Check for updates

#### **OPEN ACCESS**

EDITED BY Antonio Cervero, University of Oviedo, Spain

REVIEWED BY Warren Kidd, University of East London, United Kingdom Celia Galve González, University of Oviedo, Spain

\*CORRESPONDENCE Blanes-Mora Rubén ⊠ ruben.blanes@ua.es

RECEIVED 01 August 2023 ACCEPTED 08 November 2023 PUBLISHED 12 December 2023

#### CITATION

Ponsoda-López de Atalaya S, Blanes-Mora R and Moreno-Vera JR (2023) The photographic heritage as a motivational resource to learn and teach history. *Front. Educ.* 8:1270851. doi: 10.3389/feduc.2023.1270851

#### COPYRIGHT

© 2023 Ponsoda-López de Atalaya, Blanes-Mora and Moreno-Vera. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY). The use, distribution or reproduction in other forums is permitted, provided the original author(s) and the copyright owner(s) are credited and that the original publication in this journal is cited, in accordance with accepted academic practice. No use, distribution or reproduction is permitted which does not comply with these terms.

# The photographic heritage as a motivational resource to learn and teach history

Santiago Ponsoda-López de Atalaya<sup>1</sup>, Rubén Blanes-Mora<sup>1\*</sup>and Juan Ramón Moreno-Vera<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Faculty of Education, University of Alicante, Alicante, Spain, <sup>2</sup>Faculty of Education, University of Murcia, Murcia, Spain

This article, linked to the research of new methods for teaching history, has as its main objective to analyse the motivation of future primary school teachers regarding the use of photographic heritage in the teaching of historical content. This investigation is based on a teaching experience carried out in the 22/23 academic year with 266 primary education student teachers, in which a key episode in the history of Spain is explored via a series of photographs. Data collection was done through a Likert-type questionnaire, which the students answered after the activity, with a response scale of 1 to 4 with some qualitative open-ended questions. Responses were also examined using the SPSS27 statistical programme. The results show how the analysis and interpretation of the photographs, as well as the activities developed from them, are a motivating resource for most of the participants. The latter consider photographs suitable, on the one hand, for their personal development, and on the other, for their professional training, since it allows them to design innovative and creative history teaching-learning programmes.

#### KEYWORDS

photography, heritage, teaching-learning, motivation, historical thinking

#### **1** Introduction

One of the most distinctive features of society and, undoubtedly, one of the key characteristics of current lifestyles, is the mass use of photography in both the public and private spheres (Batchen, 2004). It is curious, however, that in our visual world we continue to overlook the fact that the photographic image uses a language that conveys a certain type of information that must be interpreted and decoded (Kossoy, 2014); although they currently play a passive role, photographs could become an active agent in the transformation of our cultural system. Yet, as noted by various authors (Iglesias, 2009; Pantoja, 2010; Rodríguez De Las Heras, 2010; Sáiz, 2013; Gómez and López, 2014; García, 2016), there are as yet few educational programmes that include the study and understanding of the complex phenomenon of the image in real teaching and learning scenarios, at least, in the Spanish educational context, where this study was conducted. However, as we will try to show in this study in the case of history teaching, photographic heritage can be used as a learning resource, as long as teachers have the capacity to provide students with the necessary tools.

The photographer and historian Freund (1974) put forward an argument, of relevance here, about the impact of the image on all spheres of reality, writing that since its inception in the mid-nineteenth century, the influence of photography on our society "lies in the fact that it is not just a creation, but, above all, one of the most effective means of shaping our ideas and

influencing our behaviour" (10). Thus, taking as a starting point this intriguing proposal by Freund which still resonates today, we can argue that photography has gradually modified our behaviour, not only in terms of our relationship with images, but also in terms of how we use them to narrate our past, present, and future (Sontag, 2008; Benjamin, 2013; Kossoy, 2014). It is therefore appropriate to reflect as teachers on the necessity and benefits of incorporating photographic documents into standard classroom practice.

Photography is analysed as a means of artistic expression and, at the same time, as testimony of a context and a culture of production (Pantoja, 2010; Rodríguez De Las Heras, 2010; Kossoy, 2014; García, 2016) that place observers in a specific moment, showing them in a particular manner how and where they can look. Thus, it can be argued that when we work with and analyse a photographic image, we find ourselves before a document-a heritage item and a historical source, as De Las Heras (2015) notes-that certainly ought to be researched, investigated, and contextualised in order for its full iconic and iconological significance to be understood. Furthermore, it may be studied not just as the medium of an image, but also as the medium of memory, given its key feature (distinguishing it from other historical sources) of having the "technical ability to suspend time and centre space in an instant" (Pantoja, 2010, 186), in such a way that allows us to continually recover, or perhaps just evoke, events or moments that we wish to preserve. Visualising these memories in a photograph is, therefore, one more way of remembering, of not forgetting a past that has unobtrusively entered these images, which the person who is aware of this presence can interpret or read.

Thus, photographic heritage undoubtedly has enormous educational potential, arising from its nature as a graphic document and historical source, as Pagès (2021). We therefore believe that history teaching ought to incorporate photography and develop a range of methodologies to respond to the inevitable particularities of each image. Above all, these teaching practices ought to be motivating for students, given that, as described in various studies (Sáiz, 2013; Gómez and López, 2014; Bel, 2017; García-Vera, 2019; Muñoz, 2019; Ponsoda López de Atalaya and Blanes Mora, 2020), it is not enough to simply project a collection of photographs onto the board, or comment briefly on what is depicted in this or that photograph. If the aim is to teach history in the classroom through photographs, what is really meaningful is to ask ourselves what we want from them, how we can make them talk, that is, how our students can activate their knowledge, their experience and their curiosity so that photographs recover their documentary and informative value (Fontcuberta, 2016). Thus, in order to motivate our students to correctly interpret a photograph, and use it in the future as a resource in the classroom, as Pantoja (2010) points out, it is essential to provide them with a previous formative experience where they have had contact with the photographic image in a reflective and active learning context.

For Riego (2019), who has worked on this subject for decades, interpretating a visual source correctly depends on the ability of teachers to get their students to relate the image to the culture that produced it, which ultimately involves visual documents being understood as vestiges or signs of a past that requires appropriate treatment. In this respect, and with a view to making interdisciplinary connections with other educational studies on the use of images in higher education, we adopt the model proposed by Arqué i Bertran (2002) having observed that, in the analysis and contextualisation of photographs in the classroom, it is crucial that the role of the

student—who in this case is an observer—is active. An active role influences students' motivation when analysing the document, as they will be responsible for accessing the value system that each photo symbolises. The way they view it will determine the decisions made as they interpret both visible and invisible elements, and also the different dialectic relationships that can be identified, such as identity-otherness, change-continuity, and cause-consequence, to reveal the emotional weight that any historical document is capable of transmitting, assuming it has been adequately preserved and, above all, is accessible in order to be interpreted again.

Yet photography, as a mass phenomenon of contemporary culture, has generated a new vernacular language that needs to be labelled in order to be understood, has become saturated-and in many cases eclipsed-by a form of memory that cannot be read critically (Sánchez Moreno, 2011). Its message and even its documentary value has been cancelled out as it has been influenced by new social practices and, of course, by ignorance of the medium itself, by "that cloud of futile instantaneity" (Sánchez Moreno, 2011, 43). Moreover, Didi-Huberman's (2020) convincing and illustrative description of this context, which ought to put us on our guard, holds that "never has the image suffered so many ruptures, so many contradictory claims, and so many interlinking rejections, immoral manipulations and moralising condemnations" (29). In such a context, as a discipline that subscribes to new forms of critical teaching, the field of social science teaching must ask itself what the meaning of photography is, what we can understand by the photographic act today, and of course, what relationship it has with memory and critical thinking (Sáiz, 2013; Gómez and Miralles, 2015; Muñoz, 2019). Put another way, and in reference to Fontcuberta, (2016) well-known thesis, in our current context shaped by the iconic universe, a minimal understanding of the power of the photographic image is only possible if one adopts a participatory attitude, that is, if we look in order to reflect. Thus, a particularly urgent issue, and one which our students must know how to respond to, does not concern what "we conceive of as fiction, but rather what we perceive as truth (De la Nuez, 2010, 14).

In this sense, Gudín and Chávarri (2019) find that if historical research is based on a holistic and transversal perspective-whether analysing written or object sources-photography, as described here, ought to be seen as a source to be studied and analysed in the same critical way as other historical sources, that is, applying a rigorous critical reading technique, as described by Burke (2001). It could be argued that the possibility of bringing history closer by means of photographic heritage will depend on how useful this historical document is for the construction of a future historical narrative (De Las Heras, 2015). Seeing and treating the image as a source of memory thus allows a particular approach to the historical events depicted and studied in the image, and, as noted by Santisteban et al. (2010), "puts the student in direct contact with the past" (120). This visualisation of history thus facilitates critical understanding among students, and therefore their motivation may also increase—a key concern of this paper—by allowing them to acquire historical thinking skills since, as already noted, the student will be the main author of this narrative. In reality, the photographic image encourages reflection and analytical and critical thinking (Ponsoda López de Atalaya and Blanes Mora, 2020) when it is used in an interdisciplinary, participative, and active context, as we will attempt to demonstrate here. We agree with Campany (2004) that thinking about photographs "must therefore address the ways in which these different points of view and places are always assimilated, conveyed and combined—consciously and unconsciously—by creators and spectators" (12). Consequently, this research will attempt to relate different studies (Kossoy, 2014; Chicote, 2020; Ponsoda López de Atalaya and Blanes Mora, 2020) with the objective, not only to demonstrate how photographic heritage can be a didactic tool, but also how it can be a motivating resource for the classroom, stimulating creativity and critical and empathetic thinking.

The teaching experience described in the following sections took place in a teacher training context, specifically in a master's degree programme in primary education. We consider it important to carry out innovative teaching experiences such as these, in which student teachers are given models for reflection and practice that allow them to adequately internalise the methodological knowledge that they will have to apply themselves in the classroom (López Facal et al., 2017). Concepts such as memory or heritage, and familiarity with visual sources, will help them in this important task (Sáiz, 2013; Gómez and Miralles, 2015; Muñoz, 2019; Chicote, 2020; Cotán Fernández et al., 2022). Therefore, we aim to discover how these university students learn and what motivates them to learn, and whether this experience increases or has little impact on their motivation. The great pioneer of photography Mathew Brady suggested that the camera is the "eye of history," and it will play this role if given a place in the classroom, bringing historical testimony to stand before the eyes of the present. We believe that teachers will use photography correctly and appropriately if they understand its status as a visual source, if they reflect on its characteristics and possibilities for history teaching and, above all, if they look with the intention of understanding both what a photograph shows and its context.

#### 2 Materials and methods

#### 2.1 Objectives and hypothesis

The main objective of this teaching experience is to discover and study the impact of using photographic heritage as a teaching tool on the motivation of student primary school teachers. To meet this objective, four specific objectives (SOs) were developed:

SO 1: To evaluate the motivation of the sample group with regards to the strategies and processes of the training programme.

SO 2: To analyse the motivation of the student teachers when they use photographic heritage as a resource for teaching history.

SO 3: To establish what the student teachers feel is their motivation for using photographic heritage in relation to history learning aims.

SO 4: To highlight the benefits and difficulties associated with the use of photography for history teaching and learning.

This study is based on the hypothesis that photographic heritage is not being used or valued by student primary school teachers as an additional resource for history teaching, that they do not see it as a useful and motivational tool for innovate teaching. Therefore, we ask the following research questions: Do student teachers see photographic heritage as a motivating teaching tool for history lessons? What is their perception of their own motivation to teach using photographic heritage in the social sciences?

#### 2.2 Participants and context

The research presented here is based on a purposive sample selection of third-year student teachers on a bachelor's degree primary education programme at the University of Alicante.

The sample comprises 266 student primary school teachers (n=266) taking the course "Social Science Teaching: History." We conducted our study in the framework of this course. The sample was made up of 80 men (30.1 percent) and 185 women (69.5 percent), and the average age was 21.1 years.

## 2.3 An educational programme using photographic heritage to learn history

The aim of our educational experience was for the students to start valuing photographic heritage as a useful and motivating resource for history teaching. To this end, we designed an activity with three distinct phases.

In the first phase, we presented a specific historical context through the use of seven iconic photographs documenting the coup d'état that took place in Spain in 1981, organised in a sequence that the teachers had already seen. The task we proposed was a descriptive and systematic analysis of the images through questions such as: What do you see in each image? What do you see in each image to make you think like that?

Once the visual analysis had been completed, the second phase began, which involved carrying out an investigative discussion-based activity, based on a series of questions focusing particularly on conceptual and historical aspects. The aim in this case was for the students to investigate and reflect not just on the images, but also on the historical, cultural, and political context captured in the photographs. In this way, by analysing this sequence of photographs it was possible to access the deeper meaning of the images. As the photographs were the only historical source available to the students at that moment, they had to critically analyse and interpret them, infer ideas, and read the photographs as historical evidence, as Riego (2019) describes.

The third and final phase of the educational experiment involved participants working individually to narrate the historical events studied in the photographs. Students could choose the perspective they considered best, based of course on the knowledge acquired in preceding phases, and using the photographic sequence they had analysed. The objective was for the students to take an active role in their own learning and appreciate the possible pedagogical benefits of using photographs to teach history in an authentic and meaningful way.

## 2.4 Instrument design and validation, and the research process

Once the participants had completed the training on using photography as a tool for teaching history, they filled in a questionnaire on the teaching and learning process that had been designed for this study. Both qualitative and quantitative, the questionnaire design is similar to that used in recent studies in the field of social science teaching (Moreno-Vera et al., 2021; Moreno-Vera and Martínez-Leguízamo, 2022). The questionnaire comprised 22 items divided into three blocks. Blocks 2 and 3, which are quantitative, were based on Likert scales of 1 to 4 (from "not useful at all" to "very useful," and from "strongly disagree" to "strongly agree").

The first block, which is qualitative, concerns the training programme, and the second block focuses on the utility of the activity presented. Finally, the third block—which is the focus of the present paper—contains items relating to the motivation of the participants (item 9 and items 13 to 22) with reference to three aspects: motivation in relation to the training programme (SO 1), to the teaching resources (SO 2), and to educational objectives (SO 3).

Here, we list all the items included in the instrument to provide an overview of the study:

- Item 1 (open). Explain why you think this activity has been useful for your training.
- Item 2 (open). Explain why you think this activity has been useful for your professional future.
- Item 3 (open). Explain what you see as the positive aspects of using photography in history teaching and learning.
- Item 4 (open). Explain what you see as the negative aspects of using photography in history teaching and learning.
- Item 5. I think analysis of the photographic sequence has been: 1
  not useful at all, 2 somewhat useful, 3 useful, 4 very useful.
- Item 6. I think the research on the causes and consequences has been: 1 – not useful at all, 2 – somewhat useful, 3 – useful, 4 – very useful.
- Item 7. I think that giving my opinion on the coup détat (why it failed, what it means, etc.) has been: 1 not useful at all, 2 somewhat useful, 3 useful, 4 very useful.
- Item 8. I think that narrating the event has been: 1 not useful at all, 2 somewhat useful, 3 useful, 4 very useful.
- Item 9. The activity analysing the photographic sequence has been motivating.
- Item 10. The activity researching the causes and consequences has been motivating.
- Item 11. The activity giving an opinion on the coup d'état (why it failed, what it means, etc.) has been motivating.
- Item 12. The activity of narrating the event has been motivating.
- Item 13. The way of presenting and working on the topic has motivated me to discover more about it.
- Item 14. Working with photographs has improved my motivation to learn and apply myself in class.
- Item 15. My motivation has improved because I understand my social, political, and cultural context better.
- Item 16. The topic and the way of working on it through photography has improved my motivation to get better grades.
- Item 17. I felt motivated because I could contribute my point of view or own knowledge.
- Item 18. I felt motivated because we used resources other than textbooks.
- Item 19. I felt motivated because I was able to take the lead in my own learning.
- Item 20. I felt motivated to design my own activities based on photography when I become a teacher.
- Item 21. I felt motivated because I think the activity is useful for my professional future.

- Item 22. I felt motivated because I think the activity is useful for my current teacher training.

In terms of the validation of the construct, Cronbach's alpha test gave a result of 0.908, which indicates a high level of reliability and therefore a high level of internal consistency (0.9>1 represents an outstanding level of reliability according to studies by Oviedo and Campo-Arias, 2005).

Furthermore, the Guttman split-half coefficient test was carried out, giving a result of 0.839, which supports the high level of internal reliability of each of the items on the evaluation scale, as also seen in other mixed studies in the field of social sciences, for example Gestsdóttir et al. (2018) and Gómez-Carrasco et al. (2019, 2020).

Since the questionnaire is a mixed instrument, with open and closed items, Friedman's chi-square validation test was carried out to establish the validity of the quantitative items, and if these affect the qualitative responses. In this case, the result was 186,377, showing that there is no dependence between items, as also shown in other mixed studies, where a result of >0.05 is considered positive in qualitative items (Satorra and Bentler, 2010; Sharpe, 2015; Moreno-Vera et al., 2020).

Finally, in relation to the research process, it is important to note that participation in the study was voluntary, questionnaire responses were anonymised, and the study followed the ethical guidelines set out by the University of Alicante, where it was carried out. All participants were informed of and gave consent to the statistical processing of the data. The training programme was carried out during social science classes, under the aegis of appropriately qualified teachers. Data collection and the analysis of results was carried out using the statistical software package IBM SPSS v. 24, in the case of the descriptive statistical results of the questionnaire, while the qualitative items were analysed using the programme AQUAD 7 (Huber, 2013), with the variables developed based on the narratives of the participants. Regarding the qualitative analysis, a coding structure was carried out based on the variables that appeared in the narratives of the participants in the study. For their analysis, the Absolute Frequency (AF) and the percentage of this (% AF) have been taken into account.

#### **3** Results

# 3.1 Motivation of participants in relation to the training programme (items 9, 13, 17 and 19)

Results related to SO 1, analysing the motivation of the student teachers in relation to the training programme, were generally positive. In fact, a descriptive statistical analysis of mean and standard deviation (all items have a SD <1) shows that the first variable (Item 9. The activity analysing the photographic sequence has been motivating; Table 1) has a mean of 3.26 (Likert scale of 1 to 4), meaning that participants do see the teaching experience as motivating. Results show that 42.5 percent of participants agreed, and a further 42.5 percent strongly agreed, that this activity was motivational, while only 13.9 percent and 1.1 percent disagreed and strongly disagreed, respectively.

Similarly, for the second variable (item 13. The way of presenting and working on the topic has motivated me to discover more about it;

| VAR00001 |       |            |            |                   |                         |  |  |  |
|----------|-------|------------|------------|-------------------|-------------------------|--|--|--|
|          |       | Frecuencia | Porcentaje | Porcentaje válido | Porcentaje<br>acumulado |  |  |  |
| Válido   | 1     | 3          | 1,1        | 1,1               | 1,1                     |  |  |  |
|          | 2     | 37         | 13,9       | 13,9              | 15,0                    |  |  |  |
|          | 3     | 113        | 42,5       | 42,5              | 57,5                    |  |  |  |
|          | 4     | 113        | 42,5       | 42,5              | 100,0                   |  |  |  |
|          | Total | 266        | 100.0      | 100.0             |                         |  |  |  |

#### TABLE 1 Item 9. The activity of analysing the photographic sequence has been motivating.

TABLE 2 Item 13. Working from photographs has improved my motivation to learn and work harder in class.

| VAR00002 |       |            |            |                   |                         |  |
|----------|-------|------------|------------|-------------------|-------------------------|--|
|          |       | Frecuencia | Porcentaje | Porcentaje válido | Porcentaje<br>acumulado |  |
| Válido   | 1     | 4          | 1,5        | 1,5               | 1,5                     |  |
|          | 2     | 28         | 10,5       | 10,5              | 12,0                    |  |
|          | 3     | 92         | 34,6       | 34,6              | 46,6                    |  |
|          | 4     | 142        | 53,4       | 53,4              | 100,0                   |  |
|          | Total | 266        | 100,0      | 100,0             |                         |  |

Table 2), in reference to the structure and planning of the teaching activity, the mean is also positive, at 3.40. In this case, the percentage of participants who strongly agree is even higher, reaching 53.4 percent of the sample, while 34.6 percent agree.

The mean of item 17 (I felt motivated because I could contribute my point of view or own knowledge; Table 3) is also positive at 3.30. Thus, 45.1 percent of participants agreed strongly and 41.7 percent agreed that it was motivational to contribute their point of view and make historical arguments throughout the exercise. These data are in line with studies in which historical thinking skills are applied together with the method of source-based investigation (Prats Cuevas, 2001; Cooper and Chapman, 2009).

Finally, the mean for item 19 (I felt motivated because I was able to take the lead in my own learning; Table 4) was 3.39, with 49.1 percent of participants strongly agreeing with this statement, 41.1 percent agreeing, and just 9.4 percent disagreeing. This result shows that, in general, student teachers feel motivated when they themselves investigate and build their own historical knowledge via sources and active learning methodologies (Gómez-Carrasco et al., 2018).

# 3.2 Motivation relating to teaching resources used in the activity (items 14, 18 and 20)

In terms of SO 2 of this study, concerning analysis of motivation relating to the materials—mainly photographs—used in the teaching activities, we also find positive results. Again, standard deviation was positive as none of the items exceeded the value of 1, which allows us to confirm the coherence of the participants' responses.

In relation to item 14 (Working with photographs has improved my motivation to learn and apply myself in class; Table 5) the mean was a positive result of 3.32 points, with almost half of the sample (48.5 percent) strongly agreeing that they felt motivated when using photography as a teaching resource in history lessons, and a further 36.5 percent agreeing.

Item 18 (I felt motivated because we used resources other than textbooks; Table 6) gained the best results of the study: a mean of 3.56, with 61.7 percent of participants strongly agreeing, and 32.3 percent agreeing, meaning only 6 percent disagreed.

Last, item 20 (I felt motivated to design my own activities based on photography when I become a teacher; Table 7) is pertinent as it reflects that the learning will be applied in the future when they start working as teachers. The mean value is 3.35, with 87.9 percent (47.7 percent strongly agreeing, and 40.2 percent agreeing) of student teachers feeling motivated by being able to design their own practical activities using photography as the main teaching resource, since it helps them to generate an active learning context, as we will try to exemplify in the following sections.

## 3.3 Motivation relating to the teaching objective (items 15, 16, 21 and 22)

The last block of results relates to SO 3, which analyses teachers' motivation in relation to the aim of carrying out teaching activities based on photography.

Here, standard deviation again shows a positive and coherent result, with all variables at <1.

Item 15 (My motivation has improved because I understand my social, political, and cultural context better; Table 8) shows good results and offers interesting potential. The mean value is 3.38, and 89.4 percent of participants agree (40.2 percent) or strongly agree (49.2 percent) with this statement. This shows that working with sources in the classroom helps students to think historically and develop cognitive associations between materials from the past and

#### TABLE 3 Item 17. I was motivated because I could contribute with my own point of view or knowledge.

| VAR00006 |       |            |            |                   |                         |  |
|----------|-------|------------|------------|-------------------|-------------------------|--|
|          |       | Frecuencia | Porcentaje | Porcentaje válido | Porcentaje<br>acumulado |  |
| Válido   | 1     | 6          | 2,3        | 2,3               | 2,3                     |  |
|          | 2     | 29         | 10,9       | 10,9              | 13,2                    |  |
|          | 3     | 111        | 41 m7      | 41,7              | 54,9                    |  |
|          | 4     | 120        | 45,1       | 45,1              | 100,0                   |  |
|          | Total | 266        | 100,0      | 100,0             |                         |  |

TABLE 4 Item 19. I have been motivated because I have been able to be the protagonist of my own learning.

| VAR00008 |       |            |            |                   |                         |  |
|----------|-------|------------|------------|-------------------|-------------------------|--|
|          |       | Frecuencia | Porcentaje | Porcentaje válido | Porcentaje<br>acumulado |  |
| Válido   | 1     | 1          | ,4         | ,4                | ,4                      |  |
|          | 2     | 24         | 9,0        | 9,0               | 9,4                     |  |
|          | 3     | 110        | 41,4       | 41,4              | 50,8                    |  |
|          | 4     | 131        | 49,2       | 49,2              | 100,0                   |  |
|          | Total | 266        | 100,0      | 100,0             |                         |  |

TABLE 5 Item 14. Working from photographs has improved my motivation to learn and work harder in class.

| VAR00003 |       |            |            |                   |                         |  |
|----------|-------|------------|------------|-------------------|-------------------------|--|
|          |       | Frecuencia | Porcentaje | Porcentaje válido | Porcentaje<br>acumulado |  |
| Válido   | 1     | 5          | 1,9        | 1,9               | 1,9                     |  |
|          | 2     | 35         | 13,2       | 13,2              | 15,0                    |  |
|          | 3     | 97         | 36,5       | 36,5              | 51,5                    |  |
|          | 4     | 129        | 48,5       | 48,5              | 100,0                   |  |
|          | Total | 266        | 100,0      | 100,0             |                         |  |

TABLE 6 Item 18. I have been motivated because we have used resources other than the textbook.

| VAR00007 |       |            |            |                   |                         |  |
|----------|-------|------------|------------|-------------------|-------------------------|--|
|          |       | Frecuencia | Porcentaje | Porcentaje válido | Porcentaje<br>acumulado |  |
| Válido   | 2     | 16         | 6,0        | 6,0               | 6,0                     |  |
|          | 3     | 86         | 32,3       | 32,3              | 38,3                    |  |
|          | 4     | 164        | 61,7       | 61,7              | 100,0                   |  |
|          | Total | 266        | 100,0      | 100,0             |                         |  |

events occurring in the present day (Moreno-Vera and Sánchez-Ibáñez, 2022).

Item 16 (The topic and the way of working on it through photography has improved my motivation to get better grades; Table 9) confirms a high level of motivation among participants to gain higher grades with a mean of 3.07 (though this is the lowest mean of the study), and 45.1 percent agreeing with this statement. It is striking that, compared to the other items, a relatively high proportion (22.5 percent) of student teachers disagreed with this statement, since

their motivation did not depend on the final grade received for the course.

In relation to item 21 (I felt motivated because I think the activity is useful for my professional future; Table 10) the mean value of responses is 3.50 out of 4, with 59.4 percent of students strongly agreeing with this statement. This result is in line with responses to item 20, where they indicated feeling motivated by learning how to design their own activities with a view to using photography as a classroom resource in the future.

#### TABLE 7 Item 20. It has motivated me to design my own activities based on photography when I become a teacher.

| VAR00009 |       |            |            |                   |                         |  |
|----------|-------|------------|------------|-------------------|-------------------------|--|
|          |       | Frecuencia | Porcentaje | Porcentaje válido | Porcentaje<br>acumulado |  |
| Válido   | 1     | 3          | 1,1        | 1,1               | 1,1                     |  |
|          | 2     | 29         | 10,9       | 10,9              | 12,0                    |  |
|          | 3     | 107        | 40,2       | 40,2              | 52,3                    |  |
|          | 4     | 127        | 47,7       | 47,7              | 100,0                   |  |
|          | Total | 266        | 100,0      | 100,0             |                         |  |

TABLE 8 Item 15. My motivation has improved because I have a better understanding of the social, political and cultural reality with which I am in contact.

| VAR00004 |       |            |            |                   |                         |  |
|----------|-------|------------|------------|-------------------|-------------------------|--|
|          |       | Frecuencia | Porcentaje | Porcentaje válido | Porcentaje<br>acumulado |  |
| Válido   | 1     | 2          | ,8         | ,8                | ,8                      |  |
|          | 2     | 26         | 9,8        | 9,8               | 10,5                    |  |
|          | 3     | 107        | 40,2       | 40,2              | 50,8                    |  |
|          | 4     | 131        | 49,2       | 49,2              | 100,0                   |  |
|          | Total | 266        | 100,0      | 100,0             |                         |  |

TABLE 9 Item 16. The subject and the way of working on it through photographs has improved my motivation to get better grades.

| VAR00005 |       |            |            |                   |                         |
|----------|-------|------------|------------|-------------------|-------------------------|
|          |       | Frecuencia | Porcentaje | Porcentaje válido | Porcentaje<br>acumulado |
| Válido   | 1     | 8          | 3,0        | 3,0               | 3,0                     |
|          | 2     | 52         | 19,5       | 19,5              | 22,6                    |
|          | 3     | 120        | 45,1       | 45,1              | 67,7                    |
|          | 4     | 86         | 32,3       | 32,3              | 100,0                   |
|          | Total | 266        | 100,0      | 100,0             |                         |

TABLE 10 Item 21. I have been motivated because I consider the activity useful for my professional future.

| VAR00010 |       |            |            |                   |                         |  |
|----------|-------|------------|------------|-------------------|-------------------------|--|
|          |       | Frecuencia | Porcentaje | Porcentaje válido | Porcentaje<br>acumulado |  |
| Válido   | 1     | 2          | ,8         | ,8                | ,8                      |  |
|          | 2     | 20         | 7,5        | 7,5               | 8,3                     |  |
|          | 3     | 86         | 32,3       | 32,3              | 40,6                    |  |
|          | 4     | 158        | 59,4       | 59,4              | 100,0                   |  |
|          | Total | 266        | 100,0      | 100,0             |                         |  |

Finally, item 22 (I felt motivated because I think the activity is useful for my current teacher training; Table 11) is also in line with the two previous responses. In this case, the mean value is very high at 3.55, with 94 percent of student teachers either agreeing (32.3 percent) or strongly agreeing (61.7 percent). Just 6 percent think that the activity will not be useful as part of the teaching training they are receiving.

# 3.4 Positive aspects of using photography to teach history

In relation to the open questions used in the instrument, the first focused on student teachers' opinions regarding the positive aspects of introducing photography in history teaching and learning (Positive

#### TABLE 11 Item 22. I have been motivated because I consider the activity useful for my personal development.

| VAR00011 |       |            |            |                   |                         |  |
|----------|-------|------------|------------|-------------------|-------------------------|--|
|          |       | Frecuencia | Porcentaje | Porcentaje válido | Porcentaje<br>acumulado |  |
| Válido   | 1     | 1          | ,4         | ,4                | ,4                      |  |
|          | 2     | 15         | 5,6        | 5,6               | 6,0                     |  |
|          | 3     | 86         | 32,3       | 32,3              | 38,3                    |  |
|          | 4     | 164        | 61,7       | 61,7              | 100,0                   |  |
|          | Total | 266        | 100,0      | 100,0             |                         |  |

TABLE 12 Positive aspects of using photography for teaching history.

| Aspectos positivos                                       | FA (Frecuencia absoluta) | Porcentaje |
|--|--------------------------|------------|
| Facilita la comprensión de conceptos históricos          | 132                      | 30.5       |
| Posibilidad de trabajar con fuentes históricas           | 60                       | 13.8       |
| Trabajar la empatía y la perspectiva histórica           | 57                       | 13.2       |
| Aproxima al alumnado a la historia                       | 47                       | 10.8       |
| Facilita la implementación de metodologías activas       | 41                       | 9.7        |
| Aumenta la motivación y el interés del alumnado          | 38                       | 8.8        |
| Permite el análisis y desarrollo del pensamiento crítico | 22                       | 5          |
| Permite superar los contenidos del libro de texto        | 13                       | 3          |
| Permite trabajar conceptos de cambio y continuidad       | 11                       | 2.5        |
| Facilita llevar a cabo un aprendizaje significativo      | 8                        | 1.8        |
| Permite trabajar conceptos de causa y consecuencia       | 4                        | 0.9        |
|  | 433                      | 100%       |

aspects of using photography to teach history; Table 12). A total of 433 responses were obtained (see Supplementary material). These were categorised according to 11 codes or variables relating to working on concepts associated with the development of historical thinking (change and continuity, causes and consequences), critical thinking, the possibility of developing active methodologies, and improving on established textbook-based content, among others.

Of the variables accounting for a higher number of responses, that relating to photography facilitating understanding of historical concepts stands out, representing a total of 30.5 percent of all coded responses. The response of student P.0156, for example, states that the use of photography "helps you to understand and remember events in a more precise and concrete way, because they are very visual images which you can remember easily, especially when you study them and look for the information you need to write about the photographs."

Then, 13.8 percent of the responses singled out the potential of photographs as a means of working with primary historical sources in the classroom, allowing teachers to tackle issues of empathy and historical perspective. For example, participant P.038 notes that "photography puts you in direct contact with historical sources, the student works in an active way, it is a way to boost their motivation, allow them to be researchers, and improve their critical thinking." Meanwhile, participant P.204 highlights that photography allows students to understand historical events through "empathy, being able to feel part of that moment, understand how things were, much more than just listening to a lesson." Of the responses obtained, 10.8 percent show, importantly, that images bring history closer to students; as participant P.049 notes, they "let you bring the boys and girls closer to the period and the event [...]."

Another of the study's codes relates to the main topic of this paper, it is closely linked to the study and to analysis of photographs as a resource for improving students' motivation. Nonetheless, this code represents only 8.8 percent of the responses obtained. A good example is the response of participant P.0231: "Using photographs in the classroom leads to increased motivation and interest among students, since the visual aspect of the images is more intriguing than any other resource. Also, this pedagogical tool is highly versatile thanks to its easy incorporation into all subjects on the curriculum." Similarly, P.075 notes that "photography is a good methodology to motivate and incentivise students, because the vast majority of schools work with textbooks, and so using a different kind of material could be positive for students."

# 3.5 Difficulties and limitations of using photography to teach history

The second of the qualitative items focused on responses relating to the difficulties and limitations of working with photographs in the classroom (Difficulties and limitations of using photography to teach

|    | Dificultades y limitaciones  | FA (Frecuencia absoluta) | Porcentaje |
|----|--|--------------------------|------------|
| 1  | Análisis e interpretación de la fotografía                                 | 77                       | 28.9       |
| 2  | Ninguno  | 43                       | 16.2       |
| 3  | Selección de imágenes en relación al contenido y al nivel del alumnado     | 33                       | 12.4       |
| 4  | Contextualización de la fotografía   | 24                       | 9          |
| 5  | La necesidad de complementar la información con otras fuentes y/o recursos | 20                       | 7.5        |
| 6  | La parcialidad de la información que proporciona                           | 13                       | 4.8        |
| 7  | Las diferentes interpretaciones  | 13                       | 4.8        |
| 8  | La calidad de la fotografía  | 11                       | 4.1        |
| 9  | La necesaria formación docente   | 11                       | 4.1        |
| 10 | La fotografía condiciona el pensamiento previo                             | 9                        | 3.8        |
| 11 | Imposibilidad de trabajar etapas previas a la contemporánea                | 7                        | 2.6        |
| 12 | El tiempo que requiere su trabajo en el aula                               | 5                        | 1.8        |
|    |  | 266                      | 100%       |

TABLE 13 Difficulties and limitations in using photography to teach history.

history; Table 13). There were 266 responses, which were classified using 12 codes. The code with the highest proportion of responses was related to the difficulty in adequately analysing and interpreting the images, accounting for 28.9 percent of responses. For example, participant P.060 wrote: "[...] it should be noted that the photographs must be accompanied by guidance and explanations from the teacher, since students may not know how to interpret them well," while P.094 suggested that students "may not know how to interpret and analyse the photograph and the elements it contains." However, 16.7 percent of respondents do not see any problems with using photographs to teach history.

Following these two codes, which have the highest percentage of responses, one of the main difficulties reported (with 12.4 percent of responses) was selecting images appropriate for the topics to be worked on and for the educational level of the students. Participant P.068, for example, highlights that "you have to know how to choose age-appropriate images." Another key aspect is the need to contextualise the photograph in order to work on it properly (9 percent of responses); as P.0145 notes, "the context of the images must be explained very well and from different perspectives." Then, 7.5 percent of participants noted the importance of supplementing the information provided by the images with other types of sources and resources. Participant P.0179 commented that "a historical source like a photograph may not be enough to study certain concepts or historical events, and it should be accompanied by other sources or types of documents."

The variables with lower numbers of responses relate to the diversity of interpretations that an image can generate, the quality of the images, the teacher training needed to be able to use this resource well, the possibility that an image could condition the students' thinking, the inability to study periods prior to the invention of photography, or the time needed to adequately use the methodology in the classroom.

#### 4 Discussion

Firstly, this research is exploratory in nature and we have chosen to develop a qualitative methodology from an interpretative approach, since this method is one of the main research strategies in educational contexts (Atkins and Wallace, 2012). It should also be noted that data are also quantified for a better understanding of them. We can say that this study has achieved its main objective of analysing the motivation of student teachers when using photography as evidence and a teaching resource in history lessons. Although the main hypothesis of the research has been tested, given that the photographic image can be a motivating resource for teaching history, the limitations of this type of research, since it is circumscribed to a single activity and, above all, to a small sample of students, in fact, this study is the first step in a broader investigation that should be related to active learning methodologies that make possible a critical teaching of history. At the same time, the present study is an approach to a complex subject and we consider that it requires further qualitative research, not only with the use of questionnaires, but also with other qualitative methodologies.

Anyhow, the tests carried out have shown that the research instrument had a high level of reliability, both internal and between items, and the results obtained in relation to the specific objectives have been generally very positive.

In relation to SO 1, concerning the motivation of student teachers in relation to the training programme, it is notable that all the items analysed had a positive mean greater than 3 out of 4. It is interesting to see that participants were motivated by two aspects in particular: on the one hand, being able to give their point of view as part of the learning process while researching via historical sources (Prats Cuevas, 2001; Cooper and Chapman, 2009; Seixas and Morton 2013), and on the other hand, being able to actively create their own knowledge, going beyond standard history lessons where the unidirectional, passive transmission of knowledge predominates (Gómez-Carrasco et al., 2018; Gómez et al., 2023).

SO 2 concerns the motivation of student teachers in relation to the kind of resources used in the classroom experience, mainly photography as a historical source. Here, the results were also positive, with the means of all items surpassing 3 out of 4. Item 18 (I felt motivated because we used resources other than textbooks; Table 6) stood out: students see working with teaching resources other than a textbook as especially motivating. This is important given that textbooks remain the most widely used resource among social science teachers (Bel-Martínez and Colomer-Rubio, 2018).

In terms of SO 3, which aimed to analyse the motivation of participants in relation to learning goals, it should be highlighted that, again, mean values are positive and surpass 3 out of 4, with items 15 and 21 standing out (My motivation has improved because I understand my social, political, and cultural context better; Table 8; I felt motivated because I think the activity is useful for my professional future; Table 10). The first shows that the use of photography has motivated participants by allowing them to apply historical knowledge acquired in daily life, and so to establish relationships between past and present, and to understand the different political, social, and cultural situations of each period (Moreno-Vera and Sánchez-Ibáñez, 2022). Furthermore, in general, participants reported feeling motivated by the training programme, seeing it as a positive and innovative resource that they will draw on when designing activities for their history classes.

In relation to the last objective, SO 4, which focuses on the benefits and limitations of using photography in the classroom for history teaching and learning, it has been demonstrated that motivation is one of the most positive aspects when using photographic heritage in history teaching, possibly because it allows a greater understanding of the phenomenon under study thanks to its visual language—a hypothesis in line with outcomes for other resources such as comics (Moreno-Vera et al., 2021). Thus, we argue that students will feel more motivated to learn history through images, as some of the accounts collected in this study suggest. Yet we believe that there is no single reason for this motivation; multiple factors contribute to it, such as using active methodologies, going beyond the rigid content offered by some textbooks, and prioritising understanding of historical thinking concepts such as the use of historical sources, empathy, and historical perspective. It is of note that the student participants did not find using photographs well in the classroom to be straightforward, therefore, we see the need for a trained body of teachers who are able to guide the students to analyse and interpret photographs, and who are also able to select materials well. In other words, visual literacy acquires great relevance for the training of future teachers, because, in order to understand a photographic image, in a teaching context, we need to recognise its main characteristics.

Finally, the results reflect motivation and a positive predisposition on the part of the student teachers towards using photography as a historical source and as a learning tool in the classroom. Using this methodology would allow their future students to understand history through evidence (Seixas and Morton, 2013) and by investigating and working in groups (Prats Cuevas, 2001), while also identifying complex relationships through which they may understand the multiple connections that exist between past and present events.

#### Data availability statement

The raw data supporting the conclusions of this article will be made available by the authors, without undue reservation.

#### **Ethics statement**

The studies involving human participants were reviewed and approved by Comité de Ética de la Universidad de Alicante. The patients/participants provided written informed consent to participate in this study.

#### Author contributions

SP-LA: Data curation, Investigation, Methodology, Writing – original draft. RB-M: Conceptualization, Investigation, Methodology, Writing – original draft. JM-V: Formal analysis, Methodology, Software, Writing – review & editing.

#### Funding

The author(s) declare financial support was received for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article. This research is part of the project "Heritage as an educational resource for identity construction and citizen training in the Primary Education stage. Didactic applications for the training of future teachers (CIGE/2021/178)" funded by the *Conselleria* of Innovation, Universities, Science and Digital Society of the *Generalitat Valenciana* (Spain) under the Program for the promotion of scientific research, technological development and innovation in the Valencian Community. Grants for emerging research groups (GE 2022). At the same time, this publication is part of the I+D+i, Patrimonios controversiales para la formación ecosocial de la ciudadanía. Una investigación de educación patrimonial en la enseñanza reglada (EPITEC2), reference PID2020-116662GB-100, funded by MCIN/AEI/10.13039/501100011033.

#### Acknowledgments

The researchers would like to express their gratitude for the help and collaboration offered in the application of this study by our colleagues from the research group IGE (Igualdad, Género y Educación de la Universidad de Alicante) directed by Rocío Díez Ros. We would also like to thank the department of Didactics of the Social Sciences of the University of Alicante and, in particular, the colleagues who participate in the innovation network in the Didactics of the Social Sciences, in which this educational experiment has been carried out.

#### **Conflict of interest**

The authors declare that the research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest.

#### Publisher's note

All claims expressed in this article are solely those of the authors and do not necessarily represent those of their affiliated organizations, or those of the publisher, the editors and the reviewers. Any product that may be evaluated in this article, or claim that may be made by its manufacturer, is not guaranteed or endorsed by the publisher.

#### Supplementary material

The Supplementary material for this article can be found online at: https://www.frontiersin.org/articles/10.3389/feduc.2023.1270851/ full#supplementary-material

#### References

Arqué i Bertran, M. (2002). "Las fuentes documentales fotográficas en la Didáctica de las Ciencias Sociales" in *Primeras Jornadas Imagen, Cultura y Tecnología*. eds. P. Amador, J. Robledano and M. Ruíz (Madrid: Editorial Archiviana), 275–283.

Atkins, L. Y., and Wallace, S. (2012). *Qualitative research in education*. UK: SAGE Publishing

Batchen, G. (2004). Arder en deseos. La concepción de la fotografía Barcelona: Gustavo Gili.

Bel, J. C. (2017). Imagen y libros de texto de Historia en Educación Primaria: estudio comparativo a partir de un análisis cualitativo. *Rev. Educ.* 377, 82–112. doi: 10.4438/1988-592X-RE-2017-377-354

Bel-Martínez, J. C., and Colomer-Rubio, J. C. (2018). Teoría y metodología de investigación sobre libros de texto: análisis didáctico de las actividades, las imágenes y los recursos digitales en la enseñanza de las Ciencias Sociales. *Revista Brasileira de Educaçao.* 23, 1–23. doi: 10.1590/S1413-24782018230082

Benjamin, W. (2013). La obra de arte en la época de su reproducción mecánica Madrid: Casimiro Libros.

Burke, P. (2001). *Eyewitnessing. The uses of images as historical evidence*. Cornell University Press Reaktion Books.

Campany, D. (2004). "Los lugares de Victor Burgin (o los placeres de Vértigo a 9.000 metros)" in *Ensayos*. ed. V. Burgin (Barcelona: Gustavo Gili), 7–17.

Chicote, F. G. (2020). Aprender investigando: la imagen de las mujeres republicanas en la prensa gráfica durante la guerra civil española (1936-1939). In E. Higueras, A. Villaverde and S. Chaves (Coord.), *El pasado que no pasa: la Guerra Civil Española a los ochenta años de su finalización*. Ediciones de la Universidad de Castilla-La Mancha. Cuenca: (pp 353-374)

Cooper, H., and Chapman, A. (2009). *Constructing history 11–19.* UK: SAGE Publishing.

Cotán Fernández, A., Ruiz-Bejarano, A., and Álvarez Diaz, K. (2022). Innovando en educación: la foto-elicitación como estrategia de aprendizaje en las instituciones de Educación Superior. *Márgenes, Revista de Educación de la Universidad de Málaga* 3, 137–153. doi: 10.24310/mgnmar.v3i2.14104

De la Nuez, I. (2010). Blow up, blow up. Periférica.

De Las Heras, B. (2015). Testimoniando con imágenes. La fotografía en el estudio de la historia. *Fotocinema* 10, 27–55. doi: 10.24310/Fotocinema.2015.v0i10.5978

Didi-Huberman, G. (2020). "Cuando las imágenes tocan lo real" in *Cuando las imágenes tocan lo real.* eds. G. Didi-Huberman, C. Chéroux and J. Arnaldo (Madrid: Círculos de Bellas Artes), 23–52.

Fontcuberta, J. (2016). La furia de las imágenes: Notas sobre la postfotografía Barcelona: Galaxia Gutenberg.

Freund, G. (1974). La fotografía como documento social Barcelona: Gustavo Gili.

García, M. (2016). La fotografía como fuente histórica. Iber: Didáctica de las ciencias sociales, geografía e historia. 84, 47–52.

García-Vera, A. (2019). La fotografía en la formación del profesorado Barcelona: Narcea.

Gestsdóttir, S. M., Van Boxtel, C., and Van Drie, J. (2018). Teaching historical thinking and reasoning: construction of an observation instrument. *Br. Educ. Res. J.* 44, 960–981. doi: 10.1002/berj.3471

Gómez, C. J., Hinojo-Lucena, F. J., Moreno-Vera, J. R., and Alonso-Garcia, S. (2023). Analysis of a forced blended-learning program in social sciences higher education during the COVID-19 post-pandemic. *Educ. Train.* 65, 298–311. doi: 10.1108/ET-06-2022-0246

Gómez, C. J., and López, A. M. (2014). Las imágenes de los libros de texto y su función en la enseñanza de la Historia. Diseño de un instrumento de análisis. *Enseñanza de las Ciencias Sociales* 13, 17–29 doi: 10.1344/ECCSS2014.13.2.

Gómez, C. J., and Miralles, P. (2015). ¿Pensar históricamente o memorizar el pasado? La evaluación de los contenidos históricos en la educación obligatoria en España. *Revista de Estudios Sociales* 52, 52–68. doi: 10.7440/res52.2015.04

Gómez-Carrasco, C. J., Monteagudo, J., Moreno-Vera, J. R., and Sáinz, M. (2019). Effects of a gamification and flipped-classroom program for teacher in training on motivation and learning perception. *Educ. Sci.* 9:299. doi: 10.3390/educsci9040299

Gómez-Carrasco, C. J., Monteagudo, J., Moreno-Vera, J. R., and Sáinz, M. (2020). Evaluation of a gamification and flipped-classroom program used in teacher training: perception of learning and outcome. *PLoS One* 15:e0241892. doi: 10.1371/journal. pone.0241892

Gómez-Carrasco, C. J., Ortuño-Molina, J., and Miralles-Martínez, P. (2018). Enseñar Ciencias Sociales con métodos activos de aprendizaje. Reflexiones y propuestas a través de la indagación Barcelona: Octaedro. Gudín, E., and Chávarri, S. (2019). Fotografía en el aula para el desarrollo del pensamiento histórico. *Didáctica de las ciencias experimentales y sociales* 37, 19–36. doi: 10.7203/dces.37.13316

Huber, G. L. (2013). AQUAD7-analysis of qualitative data Tübingen: University of Tübingen.

Iglesias, M. (2009). Fotografías antiguas e historia local: una experiencia de investigación histórica con alumnado de secundaria. *Iber: Didáctica de las ciencias sociales, geografía e historia* 60, 115–123.

Kossoy, B. (2014). Lo efímero y lo perpetuo en la imagen fotográfica Madrid: Cátedra.

López Facal, R., Miralles Martínez, P., Prats, J., and Gómez Carrasco, C. J. (2017). Educación histórica y desarrollo de competencias. R. López, P. Miralles and J. Prats (Dirs.) C. J. Gómez (Coord.). *Enseñanza de la historia y competencias educativas* Barcelona. Graó (pp.7-22).

Moreno-Vera, J. R., and Martínez-Leguízamo, J. (2022). Welcome refugees! The use of cultural heritage to teach democratic values. *Sustain. For.* 14:13466. doi: 10.3390/ su142013466

Moreno-Vera, J. R., Ponsoda-López de Atalaya, S., and Blanes-Mora, R. (2021). By Toutatis! Trainee teachers' motivation when using comics to learn history. *Front. Psychol.* 12:778792. doi: 10.3389/fpsyg.2021.778792

Moreno-Vera, J. R., Ponsoda-López de Atalaya, S., López-Fernández, J. A., and Blanes-Mora, R. (2020). Holistic or traditional conceptions of heritage among earlychildhood and primary trainee teachers. *Sustain. For.* 12:8921. doi: 10.3390/ sul2218921

Moreno-Vera, J. R., and Sánchez-Ibáñez, R. (2022). "Historical thinking skills and cognitive levels in Spanish high school history textbooks" in *Cases on historical thinking and gamification in social studies and humanities education*. eds. M. Martínez-Hita, C. J. Gómez and P. Miralles (US: IGI-Global)

Muñoz, J. (2019). Fotografía, memoria e identidad. Revista de comunicación de la SEECI 49, 123–140. doi: 10.15198/seeci.2019.49.123-140

Oviedo, H. C., and Campo-Arias, A. (2005). An approach to the use of cronbach's alfa. *Rev. Colomb. Psiquiatr* 34, 572–580.

Pagès, J. (2021). La formación del profesorado de Historia y Ciencias Sociales. *Nuevas Dimensiones* 8, 57–67. doi: 10.53689/nv.vi8.42

Pantoja, A. (2010). La fotografía Como recurso Para la didáctica de la Historia/the photography as a resource for teaching history. *Tejuelo* 9, 179–194.

Ponsoda López de Atalaya, S., and Blanes Mora, R. (2020). La fotografía como fuente histórica en el aula. Análisis de una metodología para la enseñanza de la Historia en la Educación Superior. *Didáctica de las ciencias experimentales y sociales* 39, 17–30. doi: 10.7203/dces.39.16078

Prats Cuevas, J. (2001). Enseñar historia: notas para una didáctica renovadora. Extremadura: Junta de Extremadura.

Riego, B. (2019). Las imágenes como fenómeno cultural: una necesaria mirada en etapas para abordar los retos actuales. *Historia y Memoria de la Educación* 10, 17–49. doi: 10.5944/hme.10.2019.22348

Rodríguez De Las Heras, A. (2010). L'ús pedagògic de la fotografía histórica/ pedagogical use of historical photography. *Educació i Història: Revista d'Història de l'Educació* 15, 41-54.

Sáiz, J. (2013). Alfabetización histórica y competencias básicas en libros de texto de historia y en aprendizajes de estudiantes. *Didáctica de las ciencias experimentales y sociales* 27, 43–66.

Sánchez Moreno, J. (2011). La fotografía, el espejo con memoria. *Con-ciencia social: anuario de didáctica de la geografía, la historia y las ciencias sociales* 15, 37–46.

Santisteban, A., González-Monfort, N., and Pagés, J. (2010). Una investigación sobre la formación del pensamiento histórico. In R. Ávila, P. Rivero and P. Domínguez, (Coord.) *Metodología en investigación en didáctica de las ciencias sociales*. Zaragoza: Institución Fernando el Católico-Asociación Universitaria de Profesorado de Didáctica de las Ciencias Sociales.

Satorra, A., and Bentler, P. M. (2010). Ensuring positiveness of the scaled difference chi-square test statistic. *Psychometrika* 75, 243–248. doi: 10.1007/s11336-009-9135-y

Seixas, P., and Morton, T. (2013). *The Big Six Historical Thinking Concepts*. Toronto: Nelson College Indigenous.

Sharpe, D. (2015). Chi-square test is statistically significant: now what? *Pract. Assess. Res. Eval.* 20, 1–10. doi: 10.7275/tbfa-x148

Sontag, S. (2008). Sobre la fotografía. Barcelona: Penguin Random House Grupo Editorial.