study is to investigate coverage by British and US-American newspapers of news related to anti-war songs during the 2003 Iraq War period. Although the production of media texts is a political activity (Garner & Mendez, 2016), it is expected that analysing them will facilitate the “capture of feeling” and provide an understanding of the protest song narrative from the journalist perspective during the period in question.

The objectives of the study are threefold: i) to investigate the content and produce a thematic framework for what constituted the news on protest songs over the
eleven-year time span covered by the study; ii) to identify patterns of press coverage; and iii) to describe the nature of the press coverage.

Method.

Design

The research involved four consecutive stages: a) search and compilation of newspaper articles; b) selection of the compiled material in accordance with the criteria set out below; c) classification by thematic category and d) study of these categories.

Information sources

A qualitative content analysis of newspaper articles published between 2003 and 2014 on anti-war protest songs was carried out in the following opinion forming UK and US newspapers: The Guardian, The Telegraph, The Wall Street Journal, The New York Times and The Chicago Tribune. Clearly, the newspapers selected are not intended to represent the entire UK and US press landscape. However, they were selected because of their “circulation numbers and “of record” hegemony” (Dardis, 2006b, p. 404). Furthermore, the Guardian was one of the newspapers whose coverage of voices of dissent during the Iraq War “Suggests a position that at least negotiated the meaning of the war and at times took an oppositional stance” (Goddard et al., 2008, p. 27). Moreover, both USA and UK opinion forming newspapers were included to ensure that possible differences in cross-national press coverage would have the chance to emerge (Dardis, 2006b).

The exact combination of the following words was searched in the online archives of the aforementioned newspapers and a date filter of 1/01/2003-14/08/2014 was applied: anti-war/antiwar/anti war and protest songs/music.

Fieldwork Development

Three researchers were involved in the fieldwork and the research technique adopted was qualitative content analysis through investigator triangulation.
The total number of newspaper articles collected was \( n=2619 \) and they were scanned in accordance with the criteria set out below in an agreed protocol to determine article inclusion or exclusion:

1. Questions considered to determine article exclusion if answered affirmatively:
   - Did the article exclusively focus on a specific concert with no mention of protest in relation to the Iraq War, anti-war sentiment or anti-war protest music?; Was the article an obituary?; Did the article include an irrelevant book review?; Did the article report exclusively on a non-war related protest/demonstration that took place?; Did the article focus on non-English language anti-war protest songs?

2. Questions considered to determine article inclusion if answered affirmatively:
   - Did the article make any reference to the absence of, decline in or resurgence of, anti-war songs during the 2003 Iraq War Era?; Did the article explain what had happened to protest music/or anti-war protest music/songs?; Did the article make any mention of anti-war sentiment or pro-war sentiment during the 2003 Iraq War era?; Did the article suggest that the status of anti-war protest music/songs may be attributable to a particular factor or trend?

Analysis Strategies:

The standard interpretation procedure consisted of data reduction, keyword selection, dimensional grouping of phrases, coding and thorough editing and classification of categories.

Once the article selection protocol was applied, 847 newspaper articles were selected with the following breakdown by newspaper: *The Guardian*: 225; *The Telegraph*: 102; *The New York Times*: 187; *The Chicago Tribune*: 170; and *The Wall Street Journal*: 163.
The categories were not defined from the outset. Instead, an inductive approach was adopted, and therefore, they emerged after reviewing all the newspaper articles and deciding the coding categories. This provided a more accurate idea of the different emergent categories that would comprise the final thematic framework.

Each researcher proposed a way of coding the significant themes. This formed the basis of the research group’s discussion and a consensus was reached on the coding and thematic framework after six meetings, which took place over approximately five months.

Results

Thematic framework of the press coverage:

The four categories that comprise the thematic framework represent the intrinsic value of the news reported in the 847 articles analysed and are reproduced in Table 1. Each article was coded for the presence of the emergent categories and subcategories; therefore, it is possible for an article to reflect more than one category. From the thematic framework it was possible to identify two key modalities – pressure and utility - which describe the nature and depth of the press coverage.
Table 1. The Thematic Framework: Four emergent categories

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Anti-war protest songs</th>
<th>Nature of contemporary anti-war protest songs</th>
<th>Nature of protest</th>
<th>Anti-war protest song affected by five factors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Decline of anti-war protest songs (44%).</td>
<td>Not anthems Not easy to sing (4.9%).</td>
<td>Protest/dissent, including anti-war protest was silent or declined (9.7%).</td>
<td>Economic factors (29%), 58% coverage from liberal left leaning newspapers: Formation of media/entertainment monopolies. Marketization/commercialization of music.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brief resurgence of anti-war protest songs during the Iraq War (9.7%).</td>
<td>Influenced by old guard musicians (4.9%).</td>
<td>US anti-immigration laws attracted more protestors than the anti-Iraq war demonstrations (2.4%).</td>
<td>Sociopolitical (26.8%), no mention from Telegraph: Death of idealism/loss of faith in ideology. Corporate controlled conservative agenda.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political songs have become marginalized (2.4%).</td>
<td>Protest continues as activism (19.5%).</td>
<td></td>
<td>Sociocultural (36.6%), 73% coverage from Guardian and TNYT: Apathy and/or cynicism/reluctance to talk about politics. Fragmented communities/cultures; lack of social cohesion.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anti-war protestors sang songs from the Vietnam era (14.6%).</td>
<td>Stylistically diverse (2.4%)</td>
<td>Protest not a counterculture (12.1%)</td>
<td>Political (24.4%), 90% coverage from Guardian and TNYT; 10% Trib.: Elimination of the military draft. Political causes voiced in individualist terms.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lacked rallying resonance (4.9%)</td>
<td>Constraints on anti-Iraq war songs/anti-Iraq war sentiment (29.2%), 91.6% of coverage from TNYT; TG; Trib. Radio stations banned anti-war protest music. Self-censorship by artists. Death threat received by Dixie Chicks' Natalie Maines after publicly denouncing President Bush's foreign policy.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2. Sample of Newspaper headlines related to anti-war protest music during the Iraq War 2003

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Newspaper</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Link</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Guardian</td>
<td>The same old songs. There is a gaping hole for a new anti-war anthem that will capture the moment and the mood</td>
<td><a href="https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2007/feb/24/comment.politics1">https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2007/feb/24/comment.politics1</a></td>
<td>Duncan Campbell</td>
<td>24/02/2007</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Visualization of the most frequent words used in the sample newspaper headlines in Table 2

Patterns of Press Coverage

The results suggest two basic patterns of press coverage: news—coverage based on news stories reporting on events and meeting accepted news values criteria; and opinion—coverage from the comment or opinion pages of the newspaper.

Examples of news stories included articles that reported on the singing of anti-war protest songs from the Vietnam War era during anti-Iraq War demonstrations. Furthermore, most of the news grouped under the category “Protest” and “Nature of Contemporary anti-war protest songs” met the news-values criteria of negativity and proximity (Harcup & O’Neill, 2001) identified originally by Galtung and Ruge (1965). For example, the negativity element with respect to contemporary anti-war protest songs is observable in the following emergent subcategories: contemporary protest music lacked rallying resonance; anti-Iraq war songs are not anthems, not easy to sing; and
protest songs have become marginalized (Table 1).

The proximity angle, which is also apparent in the results (Galtung & Ruge, 1965), describes the phenomena that citizens relate more easily to an event when it has a local or national focus or involves people from their country. This may explain why, for example, as several journalists reported, the US anti-immigration laws attracted far more protestors than the anti-Iraq war protest.

Examples of opinion articles include articles whose content was grouped under the fourth category –reported impact factors- and these articles suggested that the anti-war protest song was affected by economic, political, socio-political factors, and the constraints on anti-war songs that are indicated in Table 1.

The nature and depth of the press coverage

The nature of the press coverage pointed to the identification of two modalities: pressure and utility. The pressure modality described an article typology that covered protest songs, demonstrations or concerts organized with the intention of protesting against the war- in which the journalist reported that artists were frightened to express anti-war sentiment, fearing a backlash for appearing unpatriotic. The utility modality described two article typologies: i) the journalist covered both the dissemination of information as well as a denouncement, criticism and/or analysis; or, ii) the journalist exclusively reported on events and observations without reflection.

The study uncovered several examples of the pressure modality as indicated in Graph 1.
Turning to the utility modality, several articles performed the function of denouncing government policies, which included a critical discussion of radio deregulation, consolidation and the constraints this placed on musical expressions of anti-war sentiment (Table 1. Reported impact factors category). Others were critical of a perceived youth apathy or an unwillingness to stand up to the Bush Administration and oppose the war in Iraq (Table 1. Reported impact factors category. Socio-political).

Most of the news articles, in contrast to the opinion pages, as would be expected given their limited space allocation and time constraints, transmitted information without reflection, such as Janofsky (25 September 2005) who reports on the anti-Iraq War demonstrations in Washington as well as the events in various other US cities where marches were held, including San Francisco, and remarks, with no interspersion of opinion, that “War, the Vietnam-era protest song by Edwin Starr, suddenly filled the air”. There is no further comment as to why an anti-war song from the Vietnam era was being
sung at an anti-Iraq War protest. In the case of Pareles’ (9 March 2003) article, “Music; New Songs, Old Message: No War”, there is a brief mention that rock musicians expect little radio exposure given the consolidation of most radio stations into two national networks. Similarly, Pareles (9 March 2003) concludes that the new anti-war songs received no commercial airplay to avoid dividing or alienating listeners. However, in both aforementioned cases, there is no further critical reflection on what this means for the expression of anti-war sentiment through the protest song.

The main purpose of some articles was to inform the reader as to how artists reacted to the obstacles they faced in terms of getting airplay for their anti-war songs, without delving into the underlying causes or implications of these constraints on their artistic expression. Thus, from the subcategory constraints, artists’ reactions were reported, and these were coded and are reproduced in Graph 2.

Graph 2. Reactions to reported indicators which limited anti-war protest music

- Artists opt for internet distribution
- Social Media/Blogs
- Dissent moves to the blogosphere
- Internet distribution & dissent to blogosphere
Discussion

The results of this study indicated as predicted by the hypothesis that the press coverage of anti-war protest songs during the 2003 Iraq War highlighted some important factors that contributed to understanding the fate of this type of music during the period studied. The information that emerged has been structured around the following conceptual and thematic categories to facilitate an understanding of the journalistic discourse on protest songs during the Iraq War era.

The perceived decline of protest music.

The decline subcategory embraced several themes perceived by journalists, that include the following: a decrease in airplays of anti-war protest songs; a reported decrease in the aesthetic quality of the protest music being produced; a suggested decrease in the willingness of listeners to engage with anti-war protest music; and, the reported artist self-censorship.

According to the results, 44% of the newspaper articles analysed made a specific reference to a perceived decline in contemporary anti-war protest songs. This journalistic perception would need to be validated by a separate comparative study with the journalistic perception of anti-war songs during Vietnam era, which is beyond the scope of this study. However, the later writings of Garofalo (2013) and Lynskey (2010) reflect a similar argument in relation to the decline of this type of music during the Iraq War era, suggesting that despite the large quantity of songs released they failed to make a significant impact.

In fact, this claim may be substantiated by the fact that not one of the songs reached the Nº1 slot in the US, “Billboard Hot 100”, Billboard Music (2015) with the exception of The Black Eyed Peas’ hit “Where is the Love?”, which reached the Nº1 slot in the UK Top 40 Singles, (UK Top 40, 13 December 2015). During the early years of the war, without airplay it would have been impossible for a song to succeed in the charts as this period predates You Tube (launched in 2005) and Spotify (launched in 2008) as serious alternative music listening options.

75
Table 2. List of protest songs released during the 2003 Iraq War and their rankings in the charts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TN</th>
<th>Artist</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Musical Style</th>
<th>Charts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Black Eyed Peas</td>
<td>Where is The Love?</td>
<td>2003</td>
<td>Hip Hop (HH)</td>
<td>US-N°8;UK-N°1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Dixie Chicks</td>
<td>Not Ready to Make Nice</td>
<td>2006</td>
<td>Country</td>
<td>US-N°4;UK-N°70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Tom Paxton</td>
<td>George W Told the Nation</td>
<td>2007</td>
<td>Folk</td>
<td>no listing (nl)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Jackson Browne</td>
<td>The Drums of War. Time the Conqueror (Album)</td>
<td>2008</td>
<td>Folk Rock</td>
<td>UK N° 57; Billboard 200-N°20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Iron Maiden</td>
<td>For the Greater Good of God (single). A Matter of life and Death (Album)</td>
<td>2006</td>
<td>Heavy Metal</td>
<td>Billboard 200 N°9; UK N°4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Beastie Boys</td>
<td>In a World Gone Mad</td>
<td>2003</td>
<td>HH</td>
<td>nl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Eminem</td>
<td>Mosh</td>
<td>2004</td>
<td>HH</td>
<td>US N°12 Bubbling Under R&amp;B/Hip Hop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Linkin Park</td>
<td>Hands Held High. Minutes to Midnight (Album)</td>
<td>2007</td>
<td>HH</td>
<td>nl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Esham</td>
<td>No War</td>
<td>2003</td>
<td>HH</td>
<td>nl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Pink</td>
<td>Dear Mr President</td>
<td>2006</td>
<td>Pop rock</td>
<td>nl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Green Day</td>
<td>American Idiot</td>
<td>2004</td>
<td>Punk Rock (PR)</td>
<td>US-N°64;UK-N°3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Rise Against</td>
<td>Hero of War</td>
<td>2008</td>
<td>PR</td>
<td>no listing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Green Day</td>
<td>Holiday</td>
<td>2004</td>
<td>PR</td>
<td>Billboard hot 100 N°19;UK-N°11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Pearl Jam</td>
<td>World Wide Suicide</td>
<td>2006</td>
<td>Rock</td>
<td>Billboard hot 100 N°41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Artist</td>
<td>Song Title</td>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Genre</td>
<td>Country</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Lenny Kravitz</td>
<td>We Want Peace</td>
<td>2003</td>
<td>Rock</td>
<td>nl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Sheryl Crow</td>
<td>Let’s Get Free</td>
<td>2003</td>
<td>Rock</td>
<td>nl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>REM</td>
<td>Final Straw Around the Sun (Album)</td>
<td>2004</td>
<td>Rock</td>
<td>nl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Blur</td>
<td>Out of Time Think Tank (Album)</td>
<td>2003</td>
<td>Rock</td>
<td>UK Nº5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Steave Earle</td>
<td>Rich Man’s War The Revolution Starts Now (Album)</td>
<td>2004</td>
<td>Rock, country</td>
<td>nl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Green Day</td>
<td>Wake me up when September Ends</td>
<td>2005</td>
<td>PR</td>
<td>US Billboard 100-Nº6;UK-Nº8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Neil Young</td>
<td>Living with War (Album)</td>
<td>2006</td>
<td>Rock, Folk</td>
<td>UK: Nº14; Billboard 200-Nº15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources:
http://www.billboard.com/charts/hot-100
http://www.billboard.com/charts/billboard-200
http://www.officialcharts.com/charts/uk-top-40-singles-chart/
http://www.officialcharts.com/charts/albums-chart/
http://www.billboard.com/biz/charts/bubbling-under-r-and-b-hip-hop-singles

By way of contrast, in terms of success in charts, the Vietnam War era produced several Nº1 anti-war hits including, “War”, “Eve of Destruction”, “Turn, Turn, Turn”. The UK’s Top 40 charts painted a similar picture, even though the UK did not officially send troops to Vietnam, with both “Eve of Destruction” and “War” reaching Nº3 slot.

A further point suggesting this perceived decline of the protest song from the journalist perspective, and notable for its news value, was the reported negative opinion of the aesthetic quality of contemporary anti-war protest songs. These anti-war songs
were said to be lacking an anthem-like rallying quality. However, there was no further journalistic probe as to the possible reasons for the protest song’s perceived demise as a galvanizing force. Andrew Murray of the Stop the War Coalition was quoted in an article published in *The Guardian* that he had not yet come across a new song that had the “anthemic, rallying resonance of Fixin’-to-Die or War” and that the anti-war movement did not have the support that he would have hoped from the music fraternity (Duncan Campbell, 24 February 2007).

This aesthetic criticism may be explained by Mondak (1988) work, which argued that “one of the shortcomings of protest music as political persuasion becomes apparent when the listener is not able to “cognitively process the songs” messages”. This can occur when the lyrics are unintelligible making them difficult to sing on marches and, therefore, such songs are unlikely to become anthems. However, to ascertain whether this was the case with the anti-Iraq-war songs would require a further qualitative study on the intelligibility and appeal of a sample of these songs, which is beyond the remit of this study.

The other reported “decline” related statements are subsequently dealt with in the related literature. Garofalo (2013), Scherzinger and Smith (2007) argue that artist self-censorship and lack of airplay resulting from the deregulation and consolidation of the radio industry were primarily responsible for demise of anti-war songs during this period. In fact, Garofalo’s (2013, p. 24) opinion of the socio-political context suggests that “…given the changes in political climate and the corporate landscape of the culture industries, however, country anthems supporting military action as the appropriate response to the 9/11 attacks have overwhelmed more critical voices in rock and rap that challenged this course of action.” (p. 24)

Examining the relevant bibliography from the Vietnam and post-Vietnam War era would seem to indicate that the decline of protest music may well have been a process that started several decades before the 2003 Iraq War. Rodnitzky (1971) argues that “protest music has been fragmented by its commercial success, cultural acceptance, and failure to establish relationships with specific reform movements” (p. 49). According to Kizer (1983, p. 10), “…the dramatic lack is in specialized lyrics created for social
movements”, a statement that coincides with the results of the present study that curiously revealed the singing of anti-war songs from the Vietnam War era by anti-Iraq war protestors.

There are various possible reasons to explain this. Perhaps it was due to the demonstrators being mainly from older rather than younger generations and, therefore, they felt more akin to anti-Vietnam war songs. Indeed, according to Leland (23 March 2003), the anti-Iraq war protests do not represent a new counterculture as did the socially seismic youth movement of the 1960s:

“In part because of the Internet, the antiwar movement has assembled without apparent leaders. Pacifists march with fiscal conservatives, traditional liberals with centrist who favor war but only with support. Fittingly, the signs at demonstrations have told a story not of philosophical uniformity but of sprawl:

Straight White Anglo-Saxon Males for Peace.
'Capitalist Swing Voter for Peace.
'Pro-Life and Anti-War.
Queers Against War in Iraq.”

Leland’s news report and the phenomena he observed about the diverse profile of anti-war protestors was subsequently analysed in the literature and, similarly, the conclusions were that “the organizational coalitions were so loosely knit that they stretched the capacity to imagine them as a social movement at all.” (Bennett et al., 2008, p. 273)

Anti-war sentiment is reported to be on the wane.

The proximity news angle, relating to observation that US anti-immigration laws attracted far more protestors than the anti-Iraq war protests suggests that the war in Iraq was not perceived to be as relevant as immigration issues. The elimination of the military draft, mentioned by 50% of articles coded under political factors, may have played a key role in diminishing anti-war sentiment. Also, recruitment to the voluntary army in the US

Patterns of press coverage. News and Opinion

The results suggested two patterns of press coverage: news, and opinion. The following themes overwhelmingly made the news items as discussed in sections 1 and 2: anti-Iraq war protestors sang anti-war songs from the Vietnam era; protest songs against the Iraq War were not rallying anthems and were perceived to be on the wane; immigration attracted more protestors than the anti-Iraq-War protests.

Articles that discussed factors which affected the anti-war song were coded according to whether the content had an economic, socio-political or political slant. (Table 1. Reported impact factors). These articles were typically more opinion based.

Economic factors, namely the “marketization and commercialization of music to maximize profits” emerged in this study. A drive for standardization to increase profits, reduce costs and the concentration of the recording industry into four major labels (Sony BMG; Universal Music Group; EMI; Warner Music) contributed to a decline in music variety. In accordance with these findings, Smith-Said Smith-Said (2006) argues that anti-war artists are active but are being silenced by “…an industry that has for years derived its profits from kiddy porn and dream boys” (p. 32).

Côté (2011) agrees to some extent with Longhurst (1995) and Negus (1996) who contend that although popular musicians may attempt to express dissent in their songs, they are restricted by the demands of big business, which eventually suppresses their artistic freedom. Madonna’s withdrawal of her graphic anti-war music video “American Life”, a few days after the American invasion of Iraq, was arguably due to the perceived risk associated with expressing dissent against the 2003 Iraq War:

“As the consolidated media industry chips away at sites of non-conformist musical activity, dissenting musical expressions within the established monopoly structures are increasingly compromised or maimed outright.
Even relatively ‘independent’ artists, who thrive on being ahead of the fashion curve, are now operating within powerful new constraints. It is in this context that Madonna’s withdrawal of the video of ‘American Life’ should be understood as well. Significantly, Clear Channel Communications was responsible for producing and promoting Madonna’s 2004 ‘Re-Invention’ tour, which, according to Madonna’s website, was to be accompanied throughout by the media giant’s senior touring president, Arthur Fogel. It is not difficult to imagine the amount of leverage the conservative Clear Channel, with its official and personal ties to the Bush administration, could exert from this position” (Scherzinger & Smith, 2007, p. 219).

Similarly, Côté (2011, p. 734) citing Rosselson (1979, p. 40), argues that songs can be “the most powerful emotional force of all” but they have become co-opted by commercial interests and end up promoting empty catchphrases (Côté, 2011, p. 734; Rosselson, 1979, pp. 45-46).

Socio-political factors included the following themes: death of idealism or loss of faith in ideology; apathy and/or cynicism; a reluctance to talk about politics; fragmented communities lacking social cohesion (Table 1). These subcategories suggest that journalists were describing what they perceived as a corresponding decrease in appetite for or interest in protest music. In this respect, S. Hall (2011) and P. A. Hall and Lamont (2013) have written extensively on the notion of the disenchantment of people from politics itself and the idea of collective resistance as well as the concept of disaffected consent, which explains why people may not agree with the status quo but accept it, feeling powerless and incapable of affecting change: According to S. Hall (2011), “…as far as disenchantment of people from politics itself and the idea of collective resistance is concerned, a massive de-politicization has done its work: though some might interpret it as ‘disaffected consent’” (S. Hall, 2011, p. 273).
Exploring the nature of press coverage

Two modalities of press coverage – pressure and utility – provided a means by which to group the thematic categories to provide an insight into the nature and depth of the coverage provided by journalists.

The pressure modality applied to articles that divulged the constraints on musical expression during the period under study. For example, The New York Times reported on a concert that protested against media deregulation and consolidation and revealed that artists felt under pressure not to speak out against the Iraqi invasion for fear of having their songs banned: “Mr. Riley, a rapper, said he could not get other musicians to speak out against the Iraqi invasion. They were, like, “The radio will ban my songs,” and the truth is, we couldn’t say, “You are wrong” Lee (18 December 2003).

Similarly, N. Strauss (12 March 2003) article covers the release of the anti-Iraq war song, “In a World Gone Mad” which was not released commercially but was made available free at the Beastie Boys website and the song’s message was reported to be aimed at telling the US public that it was not un-American to protest.

These types of articles indicated that there was a shift in the protest paradigm – a pattern whereby the press delegitimizes protest and dissent Chan and Chin-Chuan (1984) that several previous studies had identified. For instance, Dardis’ (2006a) content analysis identified the marginalization devices used in the press coverage of Iraq War protests that involved a generally perceived negative story tone towards protestors. Furthermore, Dardis (2006b) concludes in a subsequent study that the US press was more likely to use such marginalization strategies in its coverage of anti-Iraq war protestors than the UK press.

However, the protest paradigm that was applicable to the coverage of anti-Iraq war protestors in the previously cited works was not identified in this study’s analysis of newspaper articles about protest music. By contrast, this study indicates that protesting musicians and protestors were not marginalised; instead, journalists gave them a voice and exposed their fears about speaking out against the Iraq War through their music.
Notably, this press coverage occurred in newspapers of record, and this coverage took place at the very outset of the Iraq War in 2003.

The utility modality was applicable to articles that performed the function of a denouncement of government policies, such as those that discussed the issue of radio deregulation, consolidation and the silencing or marginalization of anti-war sentiment and those that reported on artists’ reactions to these constraints.

The most prominent example appeared in an opinion page article entitled “The Trouble with Corporate radio: The Day the Protest Music Died” (Staples, 20 February 2003), a controversial and reflective statement was made about the status of the anti-war protest song at the start of the Iraq war. Staples argued that while “Pop music played a crucial role in the debate over Vietnam war [...] A comparable song about George W Bush’s rush to war in Iraq would have no chance at all today”, because of what he described as “the conservative corporate structure that controls thousands of stations” and he concluded that “this flight to sameness and superficiality is narrowing the range of what Americans hear today and killing popular music.”

He referred specifically to the negative impact of the 1996 Telecommunications Act which in his view “...limited expression over the airwaves” as playlists “continually repeat songs that challenge nothing and no one…” (Staples, 2003). These types of articles played an important role in terms of addressing the issues that were perceived to have impacted protest songs during the Iraq 2003 War era. Indeed, Staples’ discourse has been subsequently reinforced by scholars such as (Côté, 2011; Garofalo, 2013; Smith-Said, 2006).

Dissent and freedom of expression are held to be vital elements of any democratic society; however, several scholars have demonstrated that media strategies also silenced or marginalized voices that opposed the Iraq war. Kumar (2006, p. 48) documents the strategies resulting in what he describes as the “...the dominance of pro-Iraq war arguments in the public sphere”. Hayes and Guardino (2010) provided an analysis of television evening news stories in the eight months leading up to the Iraq invasion, which found that sources from the Bush administration were the most frequently
quoted whereas “the voices of anti-war groups and opposition Democrats were barely audible” (p. 59).

In such an apparently restrictive media climate, which existed especially at the outset of the Iraq War, it is not surprising that the expression of musical dissent from the war would also compromised. For example, Rage Against the Machine had their message board closed by secret services and Madonna issued a statement withdrawing her controversial anti-war video for American Life (Scherzinger & Smith, 2007, p. 218).

However, despite the previously mentioned bibliography indicating a pro-war media bias at the initial stages of the war, it is important to note that the journalists who wrote the articles analysed in this study did not follow this pattern. This study highlights that at the very outset of the Iraq War, journalists explicitly reported on the constraints experienced by artists wishing to express anti-war sentiment.

The utility modality was also applicable to some journalists who were critical of a perceived youth apathy: “the greatest disappointment of my generation has been its failure to stand up to the Bush administration and particularly its refusal to actively oppose the war in Iraq” (Graham-Felsen, 2006). It is important to signal that this observed journalistic perception of youth apathy may be misleading because support for the anti-war movement may have been weakened by the devices deployed by the media to delegitimize the anti-Iraq war protests and create a negatively perceived coverage of protestors (Dardis, 2006b). Cushion’ (2007) content analysis of UK press coverage of young anti-Iraq war protestors indicated that young protestors were portrayed as violent. A later survey carried out by Cushion (2009) among politically motivated young people in the UK indicated a reluctance among many to attend anti-Iraq war protests because they were portrayed by the media as violent and conflictive.

Finally, the utility modality could also be applied to several newspaper articles which reported that artists reacted to the constraints on the expression of anti-Iraq war sentiment through music by making MP3 downloads of their songs available on their website, and by using alternative digital media and social media as well as the “blogosphere” to express dissent. However, there was no reflection on or analysis of the
effectiveness of these new music distribution methods in the sample of articles analysed.

Clearly, the MP3 download provided artists with a means by which to reach their audiences online with anti-war messages. According to Smith-Said (2006, p. 33), the modern protest song “that actually has political effect because of its timely ability to affect public opinion is the free MP3 download”, and he concluded that protest music during the Iraq era had moved online, offering artists the chance to express anti-war sentiment as quickly as they could write and record their anti-war songs, without the time constraints imposed by the large record companies. However, despite Smith-Said’s (2006) argument, in practice Garofalo (2013) concludes that:

“In such an unfriendly political climate and with the absence of radio play, many artists interested in protesting the war turned to the Internet, often posting protest songs as MP3s available for free download...Because the Internet offered only limited possibilities for promoting such protest music, however, dissenting voices were often effectively silenced in the public sphere.” (p. 19)

The results also indicated that alternative digital media, social media and the “blogosphere” were becoming the vehicles to express dissent. This trend has been the subject of considerable scholarly study. Alternative digital media and cyber-activism played an important role in terms of giving an enhanced voice to anti-war sentiment and mobilizing dissent, as indicated by scholars such as Carty and Onyett (2006), Pickerill and Webster (2006) and Vasi (2006).

However, Bennett et al. (2008) critically analysed the dynamics of the communication process in the case of US protests against the 2003 Iraq war, and question, “whether such flexible political identifications operating through such personalized political communication channels can produce the kinds of focused collective action that often seem necessary to define common goals, develop power relationships with targets of protest, and ultimately achieve political and social change.” (p. 286)
The strengths of the study include the use of investigator triangulation, which enabled inferences to be drawn from the coding categories proposed. The thematic framework that emerged from the content analysis made headway in terms of investigating the journalistic treatment of the anti-war protest song during the 2003 Iraq War.

The limitations of this study are that the results of the newspaper content analysis may partly explain the motive for the waning influence of anti-war songs during the Iraq War era, but it should not be considered as the entire or sole explanation of this phenomenon; there may be other ways to judge the motive, even though they did not emerge in this study.

Furthermore, other limitations include the following: there is no analysis of the tone of the articles or the rhetorical devices that may have been used to sway readers; online links to the articles were used so it was not possible to note the article’s position in the newspaper’s print edition (such as, right-hand page /left-hand page/ newspaper section/ front half or back half of the newspaper); all articles sampled named the author but there was no investigation as to whether the author was freelance or an exclusive correspondent of the newspaper. Also, as previously mentioned, criticisms related to the aesthetic quality of the contemporary protest songs may be considered somewhat subjective, and therefore could benefit from further qualitative research.

Conclusions

The news articles analysed reported on events and phenomena as observed and perceived by journalists and provided an insight into the status of protest music during the 2003 Iraq War. Many articles reported the news, but others offered more in-depth analysis, disclosing the practice of artist self-censorship due to fear of a backlash against expressing dissent through song.

The deregulation and consolidation of the US radio industry was also raised by journalists as a factor that limited the dissemination of protest songs, and this concurs
with authors such as Garofalo (2013) and Scherzinger and Smith (2007). Furthermore, the political context of the Patriot Act (2001) had an arguably restrictive impact on the entertainment industry according to Garofalo (2013, p. 17), and the Iraq War was also framed by the Bush Administration as a key strategy in the War on Terror. In this political context there was no elite voice of dissent for journalists to report on, especially at the initial stages of the war and, therefore, the media coverage became “a one-sided information flow” Hayes and Guardino (2010, p. 60).

However, the results of this study surprisingly indicate that from the outset of this war in 2003, the newspapers analysed reported on and delved into what had happened to anti-war protest music and revealed the constraints experienced by artists.

The study highlights the journalistic perception that the dissent deficit associated with this war also extended to the protest song a traditional symbol of dissidence. The literature indicates that during the early stages of the 2003 Iraq War, voices resistant to the dominant political ideologies were suppressed and marginalized (Goddard et al., 2008; Kumar, 2006). This study’s novelty lies in the finding that journalists reported on the suppression of anti-war sentiment by professional musicians from the outset of the 2003 Iraq war, and this concurs with the later arguments proposed by scholars such as Garofalo (2013) and Scherzinger and Smith (2007).

Overall, the findings point to the importance of supporting professional news reporting and investigative journalism as well as the value of analysing the output from newspapers of record and reputable journalists.

Finally, the study suggests a journalistic perception that the anti-war protest song, as it was conceived historically, may have become a relic of the previous century. What this may mean for the peace movement that has historically agglutinated around anti-war anthems is a question that remains unanswered.
Introduction

The anti-war song during the 2003 Iraq War: A review of the bibliography

Wars of the twentieth-century, especially those since the 1960s, were accompanied by an amalgam of songs whose lyrical content responded to a political and social commitment, with its core being to take sides in the conflict. The 2003 Iraq War was no exception. There was a resurgence of anti-war protest music as indicated in Table 1, ranging from hip hop to folk-rock. Eminem’s “Mosh”, 2004, and Billy Bragg’s “The Price of Oil”, 2002, are an indication of these different musical genres.

However, the proliferation of this musical typology was limited and furthermore,

“...given the changes in the political climate and the corporate landscape of the culture industries, [...] country anthems supporting military action as the appropriate response to the 9/11 attacks have overwhelmed more critical voices in rock and rap that challenged this course of action.” (Garofalo, 2013, p. 24)

The limited exposure given to these types of songs may have hampered their social impact. However, other possible contributing factors are covered by the literature, including the marginalization of dissenting voices in mainstream media (Adolphson (Adolphson, 2014; Kumar, 2006); artist self-censorship in the post 9/11 era (Garofalo, 2013; Scherzinger & Smith, 2007) radio deregulation and consolidation (Garofalo, 2013); and the move to online distribution of anti-war songs (Smith-Said, 2006). Several scholars have approached the issue of how popular music and political thought and action have been historically linked and music’s capacity to create a political response (Kizer, 1983; Street, 2012). Anti-war sentiment and its corresponding music have also received
considerable scholarly attention, contributing an accurate vision of the role and nature of protest music during the Iraq War from both a sociological and comparative perspective (Pieslak, 2007; Rodnitsky, 2010; Rosenberg, 2013; Weinstein, 2017).

A synthesis of the aforementioned bibliography leads to the conclusion that a combination of the factors cited may have delimited the variety of protest music heard by society in general, and the American public in particular, given the US’s lead role in the 2003 Iraq War. In this context, the media, and particularly the audio-visual media, played an important role because widespread dissemination of expressions of dissent did not occur and therefore there was no possible connection between these artistic expressions of anti-war sentiment and the public. Although Green Day’s “American Idiot” album – pop punk- was a memorable expression of anti-war sentiment, the album’s value as a trigger for critical reflection and debate on such global issues is not known. Indeed, the problem this study addresses is that present-day listener reactions to these types of songs is unknown as well as whether the content of these songs could be useful from an educational perspective.

The use of topical or protest songs as a pedagogical tool has been discussed by several scholars, particularly in the teaching of social justice and civil rights modules in history classes (Banks, 2003; Butler, 2003; Stone, 2004), and in ethics classes (O’Mathúna, 2008). However, there is a scarcity of research which actually “takes account of listeners’ own experiences and perspectives with regard to popular music” Williams (2001, pp. 223-224).

Research problem and literature

The research approach taken in this study is rooted in the current theoretical reference point known as Global Citizenship (GCED), which seeks to realize a wide range of learning outcomes that have the following aims: “Empower individuals to reflect critically on the legacies and processes of their cultures, to imagine different futures and to take responsibility for decisions and actions” (Andreotti, 2014, p. 29). In a similar vein, VanderDussen Toukan explains that GCED’s goals include
“learning about global themes, structures and systems; “world-minded” identity and membership; rights and responsibilities in a global context; diversity of beliefs and values; critical civic literacy capacities; managing and understanding conflict; considerations of privilege, power, equity and social justice; and finally, social action” (VanderDussen Toukan, 2017, p. 2).

An effective GCED pedagogy is one that encourages students to challenge assumptions related to inequality and social injustice and facilitates transformative learning. Transformative learning involves a change in the structure of assumptions or the “frame of reference” that students use to understand their experiences (Mezirow, 1997). This change, as previously mentioned, requires critical reflection, which “is the means by which we work through beliefs and assumptions, assessing their validity in the light of new experiences or knowledge, considering their sources, and examining underlying premises.” (Cranton, 2002, p. 65). Thus, the hypothesis of this study is that the protest song can serve as a trigger to stimulate critical reflection and discussion-debate on a specific topic in a classroom or group setting.

The overall objective of this study is to investigate the importance and value that a cohort of university students attributes to protest songs that deal with the 2003 Iraq War. The students were from the 2016-2017 academic year and were aged 19 to 21 years. There has been no study to date that tackles anti-Iraq War music from this perspective.

**Method**

A qualitative, exploratory and descriptive method was adopted, using the semi-structured interview technique. It involved qualitative research through structured focus groups, which enabled underlying information to surface which would have otherwise been difficult to access (Briggs, 2008; Duggleby, 2005; Vromen, Xenos, & Loader, 2015).
Students aged 19 to 21 years were approached personally and emails were sent to a list of 50 potential participants, explaining the topic in general terms and informing them that there would be an audio recording of the discussion. The final number of volunteers was 24 and three focus groups were formed. They received no financial incentive for their participation.

The rationale for selecting this age group was motivated by the fact that they did not live through this war as adults and therefore any possible bias arising from the influence of the mass media’s coverage of this war on the general public would be less likely. The participants were in their first years of primary education at the outbreak of the Iraq War and they would not have paid much attention to mass media; ergo its influence on them in terms of forging pro-war or anti-war sentiment is likely to have been minimal.

The focus groups took place in January 2017 at the Faculty of Education of a large public research university in Spain, which has a significant intake of Erasmus and bilingual Spanish/English students. Focus groups 1 and 2 lasted approximately 1.5 hours. Group 3 lasted approximately 2 hours as both music videos were analysed.

Three researchers were involved in the fieldwork and each took turns at being the moderator while the other two researchers observed and took notes on the discussion. Initially, the moderator explored the cohort’s perception of the importance of anti-war music. Subsequently, the respective songs were played according to preference (Table 2) and the lyrics were circulated after an initial open-ended question asking for their immediate reaction to the song. The following issues were covered: the song’s message and what it made them think and feel. The focus group discussions were recorded and transcribed in their entirety. To guarantee the quality of the data, the technique of researcher triangulation was used for the subsequent selection of extracts, their analysis and classification (Patton, 1990).

The results of this study are presented by quoting fragments from the focus group discussions and at the end of each exemplar quote the following participant identity code was devised: Participant (P) Nº1…10; followed by M (male) or F (female); group Nº 1,
2 or 3; and finally nationality, USA; ES (Spain); UK; IRL (Ireland); SA (South Africa). However, in line with Vromen et al. (2015), no individuals are identified in Tables 4 and 5 but the group number is included at the end of each exemplar quote.

Four consecutive stages were developed to carry out the study: 1) selection of songs in accordance with the criteria set out below; 2) Development of fieldwork; 3) Classification; 4) Study. The following criteria were used to select the song list reproduced in Table 1.

Table 1. Song list

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>N</th>
<th>Artist</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Year Released</th>
<th>Musical Style</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Black Eyed Peas</td>
<td>Where is The Love</td>
<td>2003</td>
<td>Hip Hop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Beastie Boys</td>
<td>In a World Gone Mad</td>
<td>2003</td>
<td>Hip Hop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Esham</td>
<td>No War</td>
<td>2003</td>
<td>Hip Hop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Lenny Kravitz</td>
<td>We Want Peace</td>
<td>2003</td>
<td>Rock</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Sheryl Crow</td>
<td>Let’s Get Free</td>
<td>2003</td>
<td>Rock</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Blur</td>
<td>Out of Time</td>
<td>2003</td>
<td>Rock</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Eminem</td>
<td>Mosh</td>
<td>2004</td>
<td>Hip hop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Green Day</td>
<td>American Idiot</td>
<td>2004</td>
<td>Punk Rock</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Green Day</td>
<td>Holiday</td>
<td>2004</td>
<td>Punk Rock</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>REM</td>
<td>Final Straw</td>
<td>2004</td>
<td>Rock</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Steave Earle</td>
<td>Rich Man’s War</td>
<td>2004</td>
<td>Rock, country, folk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Green Day</td>
<td>Wake me up when</td>
<td>2005</td>
<td>Punk rock</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>September Ends</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Dixie Chicks</td>
<td>Not Ready to Make Nice</td>
<td>2006</td>
<td>Country</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Iron Maiden</td>
<td>For the Greater Good of God</td>
<td>2006</td>
<td>Heavy Metal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Pearl Jam</td>
<td>World Wide Suicide</td>
<td>2006</td>
<td>Rock</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Tom Paxton</td>
<td>George W Told the Nation</td>
<td>2007</td>
<td>Folk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Linkin Park</td>
<td>Hands Held High</td>
<td>2007</td>
<td>Hip Hop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Pink</td>
<td>Dear Mr. President</td>
<td>2007</td>
<td>Pop rock</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Jackson Browne</td>
<td>The Drums of War</td>
<td>2008</td>
<td>Folk Rock</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Rise Against</td>
<td>Hero of War</td>
<td>2008</td>
<td>Punk Rock</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Green Day</td>
<td>21 Guns</td>
<td>2009</td>
<td>Punk Rock</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: US Billboard Hot 100, the UK’s official Top 40 singles charts, the US Billboard
Modern Rock Tracks chart; and the U.S. Billboard Bubbling Under R&B Hip-Hop Singles

1. The song release date had to be during the Iraq War era, namely, after March 2003.

2. A song and/or its music video had to make a reference, explicit or implicit, to the Iraq War or war.

3. The songs needed to meet at least one of the five criteria in Kizer’s (1983: 4) definition of protest songs as “(1) expressions of discontent or dissent which imply or assert a need for a change; (2) may represent the attitudes of one individual or a collection of individuals, such as members of a special interest group; (3) may be adapted by and utilized as ideological statements of a social movement, whether originally written for that purpose or not, and then the original composer no longer dominates as the message source; (4) may inspire the creation of other rhetorical messages; (5) may serve to stimulate thought, reinforce, or modify attitudes”.

4. It was agreed that the anti-war songs should represent a variety of musical styles regardless of commercial success in the charts; For example, “Hero of War” has had 30 million views on YouTube since its release date.

5. Inclusion of anti-war songs that appeared in the major US and UK charts during the Iraq War era.

At a preliminary meeting, the participants were asked to state which songs they were familiar with from the list, followed by which one they preferred. They were also asked how they knew the song, i.e., YouTube, Spotify, radio etc.

The participants were assigned to groups based on their song preference (Table 2). Group 1 watched the music video of “Wake me up when September ends” (song1),
and Group 2 watched the music video of “Where is the love?” (song2); whereas Group 3 watched both music videos as participants in this group showed no marked preference for either song.

**Table 2 Composition criteria of the focus groups**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Males</th>
<th>Females</th>
<th>Song Preference</th>
<th>Moderator</th>
<th>Observers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 (n=8)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Wake me up when September ends</td>
<td>TJM</td>
<td>JMEF RPEF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 (n=10)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Where is the Love?</td>
<td>JMEF</td>
<td>RPEF TJM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 (n=6)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>No marked preference for song1 or song2</td>
<td>RPEF</td>
<td>TJM JMEF</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Before the set date of the focus groups, the researchers met twice to analyse the themes arising from both the lyrics and the audio-visual representation of song1 and song2 and reached an agreement on the benchmark categories (Table 3), with the checkmarks indicating relevance to the respective songs.

**Table 3 Benchmark categories**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Inertia</th>
<th>Economic motive for war</th>
<th>Contested rationale for the Iraq War</th>
<th>The role of the media/ politicians</th>
<th>Connection between truth and love</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Once the interviews were transcribed, the analysis-study phase followed. The initial stage involved the simplification of the information, which comprised the following: extraction of the themes arising out of the data by identifying key words; editing of exhaustive categories, involving not only a consideration of the benchmark categories in Table 3, but also the inclusion of the new categories that were defined during
the analysis of the focus group data. For the new categories, a distinction was made between *adjacent categories*, which included relevant themes though they were not specifically linked to the lyrics or video; and *affective categories*, which included themes which were expressions of sentiment that were permitted to surface during the focus group discussion.

The data collected were allocated equally among the researchers for analysis and thereafter, each researcher proposed a codification of the significant themes. To streamline the process, after each researcher had analysed their share of extracts from the transcripts, the results were shared, and 96% agreement was reached on how to initially categorize the data.

In accordance with the overall objective of the study, the analysis phase consisted of meeting the following further objectives:

1. Investigating the perception of the significance of anti-war songs in the 21st Century.

2. Extracting the emergent themes from the participants’ interpretation of song 1 and song 2 and distinguishing the themes that could be grouped under the *benchmark categories* from the new themes that emerged, for which new categories were agreed on by the researchers, namely, *adjacent* or *affective categories*.

**Results**

The analysis-study phase indicated no differences between the responses of males or females, or between the different nationalities represented by the participants. Furthermore, a distinctive preference for either song 1 or song 2 did not influence the data that emerged. This was corroborated by the analysis of the data from group 3, which served as a control group, given that participants in group 3 had declared no marked preference for either song and watched both music videos. Therefore, the results are
presented in a single scheme, which incorporated the results of all three groups with supporting exemplar quotations.

Constituting each group on the basis of song familiarity and preference avoided the difficulty involved in participants having to remember an unfamiliar song and assimilate and analyse its content after only one music video viewing. All participants had heard the songs through both traditional and digital media: Spotify, YouTube and radio, such as the national Top 40 radio station, known as *Los Cuarenta Principales* (Spain).

In response to the first objective set out in the analysis phase, questions were asked to elicit opinions on the importance of anti-war music in the 21st Century and the use of military action to resolve conflict. The question *Do you think anti-war protest music is important in the 21st century?* produced responses indicating the cohort’s perception that anti-war music shapes the way we think and unites people under a common cause. There was also a statement about the responsibility musicians have because they reach out to all generations and a perception that creativity in music is unconstrained whereas journalism is less free.

The highlights relating to the aforementioned themes are transcribed below:

P6M/G2SA: “Yes, it’s important for change, social and political. In the 21st Century, music more than ever forms our mind and it’s surrounding us wherever we go.”

P4M/G3IRL: “Yes, musicians have a responsibility; they speak to multiple generations.”

P7F/G2ES: “Music follows you and influences you unconsciously. It’s important and always will be; it influences you and what you say; the way you think about war or whatever, like anti-austerity.”

P5M/G3UK: “Music’s a pedestal from which to speak to all generations and express anti-war feelings.”
P4F/G2ESUK: “Musicians speak through their creativity. Music’s a vehicle; journalism is controlled. Speaking through creativity is very important.”

P3M/G1USA: “Music has the power to bring people together to feel something against war or whatever.”

When asked their opinion on using military action to resolve conflict, all three groups overwhelmingly felt that dialogue was more useful than military action, though each group acknowledged that sometimes military action was necessary, especially when national security was threatened.

The second objective of the analysis phase strategies are presented in Tables 4 (song 1) and 5 (song2)

Table 4. Wake me up when September ends

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Moderator Questions</th>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Exemplar quotes by focus group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| What was the song’s message? | Contested rationale for Iraq War | There was much in the mind of US citizens back then: who was to blame for the attack on World trade Centre/Pentagon? The answer they told us was the terrorists in Iraq but that was a lie (G1).
|                     |                           | The song means wake me up when this is over, this terrible situation because the Iraq War, well the reasons never added up they said it was to get at Al-Qaeda but Al-Qaeda wasn’t in Iraq (G3). |
| Inertia             |                           | Sense of being trapped and there’s no way out. Nothing can be done so just sleep through it |
Wake me up means the idea of being asleep/not awake. He’s sleeping through it all. He doesn’t want to know about anything. There’s no fighting spirit, nothing left. It’s like, I’m done, we’re trapped. I just need to get over it. Not trying to fix anything. It’s like you just need to get over it; so wake me up when it’s all over (G1).

Sense of being trapped and there’s no way out and nothing can be done so just sleep through it (G1)

What did the song make you feel/think/
What are the themes? (this question was asked after a copy of the lyrics was circulated to each participant)

The role of the media/politicians
He’s been brainwashed by the powers that be to think war was the answer (G1).

He was hyped into thinking that going to war was the right thing to do. It’s to do with the propaganda because war was sold as the answer to get back at the terrorists (G3)

Glorification of US military
He’s duped into the idea military equals pride, money, a future. It’s a great opportunity; they get their education paid for when they come back (G3)

Compassion
We support the troops
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economic motive for war</th>
<th>This war is really about resources and oil. We all know that but whatever, I just want the soldiers to get home safely (G1).</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Is there a real chance to end war? No, because the real reason is capitalism, human greed (G3).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

for the troops and hope they get home safely- we’re all humans it’s not their fault; the war (G1).

War is so stupid. Iraq War based on claims of Weapons of Mass Destruction but I still want the soldiers to get home safely (G3).

I don’t support the conflict but support the welfare of the troops I hope they come home safely. (G1)

This war is really about resources and oil. We all know that but whatever, I just want the soldiers to get home safely (G1).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Moderator Questions</th>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Exemplar quotes by focus group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>What was the song’s message?</strong></td>
<td>Benchmark</td>
<td>Where is the truth? (G2). I think it’s saying that love equals truth; That’s the message (G3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Affective</td>
<td>The role of the media /politicians There was a media campaign of hatred towards Iraq and they tell you who the enemy is (G2).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>What did the song make you feel/think/ What are the themes? (this question was asked after a copy of the lyrics was circulated to each participant)</strong></td>
<td>Economic motive for war</td>
<td>The song says that the war happened so that companies could profit out of it (G2).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Inertia</td>
<td>I agree with the song. We have problems because people roll over and ignore problems (G3). People give in this is why we are in this situation – easier to accept things than fight back (G2).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Connection between truth and love</strong></td>
<td>This protest song is about lots of things not just war; it’s about love and truth, and tolerance. It’s asking the question where is the love? Where is the truth? (G2). Love becomes truth in this song. If we know everything, we can love. (G3).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| | Contested rationale for the Iraq War | We are paying for war, but we don’t know the real reason for it (G3). “A war is goin’ on but the
reason’s undercover” Truth was kept secret and swept under the rug (G2).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason/Cynicism</th>
<th>They [Black Eyed Peas] sang this and then went off to have the good life (G2).</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Love is being defeated by anger works there needs to be action to spread peace and love they [Black Eyed Peas] riled up nations /communities with “Where is the love?” but where was the action /solution afterwards? (G3).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I agree there was a lot of noise but it just died (G3).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The band [Black Eyed Peas] made so much money and now they have no interest in protest music because it takes ages to get these protest songs published (G2).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Protest music tries to change hearts and minds. They [Black Eyed Peas] could lead by example following their songs when they have our attention from the song. People were looking at them, but they didn’t really use the power they had when we were listening and haven’t released a protest song since (G2).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I disagree. He [will.i.am] is a role model so what he does has an influence: he does more now than when he was singing that song (G2).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Discussion

The results of this study concur with the hypothesis that topical or protest songs stimulate critical reflection and debate in a classroom or group setting. The key finding in response to the first objective of the analysis phase of the study – investigating perceptions of the significance of anti-war songs in the 21st Century - was that anti-war songs were perceived by the cohort to be important because they can influence thoughts and galvanize people.

Several themes emerged in reaction to both song1 and song2. These themes included a strong conviction about the contested rational for the Iraq War but at the same time a marked feeling of compassion emerged towards the troops serving in Iraq. There was also a widely held view that the media were effective in advancing the official pro-Iraq War stance. Other themes included the following: glorification of the US military; economic motive for the war; a sense of inertia; and a cynical reaction concerning the genuine commitment of musicians to bring about change.

The emergent thematic categories suggest that the participants were engaged and therefore, in line with the hypothesis, topical or protest songs were shown to be a useful tool for triggering critical reflection and discussion-debate. This type of participatory pedagogy prevents the reinforcing of stereotypes and encourages a more critical global citizenship education (Andreotti, 2014; Bourn, 2008; Brown, 2017). Furthermore, the existence of a considerable degree of content in the adjacent and affective thematic categories underscores the ability of protest or topical songs to stimulate discussion in a group or classroom setting but for this to occur, the educator needs to open up spaces where opinions can be exchanged freely (Andreotti, 2014).

In fact, the conclusions of a recent study conducted by Brown (2017, p. 14) among NGO practitioners in the UK and Spain supports Mezirow’s (1998) claim that educators facilitate transformative learning through a process of awareness, reflection, dialogue and action. Brown’s study concludes that GCED can provide opportunities for aspects of transformative learning to occur by opening spaces for dialogue through participative pedagogies. Furthermore, Brown’s study concludes that “… there is support
for the idea that developing awareness of tacit assumptions and finding a space in which to connect with others to reflect and discuss injustices provides opportunities to consider appropriate responses and create networks, which may lead to social change” (Brown, 2017, p. 14).

Anti-war songs in the 21st Century

According to the cohort in this study, anti-war songs were perceived to be important because protest songs can influence thoughts, unite people under a common cause and bring about change. This emergent theme is supported in the literature by Knupp (1981), Mondak (1988) and Kizer (1983) who argues that music “is a facile tool for proclaiming the negative, raising consciousness…enlisting support and inspiring followers” (Kizer, 1983, p. 8). Thus, listening to protest or topical songs in a group or classroom setting stimulates critical reflection and may inspire social action, one of the identified goals of critical GCED (Andreotti, 2014; UNESCO, 2015; VanderDussen Toukan, 2017).

The emergent theme that musicians have a social responsibility because of the influence they exert on their audiences indicates a connection to Shultz’s (2007) transformationalism approach to GCED, which suggests that all citizens are connected through a “common humanity, a shared environment and shared interests and activities” (Shultz, 2007, p. 249).

Another finding was the perception that creativity in music was perceived to be unrestrained, whereas journalism was less free, according to P4F/G2ESUK. This statement suggests an awareness of the well documented marginalization of voices that were opposed to the Iraq War by mainstream media, especially at the early stages of the war (Aday et al., 2005; Goddard et al., 2008; Kumar, 2006).

The contested rationale for the Iraq War

One of the key emergent categories that indicated critical reflection was the
contested rationale for the Iraq War. This theme does not emerge explicitly in the lyrics or the music video of song1 “Wake me up when September ends”, but it was an adjacent category that emerged during the process of reflection on and discussion of the song’s message that was triggered by the scenes depicted in the video. The narrative followed the story of a young man who enlisted in the US army. There were subsequent battle scenes in Iraq and a suggestion at the end that he was killed in action, leaving behind his heartbroken girlfriend.

In the case of song2, “Where is the Love?”, both groups also identified the explicit lyrics that refer to the contested rationale for the war in Iraq. This thematic category was a Benchmark category – “there’s a war goin’ on and the reason’s under cover”.

The cohort demonstrated a strong conviction that the Iraq War was started for reasons other than the claims made by the Bush Administration, although they were not able to verify where this conviction came from. It is possible that as the participants were growing up, they were exposed to the heavy media coverage of the findings of a report from the Joint Senate Select Committee on Intelligence, which critically evaluated the Bush Administration’s reasons for going to war in Iraq (Morigi, 05 June 2008).

Both songs clearly provided an engaging way to revisit a historical event and this pedagogical approach represents a means by which younger generations can remember and reflect on the issues surrounding the 2003 Iraq War.

Role of the media/politicians in promoting the rationale for the Iraq War was a benchmark category applicable to song2 with most participants signalling the rhetorical question “where is the truth?” However, in song1 this theme emerged as an adjacent category in the context of the discussion about the reasons why the young man in the music video decides to enlist. Several participants suggested (Table 4) that he was persuaded to join for both personal as well as patriotic reasons based on the post 9/11 quest to hunt down the terrorists who attacked the Twin Towers and the Pentagon. These suggestions can be validated by the work of scholars such as Kellner (2004), who contends that “...mainstream US corporate media, especially broadcasting, have become
instruments of propaganda for the Bush administration and the Pentagon during spectacles of terrorism and war” (Kellner, 2004, p. 41). However, not all media was a voice for the Pentagon and the Bush Administration. Journalists and editors of some media outlets did allow voices of dissent into stories from the outset of the Iraq War (D. Harp et al., 2010).

A case study among 11-year olds in Scotland produced similar critical reflections relating to the rationale for the Iraq War as presented by the mainstream media at the time. The study supports the importance of stimulating debate on controversial issues in a classroom setting. In this case, pupils were encouraged to bring in news stories of interest and the teacher would encourage discussion, openness, and debate on controversial issues, which included the Iraq War. The main conclusion was that “their reflective comments about the underlying causes of the war were illustrating their ability to engage in a critical approach to the evidence presented via the mass media. These pupils appeared to have a strong concern for human dignity, equality, and the need to resolve conflict diplomatically” (Maitles & Deuchar, 2006, p. 257).

The value of these types of participatory pedagogies is that they enable a more open and objective reflection on events, which advances the goals of a more critical GCED, as argued by previously cited authors such as Andreotti (2014) and VanderDussen Toukan (2017).

Empathy and compassion for the troops

Compassion for the troops in Iraq and a desire for their welfare and safety was a strong theme that surfaced in reaction to song1. Despite the moderators’ probing to explore the root of this sentiment it was not possible to ascertain with certainty what evoked these feelings in the participants.

Thus, despite the cohort’s strong resentment of the Iraq War, there were no negative feelings or criticism towards the military service personnel in Iraq. Indeed, after the first participant expressed the view that the war was not the fault of the soldiers there was a unanimous concern expressed for their safety and welfare.
A study conducted by Imber and Fraser (2011) among young British people indicated high levels of support and respect for Remembrance Day events, which honor the soldiers that have fallen in battle. This affective reaction suggests, in line with Shultz’s transformationalism approach to GCED, that “Wake me up when September ends” enabled the cohort to connect through a sense of common humanity with the troops, who were perceived to be merely doing a job and were not the instigators of this war.

Other studies have affirmed that certain pedagogical approaches –empathetic listening and dialogue (Wix & John-Steiner, 2008) as well as exposure and openness to alternative perspectives (Mezirow, 2000)- play an important role in promoting good practices in GCED. This was clearly observed during the focus group discussion in relation to the theme compassion for the troops.

The cohort was empathetic towards the young man’s reason for enlisting in the US army despite having reacted strongly when expressing their convictions on the contested rationale for the war, displaying an ability to critically reflect and then articulate these different and contrasting perspectives on the Iraq War. Furthermore, transformative learning was observed, as after the first participant expressed compassion for the troops in Iraq, explaining their reasoning, the rest of the group began to express the same sentiment by the end of the discussion.

The Glorification of the US military was an adjacent category and it surfaced in groups discussing song 1. There was a general view among the cohort that joining the military is often a means by which young people with scant resources are provided with status, prestige and a future as their college education is fully funded by the military. This rationale is corroborated by a study conducted by Sackett and Mavor (2003), and Kleykamp (2006) whose study concluded that “voluntary military enlistment during wartime is associated with college aspirations, lower socioeconomic status, and living in an area with a high military presence.” (p. 272)

The Economic motive for war

In the economic motive for war category, participants expressed the view that the Iraq War was waged for economic interests, namely the control of resources and oil.
However, the opinion was intuitive, rather than supported by evidence or facts. When the moderators probed, the result was “everyone knows that” and general statements emerged about the inevitability of war because some participants contended that war is caused by capitalism and greed. Jhaveri (2004) also observed that the link between the Iraq War and oil was intuitively felt by demonstrators against the Iraq War, many of whom were carrying banners with the slogan “no blood for oil.”

The economic motive for war category is a further example of how critical reflection may be approached and encouraged in a classroom setting. In this case, students would need to research and substantiate the claim that the Iraq War was solely driven by economic motives. This could be set, for example, as an essay or debate topic for the next class.

Inertia. A critical reaction

Inertia was a category applicable to both songs. The title of song1, “Wake me up when September ends”, was interpreted by several participants to mean a sense of sluggishness and inactivity brought on by a desire to sleep through tough times – war or disaster- and wake up when it is over. There was also a sense of feeling trapped, with no possible solution. In song2 both groups agreed that one of the themes was that not protesting and “turning the other cheek” (in the words of song2) creates more problems.

The emotionally charged and critical tone in which participants were observed talking about the themes grouped under the inertia category would seem to suggest, in line with studies carried out by Briggs (2008), and Henn, Weinstein, and Forrest (2005), that young people are very interested in political issues and want to be politically engaged, although they display a certain cynicism towards and frustration with traditional or formal politics.

This positive attitude towards activism is one of the key goals of GCED but connecting with others is the first step towards realising it. It stimulates awareness of and reflection on injustices, provides opportunities to consider responses and may lead to social change (Brown, 2017, p. 14). However, any reflection on injustices should include
thinking about the broader context of how justice is defined and the challenges inherent in making difficult decisions under pressure. Students would need to be encouraged to reflect critically on the historical context in which decisions are taken about going to war to fully comprehend such decisions and, thereby, have a more balanced assessment of what shaped the course of past events.

The power of musicians to bring about change: a cynical reaction

A cynical reaction regarding the real power of musicians to bring about change was an emergent theme applicable to both groups that watched the music video of song2. Both groups concluded that if solutions are not found and action is not taken by people, nothing in fact changes. Many participants adopted a cynical tone towards the Black Eyed Peas. The only exception was one participant who disagreed with the consensus.

The band had a number 1 hit with “Where is the Love?” in the UK singles charts in 2003, but it was their last protest song according to several participants and the impact they made was short lived, creating a flurry, in their opinion, and little else. Thus, the cohort recognised that ultimately to bring about change action must come from people acting towards the common goal of rejecting “anger works” and spreading “peace and love” –expressions taken from Table 5, under the category realism/cynicism-. This attitude coincides with the end goal of GCED, namely social action, as argued by Brown (2017), Andreotti (2014), and Mezirow (1998). Indeed, a comparative study of three UNESCO documents that make recommendations for GCED highlights that UNESCO (2015) “...describes and provides age-appropriate guidelines for three domains of action: actions that can be taken alone or together, responsible behaviour and local engagement.” (VanderDussen Toukan, 2017, p. 7)

The strengths of the study lie in the method and triangulation techniques used to analyse the data as well as the observation of the focus groups. The method maximized the accuracy of the analysis strategies and provided a means by which to minimize researcher bias given that three researchers were involved in analysing the opinions of students. However, it is not possible to eliminate bias completely from this type of study, even though it may be mitigated through researcher triangulation, because when
analysing the opinions of students, it is important to acknowledge the potential influence of the media and/or their personal beliefs. Moreover, researchers may be similarly biased, so the process of having reached 96% agreement among the researchers permitted some degree of objectivity in the analysis of the results. Finally, no previous studies have investigated attitudes to anti-Iraq war music among a cohort of university students and therefore this study could serve as the basis for future research.

Despite the existence of other anti-war songs from the Iraq era which may have had more powerful lyrics in terms of inciting anti-war sentiment, the songs that were selected for analysis were those that were both familiar to and preferred by the participants. As explained in the method, our rationale was that a familiar song would make assimilation and analysis easier after only one music video viewing. Forming the groups on the basis of the song preference criteria was also important because any criticism that may have emerged from the participants’ evaluation of the song could not be attributable to their dislike of the song. Lastly, the participants chose songs that were both popular and had commercial success. Both reached the top 10 in the US Billboard Hot 100 and the UK Top 40 singles chart, in 2005 “Wake Me Up When September Ends” and 2003 “Where is the Love?”.

Conclusions

A “catalyst for transformation (Cranton, 2002, p. 66) could be a single event or series of events or even exposure to a different perspective but for critical reflection to follow in an educational setting, a participatory pedagogy is necessary because it creates a trusting social context that opens up a space for reflective discussion. In the case studied, viewing music videos of topical or protest songs served as a catalyst for critical reflection in a group setting. Both songs formed part of the cohort’s cultural background and therefore were appreciated. They served as a trigger for discussion-debate and the evolution of thought. This was clearly demonstrated by the ability with which the cohort reconciled their strong convictions about the contested rationale for the Iraq War with an equally strong sense of natural compassion towards the troops and civilians caught up in the armed conflict. The result of this process led to transformative learning, which is the ultimate goal of GCED.
Introduction

The iconic anti-lynching song “Strange Fruit”, written by Abel Meeropol and first performed by Billie Holiday in 1939, emerged during what is known as the Jim Crow era in US history. As a testimony to the song’s ability to boldly represent this horrific past, Time Magazine named “Strange Fruit” the song of the century in 1999 (Sanburn, 2011) and a number of general interest books were subsequently published which explored the story of “Strange Fruit” and its important legacy to the Civil Rights Movement in the USA (Margolick, 2000, 2001).

Numerous scholars have documented their opinions and interpretations of “Strange Fruit” by analyzing the lyrics (O’Mathúna, 2008; Turner, 2016). A documentary was created about “Strange Fruit” in 2002, and mention was made of the song’s value as a teaching resource (Bakan, 2004). Some scholars have argued in favor of using “Strange Fruit” as a pedagogical resource in the following subject areas, although actual student responses to the song have not been collected and analyzed: history and origins of the Civil Rights Movement (Stone, 2004), ethics (O’Mathúna, 2008), and multicultural literacy to facilitate effective citizen participation (Banks, 2003).

Butler (2003, p. 21) similarly argues that “Strange Fruit” is a compelling primary source that “both influenced and reflected its age.” He uses the song with history students as a historical source portraying racial violence that was significant in galvanizing the Civil Rights campaign in the USA. However, student reactions to “Strange Fruit” are not documented. Stone (2004) provides a further interesting US perspective on how “Strange Fruit” could be used in the history classroom as a conduit towards a more united nationwide acknowledgment of the problems of racial divisions and racial violence, rather than laying blame exclusively on Southerners as the sole perpetrators of acts of racial violence. O’Mathúna (2008) uses carefully selected songs –including “Strange Fruit”- in
his teaching of ethics to healthcare professionals. He contends that ethical dilemmas typically provoke an emotional reaction and concludes that “music is an excellent tool to introduce the emotional realm into ethics training. It helps people articulate the feelings they have about different situations…” (O’Mathúa, 2008, p. 53).

There is very little recent research on how people, particularly young people, react to socially relevant songs, although we know from Meeropol’s account that when Holiday first sung “Strange Fruit”, the audience at Café Society gave her “a tremendous ovation” (Margolick, 1999, p. 98). The term “socially relevant songs” is used in this study to describe a song whose lyrics trigger reflection and reaction in relation to a historical event. In the case of “Strange Fruit”, the lyrics refer to act of lynching during the Jim Crow period or, more generally, to the underlying social issue of racial violence that the song tackles, which continues to be highly relevant in the 21st century. Furthermore, there has very little enquiry into whether these songs can evoke images and emotions which have a transversal pedagogical value in terms of encouraging the development of socially desirable values and attitudes that goes beyond the usual scope of a music listening or history of music class.

“Strange Fruit” is considered the most renowned protest song against lynching (Margolick, 2001; Turner, 2016). Protest songs are written to generate an emotional reaction that galvanizes people around a social cause. The importance of protest songs as a powerful galvanizing force for a social cause during the Vietnam War and the 2003 Iraq War has received much attention from numerous scholars. (Denisoff, 1970; Garofalo, 2013; Kizer, 1983; Mondak, 1988; Peddie, 2006; Rodnitzky, 1971). “Strange Fruit’s” lyrics are indeed “creative expressions designed to elicit an emotional response” (Kizer, 1983, p. 5) against lynching.

The question this paper explores is the effectiveness of “Strange Fruit” as a creative expression against lynching, and how the emotional responses triggered may be useful either in a cross-curricular context or in an interdisciplinary approach to the teaching of music for the advancement of socially desirable goals.
Cross-curricular teaching involves teaching topics or themes across various subjects in the curriculum whereas interdisciplinary teaching involves a multiperspective approach to teaching a specific subject. The National Curriculum Council in the United Kingdom defines these themes as “elements that enrich the educational experience of pupils... and include a strong component of knowledge and understanding in addition to skills. Most can be taught through other subjects as well as through themes and topics” (Savage, 2010, p. 10). Thus, a theme, such as environmental sustainability, citizenship or human rights can be studied in more than one subject (Barton & Smith, 2000, p. 4).

Beane (1997), one of the leading scholars on cross-curricular teaching, took the concept further by supporting the idea of curriculum integration around key issues with lesser importance given to defining subject boundaries. The significance of cross-curricular teaching, according to Resnick and Klopfer (1989, p. 33), is increased student motivation and engagement because when students experience an interdisciplinary approach, the value of what they are learning becomes clearer as they can apply their acquired competences to many subjects as well as to how they react to and operate in the real world.

Some of the current key international curriculum issues include values education and competency-based approaches. Moreover, it is widely held that education systems “must impart values to achieve a more just and inclusive society, must provide a variety of learning experiences to train a competent and active citizenship....” (Tedesco, Opertti, & Amadio, 2014, p. 527), which includes focusing on values and attitudes that show appreciation of freedom, solidarity, peace and justice.

Competences in the sphere of education refer to the expected outcomes of learning and they can be key, generic or cross-cutting competences, which are sometimes referred to as transversal competences (Tedesco et al., 2014). A study conducted by UNESCO’s Education Research Institutes Network (ERI-Net) Regional Study. UNESCO (2015, pp. 4-5) included the following values as examples of transversal competences that should be encouraged in education policy making: tolerance; respect for diversity; democratic participation; empathy; integrity; compassion.
These values can clearly play an important role in advancing social justice, racial equality and human rights. Competency implies a combination of practical skills, knowledge, motivation, ethical values, attitudes, emotions, and other social and behavioral components that are mobilized together to achieve effective action. Knowledge in practice is considered to be knowledge acquired through active participation in social practices and, as such, can be developed both in the formal educational contexts through the curriculum, as well as in informal contexts. Competences, therefore, can be defined as a kind of integrated know-how –Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OCED), 1997- (Rychen & Salganik, 2003).

The relationship between music and emotion has generated considerable interest among scholars since ancient times beginning with Plato’s Republic (Jowett, 2000, pp. 165-171). Hanslick’s (1974) seminal work, represented an important divergence from the notion that “the widely beloved and powerful art that has no other object than the form of these emotions. This art is Music” (Bonds, 1997, p. 400). Of course, that is not to say that instrumental music cannot trigger an emotion in the listener, but the emotion triggered is indefinite and not constant because the reaction may be different as time passes and among different listeners.

More recently, Thompson and Quinto (2011) provide an overview of existing theories of music and emotion, although they argue that there is no single theory on which all scholars agree to explain what specific features of music in general can trigger an emotional response.

The scientific literature in this area is extensive; while attempts have been made to establish a parallelism, for example, between instrumental music and psycholinguistics (Aiello, 1994; Jackendoff, 1992), as a way of creating an organizing framework to understand different musical phenomena, this has not been satisfactory because no models have been developed to explain the way in which instrumental music can evoke concrete images (Bregman, 1990; Palmer, 1997; Sloboda, 1990). Thus, this type of music is considered ambiguous in terms of the variety of meanings it can convey (Bharucha, 1987; Cooke, 1962; Gaver & Mandler, 1987; Lerdahl, 1988; Sloboda, 1991). Indeed, according to Green (2006), “the notion of musical “autonomy”, the idea that music’s
“true” meaning and value rise above mundane social and political considerations, is rightly discarded nowadays.” (pp. 1-2)

By contrast, songs, as distinct from instrumental music, are more likely to trigger a more defined emotional response due to the content of the lyrics and their message (Salamé & Baddeley, 1989; Serafine, Crowder, & Repp, 1984; Serafine, Davidson, Crowder, & Repp, 1986). Indeed, Green defines musical meaning as a concept that involves a dialectical relationship between two aspects: “inherent” meaning, which refers to musical syntax or the pattern created by the arrangement of sounds and silences, and “delineated” meaning, involving the extra-musical concepts or connotations of music, namely its social, cultural, religious, political or other associations. Socially relevant songs through their lyrics have the power to provide much in the way of “delineated meaning” in an educational setting.

Bowman (2005) identifies the following to be among the educational aims to which music may be suited: “transmission of cultural heritage; the creation and maintenance of cultural vitality; enabling access to experiences and understandings that are not commonly accessible through informal means; imparting critical awareness that gives people more power and control over their lives; […] creating personal and collective identities; developing tolerance, cooperation, and ethical frames for action; […] developing expertise and fluency in valued realms of human endeavour; and so on…” (Bowman, 2005, p. 128). The list, as Bowman points out is possibly infinite, suggesting the value of socially relevant songs for developing transversal competences in an educational setting.

In a discussion on the affective dimensions of musical-linguistic practices, Turino (1999) suggests that music has emotional power due to the specific qualities of musical and linguistic signs that can trigger analytical reflection as well as an emotionally rich experience. Moreover, Turino (2008) has categorized two types of music performances: participatory and presentational. The former describes a situation with participants and potential participants performing different roles, while the latter involves artists playing for an audience that does not get involved in music-making. Equally relevant to this study, Turino (2016) stresses the profound impact that some music-
making and dance occasions can have because they function as resources which are fundamental for habit change within individuals and social cohorts. Fundamental habit change is precisely what is required to develop lasting alternative forms of citizenship that challenge the status quo.

Historical Context

Knowing the historical context of “Strange Fruit” is fundamental to fully understanding the song’s message. One of the most significant events in the history of the United States was the abolition of the legal institution of slavery after the 13th amendment was incorporated into the US Constitution in 1865. It declared that: “Neither slavery nor involuntary servitude, except as a punishment for crime whereof the party shall have been duly convicted, shall exist within the United States or any place subject to their jurisdiction” (The Library of Congress, November 30, 2015). However, the Black Codes and laws passed in the southern states between the Reconstruction period to the beginning of the Civil Rights Movement in the 1950s restricted freedoms, exploited African-American workers and enforced racial segregation (Constitutional Rights Foundation, 2017).

This period came to be commonly known as the Jim Crow Era, a term made popular by Thomas Dartmouth Rice, a 19th century northern, white, minstrel actor who performed in blackface and shabby clothes as a slave in his act, “Jump Jim Crow.” As Rice gained popularity portraying a caricature of an enslaved person, the character became known as a derogatory term for African Americans. After the Civil War, the term became associated with laws in the South that discriminated against the formerly enslaved. The numerous and varied means that were used to oppress blacks during this era were featured in Blackmon Slavery by Another Name (Blackmon, 2009). Lynching was one horrific example of racial violence suffered by African-Americans. It was “… a criminal practice […] peculiar to the United States” (Cutler, 1905, p. 1) involving the extrajudicial and unlawful hanging and killing of black people by white mobs in mainly but not exclusively Southern and Border States. According to a study conducted by Tuskegee University, between 1882 and 1968, 4745 people were lynched of which 3446 were African-American (Tuskegee University, 2010).
“Strange Fruit” was written by Abel Meeropol – a white, Jewish, New York school teacher and a communist - in reaction to a gruesome and disturbing photograph of the lynching of Thomas Shipp and Abram Smith in Marion, Indiana. Originally published as a poem, “Bitter Fruit” appeared in the January 1937 issue of *The New York Teacher*, a union publication, under the pseudonym “Lewis Allan”. The poem was soon after arranged to music by Meeropol, renamed “Strange Fruit” and popularized by Billie Holiday following her first performance of it in 1939 at Café Society, New York’s first racially integrated nightclub. She started the song in complete silence, with the lights dimmed and a small spotlight solely on her, and ended it with the lights out as she disappeared. Already a well-known artist, Holiday’s popularity increased after her dramatic performance of the song.

Holiday recorded “Strange Fruit” for Commodore Records and the song remained in her repertoire for the next 20 years. The song has subsequently been covered by other artists, including Nina Simone, Diana Ross, Annie Lennox, India Arie. More recently, Nina Simone’s version was sampled in Kayne West’s “Blood on the Leaves” (Tillet, 2014).

As the first protest song that brought a hard-hitting political message to the sphere of entertainment (Lynskey, 2010), “Strange Fruit” became somewhat of a landmark. Stowe (1998) and Margolick (1999) provide an interesting account of the mixed reactions to “Strange Fruit” following its debut at Café Society. However, according to Meereopol, from the very beginning Billie Holiday “…gave a startling, most dramatic and effective interpretation, which could jolt an audience out of its complacency anywhere”. He wrote of her debut,” Billie Holiday’s styling of the song was incomparable and fulfilled the bitterness and shocking quality I had hoped the song would have” (Margolick, 2000, pp. 97-98).

Previously, African American protest songs needed to be covert, sung in code with hidden messages of protest understood within the community of the enslaved and their ancestors, but not by whites. On the other hand, white protest music was designed for specific purposes –political party meetings and public protests organized by labor
unions- and was more direct in its message. “Strange Fruit” was neither a song with a coded message, nor one that directly roused unity for a social cause. It was a different kind of protest song; one that shocked and haunted with powerful metaphor and irony. Baker (2002) writes, “No musical work had grappled so directly with the brutality of lynching before “Strange Fruit”. The text is exceptional in its selected gory detail” (p. 46) and Holiday’s gut-wrenching performance inspired by her own experiences with discrimination and segregation made the song even more powerful and “real”.

Universitat d’Alacant
Universidad de Alicante
Left. Lynching of six African-Americans in Lee County, GA, 20 Jan 1916.tif
Original publication: The Crisis magazine, April 1916, page 303. Immediate source:

Left. Postcard of Laura Nelson Lynched at Okemah, Okla, may 25, 1911
Photo postcard by G. H. Farnum. Mechanical reproductions at:
http://withoutsanctuary.org/pics_33.html
www.tulsareparations.org/FinalReport.htm

Capítulo 6. Cross-curricular teaching going forward: A view from "Strange Fruit"
Hypothesis and Objectives

The hypothesis of this study is that when a group of young university students listens to a song with strong social content, independently of whether the song is popular at the time of listening, the song’s lyrics facilitate not only the building of historical knowledge that may be related to the song’s topic but also the development of transversal competences related to the song’s content in an interdisciplinary context: in this case, history through music.

The goal of the study is to explore the impact of a song with strong social content
on a group of young university students. The cohort came from a freshman level general education music course entitled “A History of America in Song” and the questionnaire explored their reaction to the audio version of “Strange Fruit”.

The objectives of the study are:

1. To explore whether after a cohort listens to a song with strong social content an emotional reaction is triggered that can eventually facilitate the development of transversal competences.

2. To explore the types of emotional responses produced in each of the participants as a result of listening to Billie Holiday’s interpretation of “Strange Fruit” and having access to a copy of the lyrics.

3. To know if by using a socially relevant song in an educational setting it is possible to arouse a greater interest in the topic being studied, in this case the Jim Crow period of US history and how it links to the broader theme of the ongoing civil rights movement.

Method

Design and Information Sources

This study focuses on the audio rather than audio-visual representation of “Strange Fruit”. The reason for avoiding interference from visual stimuli is that the study explores whether the audio version, which focuses on the song’s lyrics as sung by Holiday, may have a cross-curricular application and serve to assist the teacher in developing transversal competences in a classroom setting. However, as detailed in the method, ICT enabled participants to access the online questionnaire and facilitated their participation at their own pace but at the same time in a controlled environment.

Forty (40) undergraduate students enrolled in a general education freshmen-level music course on “A History of America in Song” at a New England state research
university volunteered to answer the semi-structured online questionnaire. They came from a range of degree programs with majors ranging from Electrical Engineering to Political Science. The students had just started a unit on African American Music and participated in a class focusing on Bessie Jones and the Georgia Sea Island Singers. This unit also would cover the early 1900s and spirituals but would not focus on the practice of lynching which would be covered in a third unit on Civil Rights. Therefore, although the group was aware of African American music, they had not yet dealt with, at least in this course, the themes directly connected to “Strange Fruit” prior to responding to the questionnaire.

Participants were told the general topic and the aims of the research in advance and were read the following text before being provided with a participation code and the link to access the online questionnaire:

The aim of our research is to investigate awareness of and attitudes to the song entitled “Strange Fruit”. The benefits of the study include the advancement of knowledge in relation to awareness of significant social issues. You will be asked to answer an online survey questionnaire, including some demographic questions and further questions relating to your familiarity with and understanding and opinion of “Strange Fruit”. You will then listen to the song and will be given access to a copy of the lyrics to help you answer the final questions which will ask you to comment on the song’s message as well as what the song makes you feel, think and its relevance.

The questionnaire was answered in a controlled environment from 11:00 to 12:00 o’clock on September 29, 2016, in a lecture hall on campus, with a researcher present at all times. Participants accessed the questionnaire via their laptops or other electronic devices. A proprietary online survey software was used to create the online questionnaire and each questionnaire submitted logged a date/time at completion. Therefore, the researchers were able to ensure that only completed survey questionnaires submitted during the controlled time frame would be included in the study. The online questionnaire provided a link to Billie Holiday’s audio version of the song: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Web007rzSOI
After listening to the song, the participants had access to the lyrics reproduced below and proceeded to answer the five open-ended questions.

Southern trees bear strange fruit
Blood on the leaves and blood at the root,
Black bodies swinging in the southern breeze
Strange fruit hanging from the poplar trees.
Pastoral scene of the gallant south
The bulging eyes and the twisted mouth
Scent of magnolias, sweet and fresh
Then the sudden smell of burning flesh.
Here is fruit for the crows to pluck
For the rain to gather, for the wind to suck
For the sun to rot, for the trees to drop
Here is a strange and bitter crop.

Fieldwork Development

The three authors were involved in drafting a semi-structured questionnaire comprising a mix of open-ended and multiple-choice questions. Two expert researchers from the Faculty of Education also revised the initial draft questionnaire before it was shared among a group of American students undertaking study abroad at a Spanish university. The objective was to ensure that there were no ambiguities as to what each question was asking, that the multiple-choice questions were well designed, and that the questionnaire overall was well structured and easy to follow. For example, a “none of the above option” was included in three multiple-choice questions, reflecting the feedback received from this preliminary exercise. All three researchers agreed on the types of questions to be included and the final content of the questionnaire. A trial run ensured that the online link worked and that the 20-minute time limit set to answer the questions was working correctly.

The questionnaire was designed to meet the following research goals:
1. Exploring the impact of a socially relevant song from the past on a cohort of university students.

2. Investigating the relationship between student background and their awareness of and reactions to “Strange Fruit”.

Qualitative content analysis techniques (Jansen, 2010; Krippendorff, 1989, pp. 87-89) were used to analyze the data generated by the five open-ended questions which probed participants’ reactions to the song in terms of what it made them think and feel, their understanding of its message, their knowledge of the historical period in which it was set, and whether it was considered relevant in the 21st century. The technique of investigator triangulation (Patton, 1990) improved efficiency and objectivity in terms of the analysis of the data generated.

Analysis Strategies

For the analysis of the five open-ended questions, the following standard interpretation procedures were employed: data reduction, keyword selection, dimensional grouping of phrases, and exhaustive editing and classification of categories. One researcher, in consultation with the other researchers, carried out the first stage data reduction, keyword selection and dimensional grouping of phrases, whereas the exhaustive editing and classification of categories were subsequently done by all three researchers as a team. After several discussions, the researchers were able to agree on the final categories that represented the qualitative data generated from the five open-ended questions. The categories that emerged followed by their respective exemplar quotes and the participant ID numbers are presented in the following results section.

Results

Most of the participants were US citizens and European Americans although African Americans, Asian Americans and Middle Eastern Americans as well as those of mixed ethnicities also were represented. However, when we analyzed the texts, we observed no differences in the responses based on nationality, ethnic group, gender, or
whether the participant was first, second or third-generation American. Therefore, the results are presented by focusing on the categories and themes generated by the participants as a single cohort of university students all of whom were aged 18-25 years.

The results indicate that 23% of the group were familiar with “Strange Fruit” and most of them that knew the song (95.7%) could identify the song’s precise historical context, namely the Jim Crow period. Seventy percent attended a history class in the last two years (20% attended one more than three years ago), and 78% of the cohort recalled having studied the Civil War and the Civil Rights Movement among other topics, but the majority were not able to identify the historical context of the song as the Jim Crow period.

After listening to “Strange Fruit” and having access to the lyrics in the questionnaire, 10% made the connection between the song and its anti-lynching message when asked the second open-ended question about the message of the song. Moreover, 28% of the group were able to correctly relate “Strange Fruit” to the Jim Crow period when asked the first open-ended question regarding its historical period. The other categories that emerged in response to the question about the historical period of “Strange Fruit” include the following: Civil War (1861-1865), Pre-Civil War Period-Antebellum (before 1861), Slavery period, and Civil Rights Era.

The majority did not connect the song specifically to lynching. However, much broader categories relating to the following themes emerged in response to the second question about the song’s message: oppression of African-Americans/slavery, atrocities/violent crimes/hate crimes, racism/racial tension/racial violence, grieving for cruelty towards African Americans, remembering the reality of race related atrocities, and a protest song about the civil rights movement.

The exemplar quotes are as follows:

- *Slaves were treated very harshly while the public knew but decided not to acknowledge it* (P34)
- *The oppression of African American people in America.* (P7)
– To depict the violence associated with racial tension and the deeply rooted historical significance behind this continued violence. (P16)

– It depicts the horrors of how African Americans were treated …As for a message, I would say one of sorrow and grieving for the way an entire people were violently, and unjustly treated. (P13)

– The author is attempting to portray the sad truth of the history of Blacks in the south. The other message of the author is to show that we may think that a certain part of history is not very bad but in reality there is so much that can be explained in detail to show how horrible the event was. (P23)

– The song is definitely a song concerning racism. The words and meaning is very powerful. It must be a protest song in the early black human rights movement. (P31)

The remaining three open-ended questions 3, 4, and 5, were designed to meet the study’s second objective, which is to explore the types of participant reactions. The third open-ended question which asked the participants to describe what they felt after listening to the song produced the following categories: creepy/eerie, unsettling, disturbing, dark, sad/unhappy/despair/, depressed/gloomy, angry/disgusted/horrified, upset; pain, and guilty/ashamed.

The exemplar quotes are as follows:

– Made me feel somewhat uneasy. It didn’t make me feel sad, or mad, or even regretful. It just felt like a gory scene. (P20)

– My initial thought was that the song was very morbid. In producing this image of the mistreatment of those enslaved, they must use shocking and disturbing imagery to get people to react and think about these horrors. (P5)
This song is very sad and makes me feel angry and upset. It makes me feel this way because it was socially acceptable at the time for racist people. (P 9)

The song makes me feel somewhat sad that this is the history of Black people and this topic is what people had to sing about. It makes me feel guilty that White people, like myself would inflict so much pain on another group of people. (P17)

The fourth open-ended, question relating to the thoughts prompted by “Strange Fruit” produced the following categories: racial violence/white supremacy/Klu Klux Klan (KKK)/racism/lynching, graphic images of lynching, ambiguity of the song’s message/metaphor/title, strangeness of the metaphor/image, Black Lives Matter, timeless song/relevant today, powerful, disgusting, shocking metaphor/image, importance of remembering past acts of racial violence, and cover versions of “Strange Fruit”

The exemplar quotes are as follows:

- Images of lynched people in the south. Racial violence is something I am really sensitive to. I really hope that we can move forward progressively as people to a more peaceful place in society. (P3)

- Early America was a dark place filled with white supremacy. (P25)

- I just really thought of the KKK and how awful they were to Black people, and how much fear Black people have to live with on the daily basis. (P17)

- I’m a little confused as to why the lyrics talk about a strange and bitter crop. (P34)

- The fact that “Strange fruits” and “black bodies” were somewhat compared to each other and are supposed to represent the same thing shocked me” (P31)
My main thought was how weird it is to compare bodies to “Strange fruit” the song is clearly meant to disturb. (P14)

It made me think of the black lives matter movement because there are similar themes in this song that relate to what is going on in our society at the moment (P21)

The description of the bodies hanging as well as “bulgin’ eyes and the twisted mouth” makes my stomach turn because of how descriptive it is (P29)

I did not like the feeling of unjust death and murder that, for me, was depicted in the song. At the same time, it is a time period that needs to be remembered and understood. Learning is the only way to end social injustice (P16)

I thought of a new version of the song that I have heard (P28)

The fifth and final open-ended question, regarding the relevance of “Strange Fruit” produced a majority of categories that support its present day relevance based on the following reasons: discrimination/oppression/social exclusion/inequalities between races persists, existence of racism/racial divide/racial violence/hate crimes/cop killings continue, Black Lives Matter confirms relevance, Kayne West sampled “Strange Fruit” for his rap song “Blood on the leaves”, and highly relevant to remember the past and learn from past actions.

The exemplar quotes are as follows:

Yes. Racism is still institutionalized in our society today and needs to be addressed (P16)

I think this song is very relevant to what is happening in today’s society. I think that there still is a lot of racism still embedded in American society. I think that people who are immigrants or are of color are also
considered a strange fruit to Americans. (P19)

- Sadly yes, racial tensions have reached an all-time high... While this song mentions the great, beaten evils, it is still relevant to today, change the lyrics to mention bullet holes and gallant cops, and bam, it’s relevant. Which is a shame. (P26)

- I think this song is very relevant ...The fact that the stench of rotting black flesh is in the air can’t be avoided. Tamir Rice, Eric Gardner, Mike Brown and countless others have died because of the lack of humanity which this song addresses. (P35)

- Yes, I do consider this song relevant today. With the rising racial tensions in today’s community with the Black Lives Matters protest, it is clear that songs that address the mistreatment of the African American community are obviously still quite relevant today. (P4)

- Kanye West’s “ Blood on the Leaves” clearly takes a lot of inspiration from Strange Fruit, in a pop culture reference to the song. In addition, criminal justice against blacks is still a pressing issue in our society, at the forefront of our national dialogue--the song is still relevant. (P14)

- I do believe it is. It is actually featured on a popular artist (Kanye west) song. I think that the time period this came from was very important and controversial to our nation and should not be forgotten. (P27)

- I think this song is relevant today for the sole purpose of history. Luckily these horrible events don’t happen to people anymore these days but is an important part of our history that must be studied and remembered. We must learn from past mistakes in order to form a better future, and that’s what I feel this song is good for. (P23)

A much smaller number of categories emerged which supported the contrary
view that “Strange Fruit” is no longer relevant: not relevant now but historically important, not relevant, and not relevant slavery abolished.

The exemplar quotes are as follows:

- I do not because common lynchings do not exist but social injustice against certain groups does exist to different extents. (P8)

- No, I think the song was more relevant a 100 years ago, however it does have historical meaning and can be used to teach today about the actions of the past. (P6)

- No, because we do not have slaves anymore, although some people may treat others with different skin tones with disrespect. (P34)

Discussion

The results demonstrate that in general the students were unaware of the period of American history that is the subject of “Strange Fruit,” despite most participants having recalled studying the Civil War and the Civil Rights Movement. Furthermore, despite “Strange Fruit’s” significance in the world of protest music and relevance from a social perspective, the song was unknown to most of the students. However, the variety of the resulting categories clearly demonstrates that the listening experience of “Strange Fruit” could transcend a purely musical analysis and suggests the song’s potential role in developing transversal competences in a cross-curricular context.

The lyrics of “Strange Fruit” create a horrific image of lynching that triggered a powerful affective reaction of disgust, anger and even shame in the participants. Of course, this response was also partly provoked by Billie Holiday’s powerful performance, with her vocalizations, accents, and nuances, creating almost the impression in the listener that Holiday was singing from first-hand experience of witnessing the lynching described. Hobson (2008) argues that Holiday’s ironic tone in her interpretation of “Strange Fruit”
is in fact what turns it into a protest song, thereby “altering the political soundscape” (Hobson, 2008, p. 448). Thus, in a music class about American history and culture the variety of categories emerging in the results suggest –in line with the first study objective—that the song could be used in an interdisciplinary context, or to support the development of a cross-curricular theme, for example in history, politics, ethics, music and literary studies classes, thereby facilitating the development of transversal competences.

In response to the third study objective, and in accordance with Ainley, Hidi, and Berndorff (2002), topic interest and learning is linked to an affective response. In this study the participants’ potential interest in the topic of “Strange Fruit” is suggested by their strong affective responses and their respective comments. Even though most students had studied the period that gave rise to “Strange Fruit” (78% had claimed to have studied the Civil War and the Civil Rights Movement), the results indicate that the affective stimulus provided by listening to “Strange Fruit”, in accordance with Banks (2003), made a powerful impact. In a classroom setting this impact has the potential to lead to increased awareness of and commitment to socially desirable goals relating to human rights, racial equality and social justice.

The lyrics of “Strange Fruit” clearly provided participants with a strong emotional stimulus. Hidi and Baird (1988) state that “Situational interest” in a topic can be generated by the stimuli provided by certain texts. Several authors have established a link between high-interest texts and increased comprehension and recall in an educational setting including (Benton, Corkill, Sharp, Downey, & Khramtsova, 1995; S. F. Harp & Mayer, 1997; Schraw, Bruming, & Svoboda, 1995). A study conducted by Ainley et al. (2002) found that topic interest was related to affective response, affect was then related to persistence with the text, and persistence was related to learning.

Applying the conclusions of Ainley et al. (2002) as well as Turino’s (1999) argument for the emotional power of music resulting from its musical and linguistic signs to the present study, a student, who, for example, may not initially be interested in human rights issues and racial violence, after listening to “Strange Fruit” may react in the same way as the participants in this study did with emotions of anger, disgust, sadness and shame.
These emotions are likely to come from a sense of empathy towards the suffering of people of colour. This reaction, if followed up with teacher-student interactions, could promote greater understanding of the importance of and, therefore, a greater interest in racial equality and human rights. In fact, the findings relating to the relevance of the song, which are subsequently discussed in more detail, indicate that participants considered the song to be relevant in absolute terms, whether or not the lynching scene described in the song was no longer occurring in present-day America.

The sentiment, indicating a high interest in the topic of “Strange Fruit”, is captured in the following exemplar quote, suggesting that for this participant “Strange Fruit” has an important present-day relevance:

- Sadly yes, racial tensions have reached an all-time high... While this song mentions the great, beaten evils, it is still relevant to today, change the lyrics to mention bullet holes and gallant cops, and bam, it’s relevant. Which is a shame. (P26)

Thus, the participants in this study formed a kind of “cohort” in Turino’s (2008) sense of the word, even though they did not participate in the music making. Listening to Billie Holiday’s interpretation of “Strange Fruit” and participating in this study resulted in critical reflection on the song’s content and triggered a powerful and united emotional reaction against racial violence.

The results underscore the song’s continued power as a potential protest song that could serve to galvanize present day university students. “Strange Fruit” provides a gruesome reminder of racial violence and hate crimes against people of colour even to the first-time listener in the twenty-first century. Although only about a quarter of the participants could correctly link “Strange Fruit” to the Jim Crow Era and the practice of lynching, they all connected the song to the more general issue of racial violence against African Americans.

In line with the second objective of the study the following issues will be explored: the individual categories that emerged in response to the open-ended questions
about the feelings incited and thoughts prompted by “Strange Fruit; and, the song’s present-day relevance, historical period and overall message.”

The feelings aroused by the song produced categories which concur with O’Mathúna’s (2008, p. 52) interpretation relating to “Strange Fruit’s” discordant tone: unsettling/haunting /disturbing, dark; sad/unhappy/despair/, depressed/gloomy; angry/disgusted/horrified, and are expressed in the following exemplar quotes:

- shocking and disturbing images (P5), it creeped me out (P14, gives a chill (P24), horrifies (P29), disgusted in my country (P40), and this song has a creepy vibe (P32).

Perry explains that the visual image of the lynching is enhanced through the rhetorical device of “ekphrasis”. Abel’s lyrics and Holiday’s performance of “Strange Fruit” triggers the listener’s senses, transporting them to the ghastly lynching scene and provoking a powerful protest against lynching. Thus, “in developing the visual aspects of a lynching scene through ekphrasis, Meeropol’s lyrics and Holiday’s performance engage audiences in a way that encourages them to experience the lynching scene with all five senses” (Perry, 2013, p. 449).

The other affective categories that emerged – angry, sad, disgusted, horrified, upset, pain – in response to the question about the feelings evoked after listening to the song also suggest that the participants were transported to the horrors of the lynching scene. The second stanza of “Strange Fruit” presents the audience with pleasant and appealing images of the south: “Pastoral scene of the gallant South”. But the fantasy, sung in ironic tone by Holiday, is quickly shattered when the listener is immediately transported to the reality of a lynching scene—“the bulging eyes and twisted mouth”—a powerful and shocking image of the torture and suffering of the victims. Again, a sharply contrasting and appealing image follows, “the scent of magnolia sweet and fresh”, only

---

1 Ekphrasis, a Greek term for a literary device which involves a “vivid description of a scene or, more commonly, a work of art. Through the imaginative act of narrating and reflecting on the ‘action’... the poet may amplify and expand its meaning.”

https://www.poetryfoundation.org/resources/learning/glossary-terms/detail/ekphrasis
to be sensually overwhelmed by the horrors associated with “the sudden smell of burning flesh”. These sharply contrasting images of pleasure and pain appear to have heightened the emotional response –angry; disgusted; horrified– which indicate a sense of empathy for the suffering of the lynching victims and is embodied in the exemplar quote:

- *This song is very sad and makes me feel angry and upset. It makes me feel this way because it was socially acceptable at the time for racist people. (P 9)*

The category guilty/ashamed in response to the feelings aroused by “Strange Fruit” reflected in the exemplar quote:

- *The song makes me feel somewhat sad that this is the history of Black people and this topic is what people had to sing about. It makes me feel guilty that White people, like myself would inflict so much pain on another group of people (P17)*

is further evidence of the strong emotional and empathetic reaction produced by engaging the senses through the following lines: “Black body swinging in the southern breeze/ The bulging eyes and the twisted mouth/And the sudden smell of burning flesh...” Furthermore, the aforementioned exemplar quote suggests the song’s lyrics have produced an empathetic reaction towards the human rights of people of colour that have been totally violated by the image created through the lyrics of “Strange Fruit”. Hence, this type of response indicates that transversal competences, reflected in values such as empathy and compassion, can be developed in the classroom by using powerful and evocative socially relevant songs.

These findings concur with authors who have affirmed the impact of “Strange Fruit” on the Civil Rights Movement and the importance of remembrance and awareness of past acts of racial violence. Pinheiro (2015) discusses the link between jazz and political commentary, citing “Strange Fruit” as one of the first songs that openly described the horrors of the lynching of African-Americans. David Campbell (2004) argues that the very lynching photographs that inspired the song provide important evidence of racist
history. A theological interpretation of “Strange Fruit” is provided by Pramuk (2006), based on an analogy between the Passion of Christ and the suffering of African-Americans as victims of oppression and racial violence.

Thus, the visual image of a lynching created by the lyrics of “Strange Fruit” is an effective pedagogical resource that transports the listener-student to a ghastly lynching scene. As the results of this study have indicated, this horrific image unleashes an emotional response that would not only enrich the learning experience about this historical period but can also aid the development of transversal competences in a cross-curricular context. For this to happen, effective teacher-student interaction is required, which could be in the form of class discussion about the origins and importance of concepts such as human rights, civil rights and racial equality.

The question related to the thoughts prompted by “Strange Fruit” gave rise to the category strangeness of the metaphor/image and ambiguity of the song’s message/metaphor/title. The respective exemplar quotes in the results section suggest that the ironic metaphor produced a discordant reaction:

*The fact that “Strange fruits” and “black bodies” were somewhat compared to each other and are supposed to represent the same thing shocked me.* (P31).

Turner offers a possible explanation for this reaction in that the twenty-first century “first-time listener to Holiday’s performance of “Strange Fruit” must contend with numerous obstacles before appreciating the ironies that are at the foundation of the lyrics.” (Turner, 2016, p. 48)

Turner (2016, p. 5) contends that the “layers” of irony in “Strange Fruit” provoke “guilt, stinging pain or sadness” and applies Yus’s (2000) framework for understanding the intended irony in the song’s lyrics as well as Billie Holiday’s performance. Yus states that for every ironic communication there is a leading contextual source, which is the most readily accessible access point of entry to ironic interpretation. Turner’s (2016) analysis of “Strange Fruit” for ironic utterances makes several initial assumptions among
which the following are highly relevant: “...the listener has no previous knowledge of Strange Fruit, is aware of the culture of racial violence in early twentieth-century America…” (p. 50).

Therefore, the listener was assumed to possess the leading “contextual source”, namely knowledge of the culture of lynching. The cohort in this study generally lacked the necessary “contextual source”, an assumption that Turner deemed necessary for understanding the irony embedded in “Strange Fruit’s” lyrics. By contrast, the mid twentieth-century audience would have been exposed to the postcards and press photos of lynchings, whereas the cohort in this study would not have seen these types of images in the press and therefore connected the song to racial violence against African Americans in a more general sense. Hence, in response to the question about the thoughts prompted by the song, the category strangeness of the metaphor emerged, suggesting that the metaphor was not understood or particularly liked. Had the historical context been known, the metaphor would have almost certainly been better appreciated.

An alternative interpretation provided by Frankowski (2014) offers a different explanation as to why the metaphor was considered strange, confusing, or shocking, as indicated in the following exemplar quotes:

- I’m a little confused as to why the lyrics talk about a strange and bitter crop. (P34)/The fact that “Strange fruits” and “black bodies” were somewhat compared to each other and are supposed to represent the same thing shocked me (P31)/My main thought was how weird it is to compare bodies to “Strange fruit” – the song is clearly meant to disturb (P14).

Frankowski (2014) suggests that critics “must also think through how the song makes the normative violence strange and to see how its aesthetic presentation is also a type of political discourse with neglect” (Frankowski, 2014, p. 144). Indeed, the use of the word “strange” to describe the “fruit”, a symbol of the tortured hanging black bodies suggests that lynching’s were unusual, thereby neglecting the extent of this racist and extremely violent practice. The idea being that the chosen expression “strange fruit” for
what is depicted through the lyrics represents a kind of conflict between “remembrance and neglect” because ultimately, “the song cannot be a remembrance, because it does not disclose a content” (Frankowski, 2014, p. 159).

In essence, Frankowski (2014) argues that “Strange Fruit” makes no specific reference to lynching and presents the whole horrific scene with an ironic metaphor that no doubt made a powerful impact on audiences in the mid twentieth-century who were aware of the racial violence taking place and the practice of lynching. However, as suggested by the findings of this study, this metaphor is lost on the twenty-first century listener with no prior knowledge of the historical context of “Strange Fruit”. Frankowski’s (2014) critique of “Strange Fruit” suggests that the song alone does not serve as a means by which to identify the precise historical period in which lynching occurred: “This song is not easily explained in reference to this history. It does not reconcile this history, nor does it perform the work of remembrance” (Frankowski, 2014, p. 159).

While Frankowski’s (2014) critique is thought-provoking, it need not undermine the value of “Strange Fruit” as a powerful pedagogical resource in a cross-curricular context. Through “Strange Fruit”, students as a group can explore the Jim Crow period and react to the topic of lynching, as they did in this study. The historical context would be clarified during the process of student/teacher interaction, and the history of this period could thereby be accurately remembered by future generations.

This study produced categories indicating that “Strange Fruit” was considered a relevant song irrespective of its present-day relevance: *highly relevant to remember the past and learn from past actions; and not relevant now but historically important*. Furthermore, the results in response to questions about the song’s message and the thoughts it prompted also produced similar categories related to the significance of remembering the past: *remembering the reality of race related atrocities* (song’s message) and *the importance of remembering past acts of racial violence* (thoughts prompted). Thus, the categories that emerged from the cohort in this study suggest an intuitive acknowledgment of Santayana’s (1905) concept, “Those who cannot remember the past are condemned to repeat it” (Santayana, 1905, p. 248) and this was expressed in
absolute terms, that is to say regardless of whether the song “Strange Fruit” was felt to have a present-day relevance.

Frankowski (2014, p. 144) similarly argues for the importance of keeping alive the memory of the African-American past because doing so encourages animosity towards present acts of anti-African-American violence. The goal of remembering the past has an important educational function which can also be realized and reinforced by a cross-curricular approach to include the listening of socially relevant songs like “Strange Fruit” not only in history but also ethics, politics and sociology classes and general music listening classes.

Of the 23% of the students familiar with “Strange Fruit”, most of them (95.7%) could link the song to the Jim Crow period. This indicates that they learned about the song in a historical context. The inability, in general, of the other students to connect the lynching scene described in “Strange Fruit” to the post-Civil War oppression of African-Americans is a further finding of the study. Most of the categories that emerged in response to the historical context question erroneously linked “Strange Fruit” to the slavery period, the Antebellum or Civil War Period. Further research would need to be conducted to provide verification on how the Jim Crow Era is covered in high school U.S. history textbooks. For instance, students may have assumed that the song was anti-lynching and represented a broader period that included slavery, or they may have been more familiar with other terms that describe that period, such as Reconstruction, segregation, poll taxes, literacy tests, sharecropping and other forms of social, economic and legal oppression in the post-slavery South. Another consideration is that perhaps they were not familiar with the colloquial term “Jim Crow.”

Several other categories emerged from this study – atrocities/violent crimes/hate crimes, racism/racial tension/racial violence- indicating an awareness that the song’s message was understood to be connected to the racial violence and hate crimes against African-Americans and the civil rights movement. Therefore, the results demonstrate that there is enough relevant content in the lyrics alone for a first-time listener to make these connections. The findings underscore the value of “Strange Fruit” as an effective cross-curricular pedagogical tool, and this concurs with Bank’s view that Billie Holiday’s
interpretation of Strange Fruit “will give students an image and experience with the lynching of Blacks in the South that is more memorable than most textbook accounts” (Banks, 2003, p. 2).

Turning to the cross-curricular application of “Strange Fruit”, as the aforementioned literature has indicated, several scholars have cited the song as a valuable pedagogical tool. However, this study adds something novel to the existing literature given that it explores students” reactions to “Strange Fruit” rather than the opinions or experiences of scholars.

The findings also give rise to the possible approaches for using “Strange Fruit” as a cross-curricular teaching resource. For instance, the role of the history teacher would be to ensure that the student is made aware of the historical context and the practice of lynching so that the ironic metaphor can be fully understood and appreciated. In a literature class, for example, literary devices such as irony, ekphrasis and metaphor, could be exemplified by analyzing “Strange Fruit’s” lyrics in the same way that a poem would be analyzed. In politics classes, the song can be presented as an important legacy to the Civil Rights Movement. In this way, the students would not only be learning about literary devices, history or politics but also about the song’s important theme of racial violence, thereby simultaneously developing transversal competences relating to human rights, tolerance, openness, and respect for diversity.

Strengths and limitations of the study

The strengths of this study include the methodological approach and the adoption of investigator triangulation to minimize researcher bias in both the structuring of the questionnaire as well as the analysis of the results and the defining of the categories. The study also offers a novel approach compared to the existing body of literature on “Strange Fruit” which has tended to focus on the opinions and interpretations of scholars, rather than conducting research among audiences to gauge present-day reactions to this emblematic anti-lynching protest song. Furthermore, the study explores the implications of the results for education from the cross-curricular perspective as well as for the development of transversal competences.
The limitations of this study are based on the involvement of a rather small cohort of New England university students. Therefore, more studies would need to be conducted with “Strange Fruit” and other socially relevant songs to establish whether these results are transferable to university students in other areas of the US and other countries as well as to students of secondary schools.

Conclusions

British singer Rebecca Ferguson’s acceptance of an invitation to sing at the 2017 inauguration of President Donald Trump on the condition that she sing “Strange Fruit” was essentially a protest against perceived racist and far right elements of the incoming Trump Administration. Unsurprisingly, her offer was rejected. “Strange Fruit” remains a powerful legacy of the Jim Crow era that graphically depicts the brutality of racial violence.

A relatively unknown song to the cohort in this study, “Strange Fruit” nevertheless evoked anger, disgust, shame, despair and sadness in response to the vivid and horrific image of a lynching depicted by the song’s lyrics. Furthermore, songs like “Strange Fruit” –given the acknowledged link between affect and topic interest- can also provide the impetus for developing transversal competences associated with social justice, racial equality and human rights. Finally, this study has demonstrated that “Strange Fruit” can be a flexible pedagogical tool in a cross-curricular context because the song transcends the scope of a specific subject area.
Annex

Survey Questionnaire: Strange Fruit

Please answer the following questions and fill in the participant code you have been given. You have 20 minutes to complete the questionnaire.

1. Participant code no.___
2. Age:
   a. 18-20 years
   b. 21-22 years
   c. 23-25 years
   d. 25-30 years
   e. Over 30 years
3. Gender:
   a. Male
   b. Female
   c. Other
4. Nationality
   a. American (go to question 5)
   b. Other
      i. ____________________________ (go to Q 7)
5. What generation American are you?
   a. First generation (parents were immigrants)
   b. Second generation (grandparents immigrants)
   c. Third generation (great-grandparents were immigrants)
   d. Don’t know
6. Ethnicity (you may tick more than one category)
   a. European American
   b. African American
   c. Asian American
   d. Native American or Alaska Native
   e. Hispanic
   f. Middle Eastern American
7. Permanent residence:
   a. Connecticut:
      Town: ____________________
      b. Other (please include town/state and country (if outside the USA)
      _________________________
8. Degree program: Major
   ____________________________
   ____________________________
9. Degree program: Minor
   ____________________________
   ____________________________
10. Grade level
    a. Freshman
b. Sophomore  
c. Junior  
d. Senior  
e. Super-senior (5th year)

11. When was your last American history or culture, society and politics class?
   a. 1 year ago  
b. 2 years ago  
c. More than 3 years ago  
d. Don’t remember/didn’t attend a history class (Go to Q.13)

12. Indicate the topics covered:
   a. Early America (1600-1750)  
b. Revolutionary War  
c. Westward Expansion  
d. Civil War  
e. WWI  
f. WWII  
g. Civil Rights Movement  
h. Vietnam War  
i. Iraq Wars

13. What genre of music do you listen to most often:
   a. Hip Hop  
b. Rhythm and Blues  
c. Heavy Metal  
d. Other urban music  
e. Jazz  
f. Classical  
g. Other

14. Select any Social Movements you are or have been affiliated with in the last year:
   a. Black Lives Matter  
b. Occupy Movement  
c. Anti-globalization  
d. Fair trade  
e. Arab Spring  
f. LGBTQ Social movements  
g. Other  
h. Not applicable

15. If the above list does not include a social movement that you have been affiliated with, then please enter in the textbox the name of social movement you are or have been affiliated with during the last year ______________________

16. Are you familiar with the song “Strange Fruit”?  
   a. Yes (go to Q 17)  
b. No (Go to Part 2)

17. How did you learn about the song “Strange Fruit”?
a. Known as jazz standard
b. Popular song of social justice
c. Analyzed the song in a class
d. Read about the song in a book
e. You Tube
f. Social media
g. Other online sources
h. I”m a fan of Billie Holiday/Nina Simone/Annie Lennox
i. None of the above apply

18. If the above list does not include a relevant explanation then please explain very briefly in the text box how you learned about the song “Strange Fruit”

Part 2:

After listening to the song “Strange Fruit” and consulting the lyrics made available to you, please answer the questions below.

1. To what historical period do you think this song relates? Why?

2. What do you think is the message of the song?

19. Which of the following best depicts the topic of the song?
   a. Gender violence
   b. Racial violence
   c. Police Brutality
   d. Universal suffrage
   e. None of the above

20. Which of the following best depicts the period of the song?
   a. Civil War
   b. Civil Rights
   c. Great Depression
   d. Jim Crow
   e. None of the above
3. Describe how the song makes you feel.

4. Describe any thoughts that you may have had that were prompted by the song.

5. Do you consider this song relevant today? Why or why not?
Capítulo 7. Exploring “Strange Fruit’s” impact from a cross-curricular perspective among a cohort of predominantly Spanish university students.

As mentioned in the introduction, to provide some comparative data, the “Strange Fruit” questionnaire link was also shared among approximately 24 third year students from the English Studies degree at the University of Alicante, who volunteered to participate. The method followed was the same as that adopted for the study conducted among the students from the University of Connecticut in Chapter 6. The students volunteered to participate and of the 24 that did, all were Spanish, except for one who was South African.

This chapter presents the results, discussions and conclusions of the study.
Results

Table 1. A sample of quotes from the student responses to the questionnaire

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>What do you think is the message of the song?</th>
<th>Describe how the song makes you feel</th>
<th>Describe any thoughts that you may have had that were prompted by the song.</th>
<th>Do you consider this song relevant today? Why or why not?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I think that it refers to the period after the civil war when Confederate States have been forced to abolish slavery but they keep a strong racial feeling against negros</td>
<td>The fruit is the negro and he lives in a world that keeps him marginalized</td>
<td>It makes me feel sad, and I think it incites a huge sense of loneliness and isolation.</td>
<td>Sometimes I feel a bit like that when I see something that is not fair and people think it is</td>
<td>Sometimes we tend to isolate the different one so it’s still relevant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1940s. Because of the type of music and also the lyrics that we think are related to slavery and war.</td>
<td>Maybe is claiming for all the rights that black people didn’t have. They must not be slaves</td>
<td>It makes me feel relaxed and sad.</td>
<td>Sadness. And injustice.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slavery in the USA</td>
<td>Mistreat to black slaves</td>
<td>Blue and sad</td>
<td>Sadness, melancholy</td>
<td>Yes because its theme is still a reality today</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civil war because the lady singing is singing about the south where all the black people were used for plantation and abused and thought of as objects. And she uses strange and bitter crop.</td>
<td>That black people should not be slaves and they should be free like in the north of america.</td>
<td>The song makes me feel melancholic and sad once I read the words because she talks about something sad and disgusting with very beautiful words and you may not understand it the first time.</td>
<td>Why does slavery and all these horrible things still exist... We are made to study history to not repeat the same mistakes as the past and to make the world better and I can’t believe slavery and things like that exist...</td>
<td>It is very relevant still and you can fully understand it.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Discussion and conclusions.

Conducting the study among students from the UA (University of Alicante, Spain) was intended to explore whether there would be any significant variation in the results obtained from the study conducted among students from UConn (University of Connecticut, USA).

There were some differences in terms of the extent of the detail on the historical context and the richness of the words used to describe the thoughts provoked and emotions triggered, which are to be expected given that the cohort from the UA were predominantly learners of English as a Foreign Language (EFL), and those from the UConn were able to express themselves in their native language. However, this does not detract from the essentially similar macro result from both universities, which is that “Strange Fruit” is a graphic and horrific picture of racial violence against African Americans that continues to instill a sense of sadness among young people today, regardless of their knowledge of the historical context.

The historical context of “Strange Fruit” was wrongly connected mostly to the slavery period according to the results of participants from both universities; there was also mention of the Civil War era in both as a possible historical context.
Visualization of UA student ideas on the historical context of “Strange Fruit” (word size proportional to word frequency)

Visualization of UConn student ideas on the historical context of “Strange Fruit” (word size proportional to word frequency)
The theme of lynching and hanging surfaced to some extent among the UConn participants when describing the message of the song, but so many other themes emerged, as indicated in the results, such as oppression and racial violence. However, among the Spanish participants, the results suggest that they were not aware of the extra-judicial practice of lynching and “Strange Fruit’s” message was connected more generally to the mistreatment of the blacks and particularly, black slaves.

Visualization of UA student perception of the message of “Strange Fruit” (word size proportional to word frequency)

Note: In Spanish the word for black is “negro” and does not have the same negative connotations as the word carries in English.
Visualization of UConn student perception of the message of “Strange Fruit” (word size proportional to the word frequency)

“Sad” was the word emerged most frequently in the results from participants of both universities in relation to the emotions triggered after listening to “Strange Fruit” and reading the song’s lyrics. Although the University of Connecticut participants had a richer use of vocabulary, essentially the words sad, and “disgusted” and “disgusting” were commonly shared.
Visualization of emotions triggered among UA students after listening to “Strange Fruit” and reading the song’s lyrics. (word size proportional to the word frequency)

Visualization of emotions triggered among UConn students after listening to “Strange Fruit” and reading the song’s lyrics. (word size proportional to the word frequency)
“Sadness” emerged most frequently in the results from participants of both universities in connection to thoughts prompted by the song. But again, the results from the US were richer in terms of the vocabulary used and indicated an awareness of movements such as “Black Lives Matter”, and recent media reports on police brutality. Although the question was about the thoughts prompted by the song, the responses from the University of Connecticut participants remained deeply emotive and graphic. By contrast, the responses from the University of Alicante participants in addition to being emotive, also answered the question more precisely by including thoughts about the importance of learning from the past and questions relating to why slavery still exists.

Visualization of thoughts prompted among UA students by listening to “Strange Fruit” and reading the lyrics (word size proportional to word frequency)
Visualization of thoughts prompted among UConn students by listening to “Strange Fruit” and reading the lyrics (word size proportional to word frequency)

Participants from both universities shared the view that “Strange Fruit” was still relevant today. In response to the question of the song’s relevance, the issue of learning from the past surfaced in the results of participants from the University of Connecticut. Arguably this theme was felt to be important to both groups, even though the common theme emerged in response to different questions.

Clearly, the University of Connecticut participants, had greater awareness of recent developments, such as “Black Lives Matter” or police brutality, and they naturally displayed a more extensive semantic field related to race relations in the USA than the participants from the University of Alicante. Despite this, both groups acknowledged the relevance of “Strange Fruit” and the song was deemed to depict “a reality today”
according to the results from participants of the University of Alicante.

Visualization of UA student opinions on the relevance of “Strange Fruit” today (word size proportional to word frequency)

Visualization of UConn student opinions on the relevance of “Strange Fruit” today (word size proportional to word frequency)
Capítulo 8. Shylock’s “Hath not a Jew eyes?” An effective discussion-trigger for developing civic competence

Introduction

The use of English as a common language globally across many contexts – scientific communication, politics, business, aid organisations, NGOs, and entertainment – provides a multitude of opportunities for intercultural connections (Porto, Houghton, and Byram 2017), and for participating as responsible cosmopolitan citizens (Guilherme 2007). In the EU, for example, the most widely spoken foreign language is English (38%) with two thirds of Europeans (67%) considering English as one of the two most useful languages for themselves, and around four in five Europeans (79%) considering English as one of the most useful languages for the future of children (European Commission, 2012).

Nowadays, foreign language teaching adopts the communicative approach (Luzón Encabo & Soria Pastor, 1999), which recognises language as a social communication system where students are the real agents of the learning process. The approach uses the language being learned as the vehicle for communication in the classroom and the teacher’s role is to provide a stimulus that is driven by the learning needs of the students.

The European Union (EU) provides guidelines for foreign language learning and these are set out in the Common European Framework for Languages (CEFR), which describes language use and language learning as involving:

“…the actions performed by persons who as individuals and as social agents develop a range of competences, both general and in particular communicative language competences. They draw on the competences at their disposal in various contexts under various conditions and under various constraints to engage in language activities involving language
processes to produce and/or receive texts in relation to themes in specific domains, activating those strategies which seem most appropriate for carrying out the tasks to be accomplished. The monitoring of these actions by the participants leads to the reinforcement or modification of their competences.” (Council of Europe, 2001)

A growing strand of literature has emerged which argues that foreign language teaching makes a key contribution towards Global Citizenship Education (GCED) because it facilitates action at a transnational level (Byram, 2008, 2010, 2012, 2014a, 2014b; Guilherme, 2002; Osler, 2012; Osler & Starkey, 2015, 2005; Starkey, 2011). However, there has been little research on how these theoretical arguments are applied through the curriculum, and specifically in the teaching of English as a Foreign Language (Yulita, 2017). This study seeks to make some contribution to the research in this field by addressing the pedagogical problem of how to engage students and enhance their GCED in the context of developing their debate-discussion skills in a foreign language. It is widely accepted that one of the main objectives of learning a foreign language is the complete acquisition of the language. This involves not only the acquisition of comprehension and writing skills but also the development of oral skills, which includes the ability to interact in a variety of different social and professional contexts, as indicated in the CEFR.

The study was conducted among second year students of English Language IV—a compulsory module in the English Studies degree of a Spanish public research university-. The students were enrolled in a one-hour session per week over a 15-week semester. The learning objective of these sessions is that students become more confident and effective communicators in English.

English Language IV requires several linguistic based learning objectives to be achieved, in line with the CEFR, among which are included the development of oral communication skills by means of the following task-based activities: presentation of an idea; development of an argument; description of experiences; and actively participating in debates, which involves defending and refuting personally held and different points of view.
The Bologna process presented the additional challenge of meeting European Higher Education Area (EHEA) goals of “enhancing the quality and relevance of the learning and the teaching” (Ministerial Conference 20-15. European Higher Education Area, 2015, p. 2) and developing engaged, fulfilled and articulate citizens, one of the key roles of higher education, according to the Council of the European Union (2014). Thus, the published learning objectives of English Language IV state a commitment to work towards gender equality, to respect people’s fundamental rights and appreciate the value of contemporary society’s multiple composition. This study explores the impact of addressing these civic themes by using a controversial text as a discussion-trigger.

Theoretical context of the study. A review of the literature

More than a century ago, Dewey (1916) discussed the link between democracy and education, recommending that education have

“…concern [for] the deepest problems of common humanity. A curriculum which acknowledges the social responsibilities of education must present situations where problems are relevant to the problems of living together, and where observation and information are calculated to develop social insight which acknowledges the social responsibilities of education must present situations where problems are relevant to the problems of living together, and where observation and information are calculated to develop social insight and interest.” (p. 266)

More recently, education discourse has focused on the concept of “competence”, which describes a holistic model spanning a range of human processes and actions. It refers to “internal mental structures in the sense of abilities, dispositions or resources embedded in the individual in interaction with a specific real world task or demand.” (Rychen & Salganik, 2003, p. 43). In other words, “competence” involves a synthesis of all the elements and resources that humans possess to solve real life problems. It does not refer to skills specifically, although it may include them but is more about interpreting information and providing adaptive responses (Haste, 2009).
Civic competence, concerns knowledge of concepts such as democracy, justice, equality, citizenship, and civil rights and how institutions apply them locally, nationally and internationally (Hoskins & Crick, 2010). Furthermore, civic competence is a natural and logical precursor to active citizenship, which has been defined by Hoskins (2006, p. 7) as “participation in civil society, community and/or political life, characterised by mutual respect and non-violence and in accordance with human rights and democracy”.

Educating for active citizenship means, however, that teachers need to provide students with the opportunity to apply and develop what are referred to as “Soft skills”, such as communication, teamwork, autonomy, sense of responsibility, tolerance, the ability to negotiate a compromise, and creativity in problem solving (Black, 2018; Michel, 2015). Cooperative learning achieves many of these soft skills and the main conclusion to emerge from related studies is that students value active engagement opportunities because they not only improve their understanding of content but maintain their interest during class (Dunne & Owen, 2013; Prokess & McDaniel, 2011). Small-group and whole-class discussions have also received positive feedback among students (Cavanagh, 2011).

In this context, it is important to consider the goals of Global Citizenship Education (GCED), a transdisciplinary reference point, which seeks to realize a wide range of learning outcomes that result in civic competence and active citizenship. The main goal of GCED is to “empower individuals to reflect critically on the legacies and processes of their cultures, to imagine different futures and to take responsibility for decisions and actions” (Andreotti, 2014, p. 29). GCED covers a wide range of issues:

“learning about global themes, structures and systems; “world-minded” identity and membership; rights and responsibilities in a global context; diversity of beliefs and values; critical civic literacy capacities; managing and understanding conflict; considerations of privilege, power, equity and social justice; and finally, social action” (VanderDussen Toukan, 2017, p. 2).
Many of these GCED themes coincide with EHEA goals to support higher education institutions that promote the democratic and civic values associated with inclusive societies (Ministerial Conference 20-15. European Higher Education Area, 2015, p. 2).

Effective GCED pedagogy may lead to transformative learning because it encourages students to challenge assumptions related to inequality, social injustice, and racism. Transformative learning occurs when there is a change in the structure of assumptions or the “frame of reference” that students use to understand their experiences (Mezirow, 1997). For this change to occur, critical reflection is necessary, which “is the means by which we work through beliefs and assumptions, assessing their validity in the light of new experiences or knowledge, considering their sources, and examining underlying premises.” (Cranton, 2002, p. 65). In a classroom context, critical reflection and transformative learning are greatly facilitated when the teacher creates a participatory learning community. This environment challenges stereotypes and fosters a more critical GCED (Andreotti, 2014; Bourn, 2008; Brown, 2017). The “catalyst for transformation” (Cranton, 2002, p. 66) could be a single or series of events, or exposure to a different perspective that may potentially create a space for discussion-debate provided there exists a trusting social context. This process creates an environment where teachers and learners alike can contest their own beliefs in the “market place of ideas” (Cohen-Almagor, 2008, p. 236).

In addition to critical reflection, the literature refers to the importance of developing Critical Literacy (CL), a skill that involves challenging conventional stances on socio-political issues and enabling multiple perspectives to surface as learners react to cultural texts. All this facilitates the promotion of social justice (Lewison, Flint, & Van Sluys, 2002). CL theorists contend that cultural texts, including songs, novels, advertisements, conversations, pictures, TV shows and films can be explored to find out how they may influence our identity, cultural discourses, and challenge or support the status quo (J. P. Gee, 1986; Luke & Freebody, 1997).

According to Neophytou and Valiandes (2013), providing students with opportunities to develop CL skills by analysing cultural texts helps to develop the ability
to “read” texts from multiple perspectives. Through this process, students can reconstruct the “truth” that has been framed by the dominant discourses and engage in transformative action that may eventually lead to positive social change. Furthermore, if this is done through an approach described as the “hybrid flipped-classroom” whereby the students are expected to come to class already having read and understood the material for discussion-debate, student engagement and a more in-depth understanding of class material is likely to occur (Burke & Fedorek, 2017). However, for this to occur, students need to be committed to the active learning activity and invest some time in reading the material for discussion-debate prior to the class (Gilboy, Heinerichs, & Pazzaglia, 2015).

Turning to the issue of foreign language acquisition, student motivation is considered an important facilitating factor. Therefore, the texts or materials used must maximize student engagement and trigger reflection if they are to enhance vocabulary learning and enthusiasm for the practice of oral skills (Schmitt, 2008).

Hypothesis and research objectives

The hypothesis of this study is that a text with strong protest content becomes a trigger for critical reflection and discussion-debate in an English as a Foreign Language (EFL) classroom setting. This pedagogical approach would, in theory, have the dual benefit of developing students’ English-speaking skills but also, depending on the text chosen, the critical reflection and discussion-debate triggered may also contribute to enhancing civic competence and advancing the goals of Global Citizenship Education (GCED).

The main goal of this study is to examine the impact of a controversial protest text on a group of young university students. The cohort is from an English philology degree programme, based at a Spanish public research university and many of the students already have an upper intermediate level of English (B2) according to the Common European Framework of Reference for Languages (Council of Europe, 2001).
The objectives of the study are:

- To investigate whether a thought-provoking text of protest may arouse greater interest in the topic of racism in the 21st century.

- To explore whether the text chosen triggers an emotional engagement that may stimulate the development of civic competence and active citizenship.

**Method**

**Design and Information Sources**

Shakespeare’s Shylock in “The Merchant of Venice” is a highly controversial dramatic character, capable of evoking a simultaneous sense of compassion and contempt. Shylock’s renowned speech “Hath not a Jew eyes?” was selected as a discussion-trigger in this study. This text, for many, evokes conflicting emotions. It is beyond the scope of this work to engage in a review of the debate among scholars about whether “The Merchant of Venice” is an anti-Semitic play, though Cohen and Heller (1990) provide considerable reflection on this issue. However, there is no doubt that the play’s main character, Shylock, has the power to elicit emotions ranging from sympathy to scorn.

In his famous speech, Shylock, a Venetian moneylender, reminds the Venetians, Salarino and Salanio, that all people are human even the Jewish minority communities in Venice. A Jew, Shylock reasons, has the same faculties as a Christian, and therefore feels the same pain and emotions. At this stage, the audience would normally sympathize with Shylock, whose right to just treatment has been so greatly violated by the Venetians that he must remind them that “Hath not a Jew eyes? Hath not a Jew hands, organs, dimensions, senses, affections, passions?” (Shakespeare, 1869, pp. 47-48 Act III Scene I). But Shylock’s pledge at the end of the speech to behave ruthlessly, just as they have done towards him, and to even “better the instruction,” tends to trigger a less sympathetic reaction (Shakespeare, 1869, p. 59 Act III Scene I).
The participants.

The study method involved four structured focus groups so that underlying information could surface which would have otherwise been difficult to access (Briggs, 2008; Duggleby, 2005; Vromen et al., 2015). A qualitative, exploratory and descriptive method was used, with a semi-structured interview technique.

The participants were all second-year students of an English Studies degree at a Spanish public research university and were enrolled in a compulsory module –English Language IV- taught by one of the researchers. Many of the students already had an upper intermediate level of English under the Common European Framework of Reference for Languages (CEFR). As second year students they would not have yet studied the compulsory Shakespeare module, which takes place in the third year of the degree programme.

Forty-five students volunteered to participate, 26 females and 19 males, all of them viewing participation as an extra opportunity to practice their English-speaking skills. Four focus groups were formed, and the discussions took place in February 2017.

The participants were given the general topic and the main goal of the research in advance. All of them demonstrated willingness and enthusiasm to participate and received no financial incentive for their efforts. They were not given the text before the meeting but were each given a copy of the said extract at the start of the meeting and were asked to read it. (See appendix).

The focus groups lasted approximately 1.5 hours. Three researchers were involved in the fieldwork and each took turns at being the moderator while the other two researchers observed and took notes on the discussion. The following issues were covered during the focus groups: whether they knew the origin of the text; what they felt was the main theme; whether they agreed with the reasoning of the “voice”; what it made them feel; and, how to combat racism. At the end of the session, the students were asked their opinion on this type of discussion-debate approach that uses a text as a discussion-trigger.
Analysis Strategies

The focus group discussions were recorded and transcribed in their entirety. Researcher triangulation guaranteed the quality of the data in the selection of extracts, analysis, coding and classification (Patton, 1990). Analysis of the data was carried out using qualitative content analysis techniques (Jansen, 2010; Krippendorff, 1989).

Results

Similar themes emerged across all four focus groups, with no differences observed between male and female participants, making it possible to present the results as a single scheme with extracts serving as exemplary quotes across all 4 groups (Vromen, Vromen et al., 2015). The results are presented in three parts: the first deals with the question relating to the origins of the text; the second includes the emergent categories and exemplar quotes (Table 1); and in the third, the cohort’s evaluation of this type of pedagogical approach is captured in a selection of exemplar quotes from each group.

As for the origins of the text, the participants indicated a variety of sources ranging from the Second World War, the Holocaust, Anne Frank’s diary, Shakespeare and “The Merchant of Venice”. However, in all groups at least one participant came forward and argued that the language was “kind of Shakespeare’s language” and in two cases, a participant recognized it as an extract from Shakespeare’s “The Merchant of Venice”, although the text was referred to as “El Mercader de Venecia”, its Spanish title.

Table 1. Emergent categories and corresponding exemplar quotes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Moderator Questions</th>
<th>The Thematic Framework: Emergent categories</th>
<th>Exemplar Quotes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What is the theme?</td>
<td>Racism/ revenge / equality/ discrimination against Jews/ religious equality/ injustice towards</td>
<td>Discrimination leads to conflict. It’s bad. (G1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The text explains how a Jew and a Christian are biologically identical so if a Christian hurts a Jew on purpose, the Jew will do the same. (G2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>It’s about how Jews were treated in an inhuman way and they are seeking revenge.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Jews

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Do you agree with the reasoning? Why or why not?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Yes:</strong> racial equality/revenge is a human reaction.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>No:</strong> revenge is destructive, counterproductive.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reasoning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>It’s about racism and discrimination. (G4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is a difficult position, but I think in part he or she is right because we all have the same rights. But I don’t think revenge is a solution but education and tolerance is. (G1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I don’t agree because it ends up with revenge and then in the end you become what you were against. (G2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No, I don’t agree because I think we should at least try to be morally superior to the enemy and not give in to dark corruptive feelings like anger or revenge. (G3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I half agree, and half disagree because I think if someone harms you, you should be able to defend yourself, it’s normal, but I also don’t think that revenge should be the answer. (G4)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What does the text make you feel?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sad/ disappointed/hate for injustice/uncomfortable/angry/confused/sympathy/concerned/conflicted/ashamed/motivation to react against racism.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It makes me feel bad and sad when I think about the suffering of people during the Holocaust. How can we, like we’re all humans, be so cruel to each other. (G1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am disappointed with the voice’s solution because the solution is education and tolerance. (G2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It makes me feel really awkward because I hate injustice and don’t know how to react to it. (G1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>You need to react by stopping racism in everyday life…like you see a kid in the patio bullying a coloured kid who new and the teacher needs to punish the bully and stop it. (G1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel concerned because it’s something that happens nowadays. (G3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I’m conflicted because I don’t agree with revenge but understand the voice’s point of view. (G3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I’m angry with people who don’t have tolerance towards different religions or cultures or races. (G4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel ashamed that we could do this to each other and also it’s stupid because revenge and violence is a circle that never ends and we are just hurting each other…. Makes no sense ’coz we are all humans. (G4)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
How can you try and stop racism? Not revenge/education/tolerance/respect for other cultures/empathy/protest

It starts with education at home and at school. Kids need to see it’s wrong to be racist because it can be difficult to change people’s minds when they get older. (G1)

You need to teach children about respect for other people’s beliefs and to have empathy, everyone needs to feel like they are a community. (G2)

You need to talk and teach the oppressors.... Like... a transgender person is not diseased. (G3)

Revenge is not a solution. This is how wars begin because it never stops and leads to more injustice. (G4)

We need to protest against every type of discrimination, sexual, religious and racial. (G4)

We need to fight with protest not with violence. (G3)

The students were asked at the end of the focus group if they would like to use these types of cultural texts –including newspaper articles and opinion pages, topical or protest songs- for reflection and discussion-debate and there was overwhelming support for this approach by all participants; a few exemplary comments clearly indicate the positive feedback:

– “It’s interesting and makes you think and then you wanna talk about it in English, so I talk more and practice.” Spanish male participant 3 (Group 1)

– “Yes, it makes me to talk because I wanna give my opinion so I’m doing that in English and that’s good.” Spanish female participant (Group 2)

– “It’s great to talk about these things in English 'cos it’s an important language nowadays for everything.” Spanish female participant (Group 3)

– “It makes you think and talk about things like racism and discrimination
and how to stop it.” Spanish male participant (Group 1)

- “Yes, I like it. But can we discuss slam poetry and rap ‘coz it opens a different world.” Spanish female participant (Group 4)

- “It is interesting to talk about these things, so it makes you wanna talk and express your opinion” Spanish female participant (Group 2)

- “At first, I was a bit nervous to talk because of my level but when I saw my classmates talking I started to talk too, why not...and that was good for my confidence.” Spanish male participant (Group 4)

- “It’s good practice to talk in that moment with no notes or power point; it’s more like, real.” Spanish female participant (Group 3)

Visualization of reaction to the use of Shylock’s speech “Hath not a Jew eyes?”
Discussion

The study has shown that this type of pedagogical intervention has a twofold benefit. Firstly, the student develops civic competences associated with GCED and secondly, the learner-centred focus was positively received by this cohort of EFL students as evidenced by the evaluation comments. This type of activity gave them the opportunity to practise their English-speaking skills and the students viewed this as helpful towards gaining more confidence in articulating their views in English.

The key civic themes that emerged focussed on the importance of religious tolerance, racial equality and the futility of revenge. Revenge was strongly rejected as a means by which to resolve social injustice because it was considered to fuel conflict even further. The cohort detected Shylock’s vehement protest against the antisemitism he experienced, and they made connections to the Holocaust and the Second World War. Strong emotions of compassion, anger and sadness were evoked for what the Jewish people suffered. Many GCED themes related to civic competence and active citizenship, such as education towards tolerance and peaceful protest, were manifested in the discussion that followed the question on how to stop racism and other types of discrimination.

Emergent themes:

Shylock’s renowned “Hath not a Jew eyes?” speech, though relatively unknown to the cohort, was able to provoke a great deal of discussion around the subject of racism, religious intolerance and the issue of revenge, which is invoked by Shylock to deal with the social injustice he suffered because of antisemitism. The results indicated a consensus that religious freedom and tolerance are fundamentally important. These core values are embedded in the literature related to GCED and are present, according to VanderDussen VanderDussen Toukan’s (2017, p. 1) comparative analysis of the three key United Nations (UN) and United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO, 2015) documents that “…frame the content and pedagogy of global citizenship education…”
The cohort addressed Shylock’s intense desire for revenge with a tremendous amount of compassion for the suffering of the Jewish people. This was clearly reflected in the support for and sympathy towards Shylock’s emotional and bitter protest about not being treated humanely simply because he was a Jew. However, at the same time there was a rejection of Shylock’s vitriolic pledge to use revenge and outdo his enemies in his retaliation as a means of redress. This was considered morally wrong by the cohort for a number of reasons: “revenge is not a solution but education and tolerance is; revenge results in becoming what you were against; revenge and violence is a circle that never ends; and revenge is dark and corruptive” (see Table I). This type of moral reasoning indicates that the text triggered critical reflection as the cohort was able to reconcile the conflicting opinions that emerged; i.e., support for Shylock’s protest but rejection of Shylock’s revenge as a constructive solution.

The emergent categories – uncomfortable, confused and conflicted- suggest that the text advanced the GCED aims related to critical reflection and critical literacy (CL). This is because contrasting perspectives emerged in response to Shylock’s desire for revenge, and this is a key impact of CL, according to Neophytou and Valianides (2013), J. P. Gee (1986) and Luke and Freebody (1997).

Furthermore, the UNESCO (2015) document advocates that “critical thinking is linked to values of fairness and social justice, and skills to analyse inequalities, with additional emphasis on critical literacy, inquiry and analysis” (VanderDussen Toukan, 2017, p. 7). Indeed, most participants understood the rationale for Shylock’s revenge but did not agree that it was a strategy that would achieve social justice: “Revenge is not a solution; This is how wars begin; It never stops and leads to more injustice.” (See Table I).

The reasoning that emerged during the focus groups in response to Shylock’s desire for revenge amounts to the kind of critical reflection that the CL and GCED theorists advocate as being the beneficial outcomes of a more critical GCED (Andreotti, 2014), mainly because problems are approached from in-depth and multiple perspectives. Furthermore, the category concerned referred to the fact the text was perceived to be describing something that is relevant today, that is, discrimination and racial violence
persist. “I feel concerned because it’s something that happens nowadays.” (G3). This issue could be taken up and developed further in a subsequent classroom setting through discussion-debate in response to other texts related to civil rights issues in the US, for example.

**Affect and civic competence**

The text evoked emotions of sadness, anger, and even shame, “It makes me feel sad” (see Table 1). When probed as to why this sense of shame and sadness, given that they are not responsible for what happened to the Jewish people during the Holocaust, the explanation given was that as human beings they felt ashamed that fellow humans would want to inflict such cruelty and injustice on others. Implicit in this reaction is the sense of belonging to a single global community of shared moral values based on human rights and social justice, and when this is violated, it somehow reflects badly on all of humankind. This notion of belonging to a global community reflects an important goal of GCED. The observed emotional engagement of the students on this issue, and their expressed connection with their fellow human beings

“…reflects an understanding that in order to create communities (local and global) that are just, democratic, and sustainable, citizens must understand their connection to all other people through a common humanity, a shared environment, and shared interests and activities.” (Shultz, 2007, p. 249).

The text used in this study provided the impetus for developing the civic competences associated with democratic values –social justice, racial equality and human rights- because the evolving discussion linked the emotions evoked through the text with the cohort’s interest in racism. The link between emotion and topic interest has been demonstrated in several studies (Ainley et al., 2002; Esteve-Faubel, Martin, & Junda, 2018; Hidi & Baird, 1988; Yulita, 2017). Moreover, interactivity with peers and with lecturers has also been shown to improve emotional academic engagement –EAE-, which boosts group interaction and individual performance (Nkhoma, Sriratanaviriyakul, & Quang, 2017).
In the present study, a relatively unknown text to the cohort nevertheless evoked emotions of anger, sadness and compassion for the discrimination suffered by the Jewish people. Furthermore, Shylock’s powerful protest against antisemitism was detected by the participants, many of whom connected it to the Holocaust.

The exemplar quote “It makes me feel really awkward because I hate injustice and don’t know how to react to it” led to some noteworthy observations (see Table 1). The cohort reacted strongly to the above statement of not knowing how to react to injustice with suggestions that teachers can do a lot to curtail racism and any other kind of discrimination by stopping it whenever they see it in the playground (see Table 1). The exchange observed was indicative of emotional academic engagement, and it led to a consensus that reacting against discrimination in any social context was deemed to be the morally right thing to do. Once more, this response is consistent with the broader goals of a more critical GCED that can lead to transformative learning, social action and active citizenship (Andreotti, 2014; Michel, 2015).

The emotional reaction triggered by the text was followed by several ideas that were put forward by the cohort for dealing with racism. These ideas suggest the cohort’s perceived need for a more active citizenship. The themes that emerged – not revenge/education/tolerance/respect for other cultures/empathy/protest (Table 1) – indicated that many of the core values associated with GCED, such as respect for diversity of beliefs, racial equality, considerations of equity, social justice, and social action (VanderDussen Toukan, 2017, p. 2), and the civic competence promoted by the EHEA’s Bologna process, were being elicited and then reinforced by using Shylock’s renowned speech.

Future implementation.

The findings of the focus groups demonstrate that this type of active learning activity received positive feedback from the cohort. According to several scholars, the opinions and experiences of students after having actively worked a topic in a participatory learning environment are very valuable because they contribute to identifying and proposing new educational strategies that favour quality, attractiveness to
students, and employability (Reichert & Tauch, 2003; Sursock, Smidt, & Davies, 2010).

Therefore, these types of discussion-debate activities have been implemented in the English Language IV module (Martin, 2018-19). Newspaper articles, opinion pages, slam poetry and songs are used as a discussion-trigger to develop the English-speaking skills of EFL learners. The pedagogical approach involves the teacher formulating a short statement in response to the chosen text.

The “think-pair-share” method is adopted, whereby the students autonomously develop a contrary stance with their partner in relation to the statement and then report their partner’s view to the rest of the class. This is done to practise the third person singular conjugation and ensure the pronunciation of the “s”, which is often omitted by native-Spanish speakers. The session concludes with a plenary activity, which summarises the main arguments presented. It is widely accepted that debate-discussion activities provide an opportunity for the development of oral presentation skills. Furthermore, practising these skills and improving from the feedback received from lecturers is acknowledged to be highly beneficial for effective communication in future workplace situations (Tsang, 2017).

The didactic materials –in this study the text used and discussions around it- are one of the pillars of continuous learning, and their design by the teacher and use by the student generate a work dynamic that is learner-centred, resulting in the student evolving from a passive subject to an active one.

This educational approach responds to the need for autonomous learning that has been promoted by the creation of the EHEA and the system of the ECTS (The Bologna Declaration, 1999; UNESCO, 1998), and other declarations by official bodies that recommend teaching by competences, lifelong learning, and the creation of a knowledge economy (Lisbon Summit, 2000; Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development, 2007; UNESCO, 1998). The Tuning Project (González & Wagenaar, 2003) specifically focuses on educational structures, with emphasis placed on the subject area level, i.e., the content of studies, which is deemed to be the responsibility of higher education institutions and their academic staff. Thus, it is within the teacher’s remit to
design and provide resources that the student uses to work autonomously and to achieve learning that involves using skills to organize, create and interpret information (Monereo i Font & Pozo, 2003).

Through these types of discussion-debate learning activities, students of EFL, or indeed other foreign/second languages, develop self-awareness of their speaking achievements and progress with greater confidence in articulating their ideas in the language being learned. This learner-centred approach encourages students to speak to the group, after self-reflection and interaction with their partner. In this way learning happens through the practice of oral skills in a participatory environment.

The role of the teacher, in line with the Tuning Project, is to provide comprehensible and meaningful input (i.e., the text and the debate statement), to encourage and facilitate, by sometimes acting as interlocutor, the interaction of each student with their partner and with the rest of the class. This educational intervention involves constant teacher-student feedback as the teacher circulates among the students, and the feedback contributes significantly to enhancing the acquisition of English-speaking skills. A study that investigated EFL students’ self-assessment of oral performance demonstrated that through feedback and practice, participating students made significant progress in learning to assess their own oral performance and this helped them achieve their set learning goals (Yuh-Mei, 2008).

Conclusions

The use of thought-provoking texts along with the think-pair-share method has been incorporated into the pedagogical method used in the English Language IV module (oral sessions), given the positive feedback received from the cohort in this study.

The findings of the study support the hypothesis that a text with strong protest content becomes a trigger for critical reflection and discussion-debate in an English as a Foreign Language (EFL) classroom setting. This study’s results served as the impetus to introduce GCED, the transdisciplinary reference point, into an EFL context, and the overall findings suggest that GCED themes generated student interest and triggered
Therefore, a similar approach could be applied to the teaching of a second language, for example. This cooperative learning approach has the dual benefit of engaging learners with topics of interest, whilst at the same time enhancing their confidence as they are given the opportunity to become more proficient in their debate-discussion skills, in this case using English as the vehicular language.

Appendix.

The extract that was distributed among the participants during the focus groups is reproduced below. However, the reference was omitted.

“He hath disgraced me, and hindered me half a million, laughed at my losses, mocked at my gains, scorned my nation, thwarted my bargains, cooled my friends, heated mine enemies; and what’s his reason? I am a Jew. Hath not a Jew eyes? Hath not a Jew hands, organs, dimensions, senses, affections, passions? Fed with the same food, hurt with the same weapons, subject to the same means, warmed and cooled by the same winter and summer, as a Christian is? If you prick us, do we not bleed? If you tickle us, do we not laugh? If you poison us, do we not die? And if you wrong us, shall we not revenge? If we are like you in the rest, we will resemble you in that. If a Jew wrong a Christian, what is his humility? Revenge. If a Christian wrong a Jew, what should his sufferance be by Christian example? Why, revenge. The villainy you teach me I will execute, and it shall go hard but I will better the instruction.” (Shakespeare, 1869, pp. 36-37 Act III Scene I 52-59)
Capítulo 9. La formación de competencias cívicas utilizando un texto con fuerte contenido de protesta usando el inglés como lengua vehicular del debate.

Introducción

El uso del inglés como un idioma común a nivel mundial en muchos contextos que van desde la comunicación científica hasta el entretenimiento brinda oportunidades para conexiones interculturales (Porto, Houghton, & Byram, 2017) y para participar como ciudadanos cosmopolitas responsables (Guilherme, 2007).

En la actualidad, la enseñanza de la lengua extranjera adopta el enfoque comunicativo (Luzón Encabo & Soria Pastor, 1999), donde ese lenguaje es el vehículo para la comunicación en el aula entre los agentes del proceso de aprendizaje, los estudiantes, y el profesor, cuyo papel es proporcionar un estímulo impulsado por las necesidades de aprendizaje de los estudiantes.

La Unión Europea –UE- proporciona directrices para el aprendizaje de lenguas extranjeras, que se establecen en el Marco Común Europeo de Lenguas –MCER-, que describe el uso del lenguaje y el aprendizaje de idiomas como

“...las acciones realizadas por personas que...desarrollan una gama de competencias, tanto generales como en particular competencias de lenguaje comunicativo. Se basan en las competencias a su disposición [...] para participar en actividades lingüísticas que involucren procesos de lenguaje para producir y/o recibir textos en relación con temas en dominios específicos, activando aquellas estrategias que parecen más apropiadas para llevar a cabo las tareas a realizar. El seguimiento de estas acciones por los participantes conduce al refuerzo o modificación de sus competencias.” Council of Europe (Council of Europe, 2001, p. 9)

Por este motivo, la presente investigación aborda específicamente el problema pedagógico de cómo involucrar a los estudiantes de EFL en el desarrollo de sus habilidades de debate y discusión en el contexto de temas actuales que al mismo tiempo desarrollen la competencia cívica. El objetivo del estudio es explorar si un texto controversial pudiera convertirse en un desencadenante efectivo para la reflexión crítica, la discusión-debate y al mismo tiempo la práctica de las destrezas orales.

Está ampliamente aceptado que aprender un idioma extranjero no solo implica la adquisición de habilidades de comprensión y de escritura, sino también el desarrollo de habilidades orales y la capacidad de interactuar en una variedad de contextos sociales y profesionales diferentes, como se indica en el MCER.

Los estudiantes de segundo año de Lengua Inglesa IV, de la Universidad de Alicante, 2016-17, tienen una carga docente de una sesión de una hora por semana durante 15 semanas. El objetivo de aprendizaje de estas sesiones es que los estudiantes puedan mejorar el uso del inglés, y a su vez desarrollen habilidades para el aprendizaje colabrador y autónomo. Para ello, se incluye la participación en los debates, que implican defender y refutar los puntos de vista personales de cada uno de ellos. Además, el proceso de Bolonia presenta el desafío adicional de alcanzar los objetivos del Espacio Europeo de Educación Superior –EEES- “mejorar la calidad y la relevancia del aprendizaje y la enseñanza” (Ministerial Conference 20-15. European Higher Education Area, 2015, p. 2), y el desarrollo de ciudadanos comprometidos, satisfechos y articulados, uno de los roles clave de la educación superior, según el Council of the European Union (2014), cuestiones que de forma explícita y/o transversalmente, recogen los objetivos de aprendizaje de la guía docente Lengua Inglesa IV.
El discurso educativo se ha enfocado recientemente en el concepto de “la competencia”, que describe un modelo holístico que abarca una gama de procesos y acciones humanas, e implica una síntesis de todos los elementos y recursos que los humanos poseen para resolver problemas de la vida real. No se refiere específicamente a las habilidades, aunque puede incluirlas, sino que se trata más bien de interpretar información y proporcionar respuestas adaptativas (Haste, 2009).

La competencia cívica implica el conocimiento de conceptos tales como la democracia, la justicia, la igualdad, la ciudadanía y los derechos civiles y cómo las instituciones les aplican a nivel local, nacional e internacional (Hoskins & Crick, 2010), y además, la es un precursor natural y lógico de la ciudadanía activa, que Hoskins (2006) describe como “participación en la sociedad civil, la comunidad y / o la vida política, caracterizada por el respeto mutuo y la no violencia y de conformidad con derechos humanos y democracia.” (p. 7)

Educar para la ciudadanía activa en el contexto de los objetivos del EEES significa, sin embargo, que los docentes deben proporcionar a los estudiantes la oportunidad de aplicar y desarrollar “soft skills”, es decir destrezas sociales personales, como la comunicación, el trabajo en equipo, la autonomía, el sentido de responsabilidad, la tolerancia, la capacidad de negociación, y la creatividad en la resolución de problemas (Black, 2018; Michel, 2015).

Para lograr estos “soft skills”, es importante desarrollar “critical literacy” (CL), es decir, la alfabetización crítica, que implica desafiar las posturas convencionales y permitir la aparición de múltiples perspectivas a medida que los alumnos reaccionan como un grupo ante los textos culturales. Los teóricos de CL sostienen que se pueden explorar textos culturales que van desde, canciones, novelas, anuncios, conversaciones, imágenes, programas de televisión, hasta películas para descubrir cómo pueden influir en nuestra identidad, discursos culturales y desafiar o apoyar el statu quo. Según Neophytou y Valiandes (2013), proporcionar a los estudiantes oportunidades para desarrollar habilidades CL mediante el análisis de textos culturales ayuda a desarrollar la capacidad de “leer” textos desde múltiples perspectivas. A través de este proceso, los estudiantes pueden reconstruir la “verdad” que ha sido enmarcada por los discursos dominantes y
participar en acciones transformadoras que eventualmente pueden conducir a un cambio social positivo. De forma previa a la clase, los alumnos estudian el material proporcionado con el objetivo de fomentar la discusión-debate en el aula, “hibrido flipped-classroom” (Burke & Fedorek, 2017), implicando además este proceso, un compromiso de aprendizaje de tipo cooperativo (Gilboy et al., 2015; Pérez Estébanes, 2017).

La motivación se considera un importante factor facilitador para la adquisición de un idioma extranjero. Por lo tanto, los textos o materiales utilizados deben desencadenar la reflexión y maximizar el compromiso de los alumnos si se desea mejorar el aprendizaje del vocabulario y la práctica de las destrezas orales (Schmitt, 2008).

Método

Es un estudio de corte cualitativo, y el análisis de los datos recogidos se llevó a cabo utilizando técnicas de análisis de contenido cualitativo (Jansen, 2010; Krippendorff, 1989).

Descripción del contexto y de los participantes

En la clase introductoria se utilizó un texto de una fuente no divulgada con un fuerte contenido de protesta. Shylock de Shakespeare en “El mercader de Venecia” y su famoso y controvertido discurso “¿No tienen ojos los judíos? es capaz de evocar un sentido simultáneo de compasión y desprecio (Shakespeare, 1869, pp. 36-37 Acto III Escena I 52-59).

Los alumnos participantes fueron los de segundo curso de Filología Inglesa con un total de 100 distribuidos en 4 grupos diferentes.

Instrumentos

Se solicitó a los alumnos que respondieran las preguntas de forma escrita y anónima. El extracto que se distribuyó entre los estudiantes se reproduce a continuación, con las preguntas.

*Please read the following text and answer the questions*
He hath disgraced me, and hindered me half a million, laughed at my losses, mocked at my gains, scorned my nation, thwarted my bargains, cooled my friends, heated mine enemies; and what's his reason? I am a Jew. Hath not a Jew eyes? Hath not a Jew hands, organs, dimensions, senses, affections, passions? Fed with the same food, hurt with the same weapons, subject to the same means, warmed and cooled by the same winter and summer, as a Christian is? If you prick us, do we not bleed? If you tickle us, do we not laugh? If you poison us, do we not die? And if you wrong us, shall we not revenge?

If we are like you in the rest, we will resemble you in that. If a Jew wrong a Christian, what is his humility? Revenge. If a Christian wrong a Jew, what should his sufferance be by Christian example? Why, revenge. The villainy you teach me I will execute, and it shall go hard but I will better the instruction.

1. Explain the theme.

2. Do you agree with the reasoning or with the position expressed by the "voice"? Why or why not?

3. What does the text make you feel?
Procedimiento

Al terminar la contestación escrita, se realizó una discusión sobre la fuente del extracto y en concreto como abordar el tema del racismo. Finalmente, se les pidió a los estudiantes su opinión sobre este tipo de enfoque discusión-debate que utiliza un texto como desencadenante de discusión, y si volverían a participar en este tipo de actividades como una forma más de preparación para su actividad oral de examen final.

Resultados

En la discusión que siguió, los participantes expresaron su curiosidad sobre la fuente del texto. Se hicieron preguntas y ofrecieron respuestas que iban desde la Segunda Guerra Mundial –Holocausto- a Shakespeare y “El mercader de Venecia”. No revelar la fuente fue una buena estrategia de involucrarlos, y los estudiantes parecían disfrutar de su investigación espontánea sobre quién podría ser el autor. De hecho, varias veces, se planteó la idea de que el lenguaje parecía el de Shakespeare, y en dos de los grupos, un estudiante identificó la fuente como “El mercader de Venecia”, lo que pareció motivarlos en gran medida. A los estudiantes se les preguntó si les gustaría utilizar este tipo de textos, incluyendo artículos de periódicos y páginas de opinión, canciones temáticas o de protesta- para la reflexión, discusión-debate, y la respuesta fue altamente positiva.

- Te hace pensar sobre el racismo y la discriminación y cómo detenerlo.

- Es muy interesante hablar sobre estas cosas, es por eso que te hace querer hablar.

- Soy un poco tímido a la hora de hablar en inglés, pero si todos hablan en grupo, es mejor.

- Es difícil hablar sin notas, pero debes hacerlo en situaciones reales y si vas al Reino Unido o Holanda para un Erasmus, necesitas hacerlo.

- Esto es bueno, pero también me gustaría ver extractos de videos.
También me gustaría escuchar canciones del rapero Eminem o incluso los Chikos del Maíz. Da igual que es en español porque se puede traducir al inglés para que la prof. lo entienda.

En respuesta a la pregunta sobre cuál era el tema principal, los resultados se pueden resumir en las siguientes categorías temáticas emergentes: racismo, venganza, igualdad, discriminación contra los judíos, tolerancia religiosa e injusticia hacia los judíos.

Aunque hubo un consenso general que la venganza era una reacción humana ante el sufrimiento de una injusticia, al mismo tiempo hubo un abrumador rechazo a ella como una solución para la injusticia social. El grupo percibió que ésta era contraproducente porque se sentía que causaba más crueldad y más sufrimiento.

El extracto evocaba los siguientes sentimientos: tristeza, consternación, odio por injusticia, enojo, simpatía, preocupación, conflicto, un sentido de motivación para reaccionar contra el racismo y por eso, cuando se les preguntó sobre qué se podría hacer para tratar de prevenir por ejemplo el racismo, sus respuestas giraron en torno a la educación, la tolerancia y la protesta pacífica ante cualquier otro tipo de discriminación.

Discusión y conclusiones

Los resultados indican que este tipo de intervención pedagógica tiene un doble beneficio. En primer lugar, el alumno adquiere competencias cívicas y, en segundo lugar, el enfoque centrado en el alumno fue positivamente recibido por estos estudiantes de EFL, como lo demuestran sus comentarios de evaluación. Este tipo de actividad les dio la oportunidad de practicar sus destrezas orales y los estudiantes vieron esto como útil para ganar más confianza en el dominio oral del inglés.

Los temas clave que surgieron se centran en la importancia de la tolerancia religiosa y la igualdad racial y la inutilidad de la venganza. La venganza fue fuertemente rechazada como un medio para resolver la injusticia social porque se consideraba que alimentaba el conflicto aún más. El grupo detectó la protesta vehemente de Shylock...
contra el antisemitismo que experimentó, e hicieron conexiones con el Holocausto y la Segunda Guerra Mundial. Fuertes emociones de compasión, ira y tristeza fueron evocadas por lo que sufrió el pueblo judío. Los temas relacionados con la competencia cívica y la ciudadanía activa surgieron durante la discusión que siguió a la pregunta sobre cómo prevenir el racismo. La educación, la tolerancia y la protesta pacífica se expresaron como un medio para detener el racismo y otros tipos de discriminación.

El grupo se dirigió al intenso deseo de venganza de Shylock con una enorme cantidad de compasión por el sufrimiento del pueblo judío. Sin embargo, al mismo tiempo hubo un rechazo a la promesa de Shylock de usar venganza y vencer a sus enemigos en represalias como medio de reparación. Todos los grupos consideraron que la reacción de Shylock era moralmente incorrecta, lo que sugiere que el texto provocó una reflexión crítica. Los sentimientos evocados y detallados en los resultados son una indicación de que el texto avanzó la alfabetización crítica, –Critica Literacy: CL-. Esto se debe a que el fuerte deseo de venganza de Shylock provocó en los estudiantes una perspectiva contrastante, y este es un impacto clave de CL (Neophytou & Valiandes, 2013).

El documento de la UNESCO (2015) defiende que “...el pensamiento crítico está vinculado a los valores de equidad y justicia social, y habilidades para analizar las desigualdades, con énfasis adicional en alfabetización crítica, investigación y análisis” (VanderDussen Toukan, 2017, p. 7). De hecho, la mayoría de los participantes entendieron la razón de la venganza de Shylock, pero no estuvieron de acuerdo en que fuera una estrategia que lograría la justicia social. Además, el razonamiento que surgió en respuesta al deseo de venganza de Shylock es evidencia de una Educación para la Ciudadanía Global –GCED- más crítica (Andreotti, 2014) porque los alumnos abordaron un tema desde una perspectiva más profunda y contrastante a la voz de Shylock. La categoría “preocupada” se refirió al hecho de que se percibía que el texto describía algo que es relevante en la actualidad, es decir, persisten la discriminación y la violencia racial. Este tema podría abordarse y desarrollarse en sesiones posteriores a través de discusión-debate, en respuesta a otros textos relacionados con temas de derechos civiles en los EE. UU., por ejemplo.
El texto utilizado proporcionó el impetu para desarrollar las competencias cívicas asociadas con los valores democráticos –la justicia social, la igualdad racial y los derechos humanos– porque el texto explotaba un vínculo entre las emociones evocadas por el texto utilizado y el interés del estudiante en el racismo. El vínculo entre la emoción y el interés del tema se ha demostrado en varios estudios realizados por Ainley et al. (2002), Yulita (2017) o por Esteve-Faubel et al. (2018), entre otros. La interactividad con los compañeros y con los profesores también ha demostrado mejorar el compromiso académico emocional, lo que aumenta la interacción grupal y el rendimiento individual (Nkhoma et al., 2017).

La reacción emocional provocada por el texto fue seguida por varias ideas interesantes que fueron presentadas a los alumnos para tratar el racismo. Estas ideas sugieren la necesidad percibida por el grupo de una ciudadanía más activa en la lucha contra el racismo. Los temas que surgieron como no venganza, educación, tolerancia, respeto por otras culturas, empatía, protesta indicaron que muchos de los valores centrales asociados con la GCED, como el respeto por la diversidad de creencias, la igualdad racial, consideraciones de equidad, justicia social, y la acción social (VanderDussen Toukan, 2017, p. 2), y la competencia cívica promovida por el proceso de Bolonia, fueron suscitados y luego reforzados mediante el uso de este texto en una discusión-debate en el aula.

Teniendo en cuenta los comentarios positivos del grupo en la sesión introductoria inicial, este tipo de actividades de discusión-debate se han implementado en el módulo de Lengua inglesa IV. Artículos de periódico, páginas de opinión, poesía “slam” –slam poetry- o canciones están utilizados como un desencadenante de discusión para desarrollar las destrezas orales de los estudiantes de inglés. Este se demuestra porque la profesora seleccionó los tres primeros textos, pero luego cada grupo se turnó para hacerse cargo y acordar el artículo para toda la clase. Este procedimiento desarrolló una comunidad de aprendizaje efectiva y cada grupo estaba motivado sobre el conjunto de tareas y, en general, pudieron trabajar juntos para obtener un artículo adecuado en el plazo acordado. Una selección de los textos elegidos en el semestre de 2018 proporciona una indicación de los temas que interesaban a los estudiantes (Tabla 1).

Tabla 1: temas de intereses de los estudiantes
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Título</th>
<th>Enlace</th>
<th>Declaración de debate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>International Women’s Day: Millions join Spain strike</td>
<td><a href="http://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-43324406">http://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-43324406</a></td>
<td>“Two of the five female ministers in Spain’s conservative government, Agriculture Minister Isabel García Tejerina and the president of the Madrid region, Cristina Cifuentes, said they would work longer hours to show the capacity of women.” This amounts to the further exploitation of women in the workplace and does nothing for gender equality.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Don’t stay in School - RAP</td>
<td><a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=8xe6nLXVEC0">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=8xe6nLXVEC0</a></td>
<td>School is an outdated way to learn about what matters.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Globish just doesn’t cut it anymore: The PewDiePie effect. How a new global</td>
<td><a href="https://www.ft.com/content/981379a8-f58f-11e7-">https://www.ft.com/content/981379a8-f58f-11e7-</a></td>
<td>Native English-Speaking Brits and Americans will lose their edge as a result of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Text</td>
<td>URL</td>
<td>Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>generation learnt perfect English</td>
<td>88f17-5465a6ce1a00</td>
<td>the “pewdiepie” effect.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OK, robots have passed the Ikea test. Now let them clean our toilets</td>
<td><a href="https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2018/apr/23/robots-ikea-clean-toilets">https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2018/apr/23/robots-ikea-clean-toilets</a></td>
<td>Robots will be able to do everything better than humans in the future.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Call to tighten junk food advert rules after obesity link shown.</td>
<td><a href="https://www.theguardian.com/society/2018/mar/15/call-to-tighten-junk-food-advert-rules-after-obesity-link-shown">https://www.theguardian.com/society/2018/mar/15/call-to-tighten-junk-food-advert-rules-after-obesity-link-shown</a></td>
<td>Advertising restrictions are not the answer; educating young people at schools would be a more effective strategy to combat youth obesity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Young people who recall seeing such marketing frequently are more likely to be obese</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parents killed Facebook</td>
<td><a href="https://www.theguardian.com/technology/2018/feb/16/parents-killed-it-facebook-losing-teenage-users">https://www.theguardian.com/technology/2018/feb/16/parents-killed-it-facebook-losing-teenage-users</a></td>
<td>Facebook’s main goal is to provide a community platform that enables any active citizen to launch a social movement.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

En la clase, el profesor proporcionó una breve declaración de debate en respuesta al texto elegido, y utilizando el método “think-pair-share”, los estudiantes, trabajando en pareja, desarrollaron de forma autónoma un argumento contrario y uno de apoyo en relación con la declaración y luego compartieron sus puntos de vista opuestos con el resto de la clase. Cada estudiante presentó el argumento de su compañero y esto se hizo deliberadamente para practicar la conjugación en tercera persona del singular porque los hispanohablantes a menudo se olvidan de pronunciar la “s”. Según varios académicos, las opiniones y experiencias de los estudiantes después de haber trabajado activamente un tema en un ambiente de aprendizaje participativo es muy valioso porque contribuyen a identificar y proponer nuevas estrategias educativas que favorezcan la calidad, el atractivo para los estudiantes y la empleabilidad (Reichert & Tauch, 2003; Sursock et al., 2010).

Destacablemente, el proceso de trabajar en grupo para elegir el artículo para discusión fue recibido muy positivamente por los estudiantes, como se indica en el documento de evaluación que se les pidió que escribieran al final de estas actividades.

Los ejemplos de comentarios, que se reproducen a continuación, indican que la
experiencia de aprendizaje fue nueva, agradable, motivadora, que fomenta la seguridad en su mismo y cumplió el doble papel de aumentar sus conocimientos de los asuntos actuales a la vez que se practicaban sus destrezas orales en inglés. Además, claramente la actividad fomento un a comunidad de aprendizaje sólido y agradable donde estaban a gusto y se sentían libres de expresar sus opiniones, incluso con ideas muy buenas de mejorar la actividad que se van a incorporar.

“It was a new experience for me, so I really enjoyed it”

“I lost the fear that I had for these kind of situations.”

“I would recommend this activity be continued; it’s a means of gaining new vocabulary, allowing students to see an argument from different perspective, instead of seeing simply one side of it.”

“Working in pairs has been beneficial before exposing ideas to a bigger group.”

“In the process of choosing the articles, I read many interesting things....”

“I would like to encourage this activity to continue...highly valuable for our general knowledge and use of language.”

“Great opportunity to choose the topic because the same topic appeared time after time during last year.”

“Being able to choose the topic gives us an extra interest and motivates us to participate in the class.”

“I would like that my Italian teachers introduced a similar activity”

Erasmus student
“Presentations in front of the group…expressing my opinion made me feel more confident…I definitely improved.” Erasmus student

“I like to collaborate with my friends in the search of articles.”

“…this activity must continue in further semesters because it helps students think about social problems while they are learning English.”

“It made everyone talk, in relaxed way. I was never judged for my opinion or told what I had to think.”

“I would have new pairs for each session; it would break the ice.”

Visualization of student reactions to the “think-pair-share” method for debating the newspaper articles chosen in the oral sessions

Los materiales didácticos, en este caso el texto utilizado y las discusiones en torno a él, son uno de los pilares del aprendizaje continuo, y su diseño por parte del
profesor y el uso por parte del alumno generan una dinámica de trabajo centrada en el alumno, lo que hace que el alumno evolucione desde un sujeto pasivo a uno activo. Este enfoque educativo responde a la necesidad de un aprendizaje autónomo y cooperativo promovido por la creación del EEES (The Bologna Declaration, 1999). En particular, The Tuning Project (González & Wagenaar, 2003) enfatiza el contenido de los estudios, que se considera responsabilidad de las instituciones de educación superior y su personal académico. Por lo tanto, es responsabilidad del profesor diseñar y proporcionar recursos que el alumno utilice para trabajar de forma autónoma y lograr un aprendizaje que implique el uso de habilidades para organizar, crear e interpretar información (Monereo i Font & Pozo, 2003).

A través de este tipo de actividades de discusión-debate, observamos que los estudiantes están desarrollando una autoconciencia de sus logros de habla y progreso con una mayor confianza para articular sus ideas en inglés. Este enfoque pedagógico está centrado en el alumno y se anima a los alumnos a hablar con el grupo, después de realizar una autorreflexión y la interacción con su pareja. De esta forma, aprenden practicando sus destrezas orales con sus compañeros de clase.

El papel del docente, en línea con el Proyecto Tuning, es proporcionar aportes comprensibles y significativos –el texto y la declaración del debate-, para alentar y facilitar, a veces actuando como interlocutor, la interacción de cada alumno con su compañero y con el resto de la clase. La constante retroalimentación maestro-alumno es clave, con el maestro circulando entre los estudiantes. La retroalimentación contribuye significativamente a mejorar la adquisición de destrezas orales inglés. Un estudio que investigó la autoevaluación del desempeño oral de los estudiantes de EFL demostró que, a través de la retroalimentación y la práctica, los estudiantes participantes lograron un progreso significativo en el aprendizaje para evaluar su propio rendimiento oral y esto les ayudó a alcanzar sus objetivos de aprendizaje establecidos (Yuh-Mei, 2008).

El uso de textos tópicos que invitan a la reflexión inicialmente elegidos por el profesor y con posterioridad por los alumnos como grupo junto con el método “think-pair-share” se ha incorporado ahora al método pedagógico utilizado en el módulo de Lengua Inglesa IV –sesiones orales-. La experiencia pedagógica sugiere fuertemente que
un texto tópico con controversia se convierte en un desencadenante de reflexión crítica y discusión-debate en un ambiente de clase de inglés como lengua extranjera –EFL–. Se observó que esto fue más pronunciado cuando los estudiantes eligen el texto. Además, se ha demostrado que este método de aprendizaje cooperativo tiene el doble beneficio de involucrar a los alumnos y avanzar su competencia cívica, al tiempo practiquen sus destrezas orales en inglés en un contexto que ellos mismos han considerado interesante y relevante.
Este estudio ha investigado si en un mundo más globalizado e individualista la canción protesta tiene un elemento que puede servir como materia transversal en el ámbito educativo, especialmente en el concepto conocido como la formación de la ciudadanía global, es decir en la Global Citizenship Education (GCED). A pesar de la percepción periodística del declive de la música protesta durante la guerra de Irak que reveló la primera fase del estudio, se ha demostrado a través de dos subsecuentes fases del estudio que la música protesta o de actualidad “topical music” sigue siendo un detonante por la reflexión crítica y la discusión-debate. Se ha demostrado que este proceso de reflexión crítica puede conducir hacia un aprendizaje transformador en el aula, independientemente de que el oyente conozca o no la canción o el contexto histórico desde donde emergió la canción. También se observó que los grupos investigados preferían la unión de música y letra, la canción, sobre el texto puro, es decir, sin acompañamiento musical. Esta tendencia puede venir derivada de la facilidad que, en la actualidad, el o la estudiante tiene para volver a escuchar las canciones propuestas en el aula a través de You Tube y Spotify. De hecho, en el estudio presentado en el Capítulo 9 según las citas ejemplos, los y las estudiantes pedían escuchar música rap y otras canciones en este contexto de discusión-debate.

De los estudios 1.1 y 1.2, la cobertura periodística de la canción protesta durante la guerra de Irak 2003 se extrae que la hipótesis del estudio fue parcialmente correcta en el sentido de que los artículos periodísticos analizados generalmente informaban sobre eventos y fenómenos relacionados con la música protesta durante el periodo en cuestión. Sin embargo, estos artículos eran descriptivos más que exhaustivos y analíticos, y solo en raras ocasiones algunos artículos proporcionaban más explicación sobre lo que estaba sucediendo con la música protesta durante la era de la Guerra Iraquí.
Lo más significativo de estos resultados reveló la percepción periodística del declive de las canciones protesta tipo antiguerra. También, destacó la práctica de la autocensura por algunos artistas entrevistados que indicaron que tenían miedo de una reacción negativa al expresar disentimiento sobre esta guerra. A demás, fue también señalada como causa, la desregulación y consolidación de la radio a partir de la 1996 Telecommunications Act, que facilitó, en el EEUU, la creación de la más grande emisora de radio de la historia, Clear Channel, que controlaba sobre 1,200 emisoras de radio en EEUU y 65% del negocio de conciertos. También se puede tomar en cuenta que un alto cargo de Clear Channel- Tom Hicks- según lo que había revelado el periodista investigador Krugman (25 March 2003), tenía fuertes relaciones comerciales e históricos con la familia Bush desde el momento que el presidente Bush fuera el Gobernador de Texas.

Muchos cantantes que, según lo que está señalado en la bibliografía, aunque es una constatación más de tipo personal, expresan que se han visto perjudicados profesionalmente después de haber expresado sentimiento antiguerra y esto presenta unas condiciones que puedan generar o dar lugar en algunos casos a un comportamiento de autocensura. Según Scherzinger and Smith (2007) durante este periodo el silenciamiento de la disidencia musical ha sido extenso. Citan algunos ejemplos, entre ellos el de Rage Against the Machine que ha sufrido el cierre de su tablero de mensajes por los servicios secretos. Plantean la idea de que expresiones musicales de disentimiento en el ámbito de las establecidas estructuras monopolistas fueron comprometidas, como resultado de la consolidación de la industria de los medios de comunicación que incluye la radio. Ellos argumentan en su artículo que también los artistas relativamente independientes, como Madonna, estaban operando dentro de nuevas y poderosas restricciones. Es en este contexto, según ellos, se debe entender también la retirada por parte de Madonna del controvertido video antibelicista de “American Life” en 2003.

Otro ejemplo incluye Jethro Tull fue expulsado de la radio roquera clásica WCHR-FM en Nueva Jersey por quejarse de que los conductores que colgaban banderas americanas de sus automóviles y sus SUVs –Sports Utility Vehicles- confundían el nacionalismo con el patriotismº (Garofalo, 2013, p. 18). Todas estas cuestiones, hay que circunscribirlas en un contexto político donde era difícil tener una voz disidente en los
medios convencionales. También en julio de 2004, se prohibió a Linda Ronstadt actuar en el Aladdin Casino de Las Vegas después de dedicar una de sus canciones para Michael Moore, el cineasta documentalista y escritor estadounidense, conocido por su visión de la invasión de Irak y las políticas del gobierno de George W. Bush y sus antecesores.

En el caso de Dixie Chicks, Adolphson (2014) analiza las represalias que ocurrieron cuando Natalie Maines, la cantante del grupo dijo al inicio de un concierto en Londres —Just so you know, we are on the good side with y all. We do not want this war, this violence, and we are ashamed that the President of the United States is from Texas/ Para que lo sepáis, estamos del lado bueno con todos ustedes. No queremos esta guerra, esta violencia, y estamos avergonzados de que el Presidente de los Estados Unidos sea de Texas. (Adolphson page 52)—.

Como resultado de este comentario Dixie Chicks recibieron una cobertura muy negativa en la prensa mainstream/convencional del USA (Garofalo, 2013, p. 12). Pero la pregunta que surge y que es obligatorio hacer es si fue realmente esta manifestación el desencadenante de lo que ella expresa o es que su concierto no tenía un mínimo de calidad. Garofalo (2013) también se señala que recibieron amenazas de muerte de forma puntual y según Adolphson (2014), este tipo de actuaciones implicaba un Macartismo moderno, una imagen pública negativa y una variedad de críticas de naturaleza casi sin precedentes (Adolphson, 2014, p. 47). Hay que recordar que, durante el periodo de la conocida como Guerra Fría, el gobierno de Estados Unidos, con el senador Joseph R. McCarthy, creo una comisión que buscaba la defensa de los ideales de democracia americana frente al comunismo. Así en a partir de 1950 se inició una campaña con el fin de identificar cualquier individuo que tuviera ideales comunistas y que por ello constituuyera una amenaza para la sociedad estadounidense.

Garofolo detalla que los Dixie Chicks fueron boicoteados en unas setenta y cuatro estaciones de radio en los Estados Unidos, y entonces el mensaje podría ser interpretado como que no era una opción prudente criticar al presidente durante un período tan delicado como fuer la guerra de Irak.

En resumen, este trabajo reveló a través de la percepción periodística del declive de la canción protesta un subyacente déficit de disentimiento que se extendió a la canción.
protesta, un símbolo tradicional de la disidencia/disentimiento. Finalmente, el estudio proporciona una cierta evidencia que sugiere que la canción protesta contra la guerra, tal como fue concebida históricamente, se ha convertido en una reliquia del siglo anterior.

La conclusión y las incógnitas de la primera fase del estudio plantearon la necesidad de la segunda, tercera y cuarta fase de la presente tesis para averiguar si esta percepción periodística del declive de la canción protesta también podría extender a un grupo de estudiantes universitarios o al contrario, al escuchar este tipo de canción, sea conocida y actual o desconocida y de otro del siglo anterior, sigue la música en producir una reacción que podría servir en el ámbito educativo para la formación de la ciudadanía global.

Conclusiones de la fase II. Protest songs about the Iraq War. An effective trigger for critical reflection?

La fase II plantea el problema que se desconoce la reacción de los oyentes cuando se enfrentan en la actualidad a este tipo de canciones protestas y si su contenido podría ser útil desde la perspectiva educativa.

Así pues, la hipótesis de este estudio ha sido correcta, pues el estudio ha demostrado que la canción protesta es un detonante para estimular la reflexión crítica y la discusión-debate en un aula o en un grupo sobre un tema concreto. En este caso se demostró que las canciones sirvieron como un catalizador para la reflexión crítica en un entorno grupal.

Ambas canciones seleccionadas fueron apreciadas por el grupo porque formaban parte de su trasfondo cultural y, por lo tanto, sirvieron como un desencadenante para la discusión-debate y la evolución del pensamiento. Esto quedó claramente demostrado por la capacidad con la que el grupo concilió sus fuertes convicciones sobre la falsa lógica de la Guerra Iraqui con la reacción fuertemente compasiva que posteriormente surgió hacia las tropas atrapadas en esta guerra.
El resultado de este proceso de análisis y reflexión condujo al aprendizaje transformador, que es el objetivo final de la formación de la ciudadanía global –GCED–.

Conclusiones de la fase III. “Cross-Curricular teaching going forward. A view from “Strange Fruit”

La tercera fase del estudio sobre la canción “Strange Fruit” plantea la hipótesis que cuando un grupo de jóvenes universitarios escucha la música protesta, independientemente de si la canción es popular en el momento de escucharla, las letras de la canción facilitan la construcción de conocimiento y el desarrollo de competencias transversales en un contexto inter-curricular.

Las conclusiones del estudio indican que “Strange Fruit” sigue siendo un poderoso legado contra los actos pasados o incluso presentes de violencia racial independientemente del país de origen del oyente. Una canción relativamente desconocida para el grupo de este estudio, “Strange Fruit”, sin embargo, evocó la ira, el disgusto, la vergüenza, la desesperación y la tristeza en respuesta a la imagen vívida y horrible de un linchamiento pintado por las letras de la canción. Además, canciones como “Strange Fruit”, dado el vínculo reconocido entre el afecto y el interés del tema, también pueden proporcionar el impulso para el desarrollo de competencias transversales asociadas con la justicia social, la igualdad racial y los derechos humanos. Finalmente, este estudio ha demostrado que “Strange Fruit” puede ser una herramienta pedagógica totalmente flexible en un contexto inter-curricular porque la canción trasciende el alcance propio de una asignatura específica y de un tiempo concreto, contexto histórico, y además, en la actualidad tiene la ventaja de ser accesible, para cualquier persona, de ahí la semejanza de resultados obtenidos en los dos grupos diferentes, Universidad de Connecticut y Universidad de Alicante.

Conclusiones de Fase IV

Los hallazgos de los estudios 4.1 (grupo focales) y 4.2 (encuesta cualitativa) utilizando el texto “Hath not a Jew eyes?” de la obra de Shakespeare apoyan la hipótesis de que un texto con un gran contenido de protesta se convierte en un desencadenante de
reflexión crítica y discusión-debate en un ambiente de clase de inglés como lengua extranjera –EFL–.

Los resultados, al igual que había ocurrido con los estudios anteriores, demuestran que este tipo de texto sirve como impulso para introducir GCED, y puede ser un punto de referencia transdisciplinario en un contexto de EFL. y los hallazgos generales sugieren que los temas de GCED generaron interés entre los y las estudiantes y desencadenaron la discusión. Cabe mencionar que los participantes pidieron utilizar canciones urbanos como raps en este contexto de aprendizaje, pues estas canciones las consideraban como muy apropiadas para el tema tratado.

Este enfoque de aprendizaje cooperativo y participativo tiene el doble beneficio de involucrar a los y las estudiantes con temas de interés, mientras que al mismo tiempo aumenta su confianza a medida que se les da la oportunidad de ser más competentes en sus habilidades de debate y discusión, en este caso, utilizando el inglés como el idioma vehicular.

Reflexiones y conclusiones globales

1. Independentemente de que la canción sea conocida o no, las canciones tipo de actualidad o de protesta son productos culturales que a través de sus letras tienen un poder afectivo y generan una reflexión crítica en el oyente. Esto ha sido el caso con el estudio realizado, tanto con las canciones conocidas por los grupos “Where is the Love?” y “Wake me up when September Ends”, como con “Strange Fruit”.

2. La reflexión crítica tiene una serie de beneficios en el ámbito educativo. Por primero conlleva a un aprendizaje transformador, pues la persona que aprende a reflexionar siempre está revisando sus creencias en función de nuevos hechos o de nuevos materiales para analizar, y todo esto enriquece el proceso de aprendizaje y profundiza los conocimientos.

3. Tanto las canciones, como los textos sin acompañamiento musical –extractos de
literatura; artículos de opinión de periódicos conocidos en inglés como “opinion pages”, con un fuerte contenido de protesta; o artículos que abordan temas controvertidos- son un tipo de producto cultural que sirve como un desencadenante de debate-discusión en el aula. En los estudios llevado a cabo en esta tesis el uso de los textos culturales representa una didáctica aplicada que ha tenido una retroalimentación positiva en el propio estudiante.

4. Los participantes han destacado sus preferencias de incluir también música urbana, como raps y otras canciones en el contexto de discusión-debate
Bibliografía


199


Bibliografía


205


Bibliografía


210


Bibliografía


Bibliografía


Bibliografía


218


Bibliografía


